THE PSYCHODYNAMICS IN THE FEMININE-EQUINE RELATIONSHIP DYAD

A dissertation presented to
the Faculty of Saybrook University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) in Psychology

by

Mary F. Flora

Oakland, California
November, 2017

Approval of Dissertation

THE PSYCHODYNAMICS IN THE FEMININE-EQUINE RELATIONSHIP DYAD

This dissertation by Mary F. Flora has been approved by the committee members below, who recommend it be accepted by the faculty of Saybrook University in partial fulfillment of requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Psychology

Dissertation Committee:

JoAnn McAllister, Ph.D., Chair Date: November 7, 2017

Carolyn Bates, Ph.D. Date: November 7, 2017

Susan Rowland, Ph.D. Date: November 7, 2017

Abstract

THE PSYCHODYNAMICS IN THE FEMININE-EQUINE RELATIONSHIP DYAD

Mary F. Flora

Saybrook University

Scholarly research is needed to investigate the horse human interaction and increase protective measures and beneficial outcomes for both horse and human when using an interspecies form of psychotherapy. This research offers practitioners of equine assisted activities and therapies (EAAT) a different theoretical orientation to approach an understanding of the psychodynamics present in this form of therapy, and support contemporary therapeutic treatment models that focus on building emotional resilience grounded in the neurobiology of nurturing relationships.

The purpose of this study was to identify what psychodynamic experiences were present in the feminine-equine relationship dyad, and how these experiences influenced the process of individuation. Prior research (Seward, 2013; Held, 2006; Koch,2008) has investigated this relationship phenomenon to bring validity to a powerful experience that is often described as intangible, or immeasurable. The researcher, through personal experience and professional training since 1999, has observed the evolving industry of equine assisted activities and therapies as largely populated by women seeking answers, women dedicated to the helping professions, and women longing for an experience that is nurturing and enlarging in a way that Western culture fails to meet that need for women.

Analytical psychology, according to Carl Jung, provided a theoretical structure to explore the horse as a symbol of the archetype and the psychodynamics present in the feminine-equine relationship dyad. The researcher examined how this interspecies relationship phenomenon facilitates psychodynamic experiences that contribute to personality development for women who have chosen horses as companions. Recent developments in neuroscience helped to reimagine Jung's psychodynamic theory for contemporary relevance. The researcher asked what experiences present in the feminine-equine relationship dyad have the capacity to influence the *individuation* process for women.

A hermeneutic phenomenological research method and narrative research techniques guided this qualitative research study. Hermeneutics guided the review of literature and provided an iterative process to reveal significant parts of the experience-centered narratives within the whole of the phenomenon in question. Five women shared their personal and professional stories of companionship with horses. The research findings revealed the neurobiology of novel experiences and attuned relationships contributes to transformative experiences and an improved sense of well-being. Phenomenology provided an intuitive approach to understanding the interspecies relationship phenomenon investigated. The research participants' narratives confirmed companionship with horses influences personal growth, strengthens emotional resilience, influences professional and social development, and provides a sense of community. These findings suggest a woman's relationship with a horse encourages individuation.

Acknowledgments

The dissertation committee members, JoAnn McAllister, Ph.D., (Chair), Susan Rowland, Ph.D., and Carolyn Bates, Ph.D., have provided patient support and encouragement and directed me toward resources that inspired ideas. I feel privileged and grateful to have received their feedback and generosity which deepened this learning experience. I am indebted to the wonderful community of women I have met over the last two decades, their mentorship, shared trail rides, landscapes, and commitment to the care and keeping of horses.

I would like to extend thanks and appreciation to my family and friends that have anchored me during this monumental undertaking and tolerated with compassion my neglect of those relationships closest to me. A special thanks to Boogie, my equine partner of fourteen years who I lost during this journey. He was a wonderful teacher and a soulful companion. His presence will be with me always.

Table of Contents

LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Purpose

As researcher, horse professional, and licensed mental health practitioner of Equine Assisted Activities and Therapies (EAAT), I am committed to contributing to the body of existing research in a manner that advances the practice and understanding of this treatment modality. This study contributes a new theoretical orientation in support of existing EAAT models that focus on the psychosocial, emotional, sensory, and somatic experiences present in the human-equine relationship dynamic, honors the horse as a sentient being, and practices the fair and responsible treatment of all animals. This research informs educators, helping professionals, and those interested in learning more about the potential benefits of EAAT.

Background

The study of the horse as a symbol of the archetype and guide to women in the process of individuation contributes to developing and understanding a more experiential form of psychotherapy that brings horses and humans together for therapeutic benefit. Therapeutic benefit is used to describe a state of well-being experienced as an expansion in an individual's conscious awareness. Equine assisted psychotherapy (EAP), also referred to as equine facilitated psychotherapy (EFP), is an experiential form of therapy conducted by a licensed mental health professional in partnership with a horse and an experienced professional knowledgeable about horses. The horse human interaction can help to facilitate an opportunity for the client to explore latent or active psychosocial, emotional, and somatic experiences that may be brought into focus through the relationship dynamic and connection with the horse.

The industry of therapeutic programming involving equines in service delivery has grown enormously in popularity, experience, and research since the early 1960s with psychotherapy

emerging in the 1990s. It is an industry that has evolved during an era when multiple viewpoints and a pluralistic framework for counseling techniques and psychotherapy are being integrated using a range of theoretical orientations. A pluralist practice invites the client to contribute to the knowledge of how limitations can be overcome in the process of individual healing. Postmodernism posits that truth, or one's reality, is dependent on the beliefs, emotions, and assumptions that originate from the individual who assigns subjective meaning and interpretation to his or her experience (Young-Eisendrath, 1997). In postmodernism, there is no one fixed body of knowledge in areas such as society, culture, psychology, and philosophy. Rowland (2002) wrote, "Postmodernism is characterized by the waning of the power of 'grand narratives'" (p. 128). The individual experience determines what may be beneficial outside the designated parameters that science dictates and other institutions promulgate as grand narratives.

Carl Jung's ideas wandered outside the borders of scientific theory and into the shifting boundaries of metaphor and hermeneutic implication. It is here that Jung made some of his most influential contributions to psychology. Contributions that are garnering further investigation through recent developments in neuroscience and neurobiology that encourage a contemporary view and understanding of Jung's psychodynamic theory.

Cultural dynamics, within the age of postmodernism, do not excuse or remedy the need for empirical research and evidenced based therapeutic practices. Postmodernism opened the door to ideas that challenged fixed boundaries of knowing and blazed a trail for new unconventional methods of therapeutic practice. Although unconventional methods of therapy can be very beneficial, they are not as accessible to many who could benefit. Those individuals who must work within the defined structure of billable and reimbursable healthcare systems to afford care often miss the opportunity for alternative forms of therapy that are beneficial to the

individual. Restricted access to care is slowly changing as empirical and evidence based research supporting alternative forms of therapy such as mindfulness and yoga practices are being accepted as legitimate forms of healthcare (Siegel, 2007).

Rationale

EFP began to emerge in the early to mid-nineties as an experiential and supplemental treatment modality to compliment more traditional and accepted forms of psychotherapy. Equine-facilitated psychotherapy, as a unique form of specialized therapy, needs further and continued research into the phenomenon of how horses can be instrumental in the psychological development of the individual.

Scholarly research is needed to increase protective measures and beneficial outcomes in the mental health industry when using an interspecies form of psychotherapy. This research offers practitioners of EAAT a different theoretical orientation and understanding of the psychodynamics present in this form of activity and therapy and supports contemporary therapeutic treatment models that focus on building emotional resilience grounded in the neurobiology of nurturing relationships.

I considered multiple psychological viewpoints, practice methods, and personal experience narratives during the research process to adequately represent an intrapsychic and interspecies dynamic based on phenomenology and an intuitive interpretation of knowing. The psychodynamics present within the relationship between women and horses was the focus of the research and examined experiences revealed in the literature reviewed and individual experience-centered narratives offered by the research participants. A study that examined how individuals learn to identify and engage in healthy relationships contributed a new understanding of how to build resilience or tolerance when facing stressful and adverse conditions in their lives. The

research illustrates how the organic nature of the archetype and the psychodynamic theory, common to Jungian psychology, commissions a potential enlargement of consciousness to further the individual psychic agenda toward a new attitude.

Through personal experience and professional training since 1999, I have observed the evolving industry of EAAT as largely populated by women seeking answers, women dedicated to the helping profession, and women longing for an experience that is nurturing and enlarging in a way that Western culture fails to meet that need for women. New insights into the relationship dynamic between women and horses were gained through this research which can enhance relational, trauma and attachment informed treatment approaches and equine assisted activities and therapies. Jungian psychology encourages the application of a pluralistic psychotherapy practice and provides practitioners of EAAT a theoretical orientation into the psychodynamics present in the feminine-equine relationship dyad.

Research Question

The purpose of this study was to identify what psychodynamic experiences were present in the feminine-equine relationship dyad, how and whether these psychodynamic experiences influenced the process of individuation whereby a women's conscious awareness was brought into relationship with the archetypal dimension of the unconscious. Individuation, for the purposes of this study, as defined by Carl Jung (1953/1977) "means becoming an 'in-dividual,' and, in so far as 'individuality' embraces our innermost, last, and incomparable uniqueness, it also implies becoming one's own self" (para. 266). It is a process of psychological development into a unique being of one's accord within a collective of others as a culture or set of social norms. Individuation brings into relationship the ego consciousness with the unconscious source of being in a goal directed quest (Rowland, 2012).

The primary research questions presented to the study participants were open ended in nature: 1. In what way have your experiences with horses been influential in your life? 2. How would you describe what you notice about yourself or your horse when you spend time together? 3. What would your life be like without horses as companions? 4. What do you notice happening on the inside when you are in the company of horses?

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

A History of Equine Assisted Activities and Therapies (EAAT), EFP, EFMHA, NARHA, and PATH International, an Integrated Past

Equine-facilitated psychotherapy (EFP) is an experiential form of therapy conducted by a mental health professional and a horse professional in partnership with an equine. The human professionals together with the equine partner jointly facilitate a psychotherapy session. The client is presented with an opportunity to gain awareness about choices and behaviors that may be inhibiting psychosocial and emotional growth and creating barriers to healthy functioning in relationships. EFP is a term originating from the Equine Facilitated Mental Health Association (EFMHA) established in 1996 through the support of the Delta Society and the American Hippotherapy Association. EFMHA helped to develop operating standards for equine-facilitated psychotherapy as a special interest section of North American Riding for the Handicapped Association, Inc. (NARHA; Vidrine, 2001). EFMHA, evolved out of a need for more emphasis on mental health in the practice of therapeutic horsemanship programming, and establishing industry best practices and standards (Faulkner & Vidrine, 2001).

NARHA, established in 1969, formally changed their name in 2011 to the Professional Association of Therapeutic Horsemanship International (PATH Intl). Their vision statement is "a global authority, resource and advocate for equine-assisted therapies and activities and the equines in this work that inspire and enrich the human spirit" (PATH Intl., 2017b, About page). The mission of PATH Intl. (2017b, About page) "promotes safety and optimal outcomes in equine-assisted activities and therapies for individuals with special needs." PATH Intl. is an individual and center membership, credentialing, and professional certifying organization. PATH Intl. (2017a) currently reports 4800 certified therapeutic riding instructors and equine specialist

mental health and learning, 881 member centers around the world with 8,000 individual members serving and supporting 66,000 children and adults. There are 6,200 veterans and active-duty military personnel currently being served (Home page). PATH Intl. established a branch dedicated to military personnel and war veterans called Equine Services for Heroes (PATH Intl., 2017b, About page). PATH Intl. (2017a) has trained over 62,000 volunteers to support the equine partners and beneficiaries of EAAT.

PATH Intl. established the equine specialist mental health and learning (ESMHL) certification process in 2012 (PATH, Intl., 2017b, About page). This certification focuses on teaching horse professionals equine behavior and management skills, how to work in collaboration with a mental health professional or educator in the development of curricula, treatment plans, and equine interaction. The role of an ESMHL was established to assist the mental health therapist conducting the EFP session who may have limited knowledge of horses and how to read their behavior.

The presence of the equine specialist and the mental health professional together in an EFP session creates a dual competency model as the preferred method of service delivery. This allows the mental health professional to focus on the client while the equine specialist focuses on the horse. The attention of the two-person professional team in the EFP session may become divided between observing the horse and observing the client. There is reassurance in the dual competency model within EFP that another professional is present and noticing horse and human behaviors with a specific focus and responsibility on either the horse or the client. There are four participants present in this therapeutic alliance with the addition of the client, and the horse as co-facilitator.

The focus of EFP is the interaction between horse and client within the context of the relationship. This provides an opportunity for the mental health professional and the equine specialist to gain insight about how clients may approach relationships in general, problem solve, and self-manage their social, emotional, somatic, and behavioral experience. Molly DePrekel, psychologist, and former president of EFMHA, builds a framework within the equine facilitated psychotherapy session "that involves competency-based interventions, mindfulness, cognitive reframes, somatic approaches, play, and attachment work" which she stated, "can provide a healing milieu for clients experiencing trauma" (DePrekel, n.d. p. 1).

DePrekel (n.d., p.1), emphasized the importance of client affect regulation practice as a way of understanding how the client's affect impacts the arousal state and behavior of the horse. "This dynamic form of relational affect regulation teaches clients, in an interactive context, that affect can be modulated" (p. 3). This also teaches the client the benefits of co-regulation by regulating affect in the company of another until the client is ready to learn the skill of self-regulation. Co-regulation of emotional affect opportunities in EFP can be achieved when the client learns to co-regulate emotions through their relationship with the horse. This can be achieved in multiple ways with grooming or walking the horse, mounted or unmounted activities, and riding as a few examples. Research suggests that important stress regulating neurological systems are important to organizing the brainstem when the flight, fight, or freeze response has been activated (Miller-Karas, 2015). Rhythmic, repetitive motion and patterned routines can calm states of arousal and assist in affect regulation (Perry & Szalavitz, 2006).

DePrekel (2003) cautioned against the misconceptions still present in the field of equine-facilitated psychotherapy. It is important to understand that therapy in the company of horses is intended as a supplemental form of mental health treatment and not a stand-alone form of

psychotherapy. EFP is not suited for all clients or horses and may be contraindicated for some. Another concern is the belief or naiveté that an individual can achieve a state or national licensed credential and use a professional designation as an equine mental health professional or equine therapist. This is a common misconception in the field. There are many programs for the attainment of a certification credential but not a professional licensure. These certification programs vary in expectations, duration, prior level of education, and prior horse or professional mental health experience.

The practice of EFP indicates a preference for a mental health therapist to have dual competency as a knowledgeable horse professional and a current state board license as a mental health counselor, social worker, marriage and family counselor, psychiatric nurse, or psychologist (DePrekel, 2003). To date, the expectation in the industry has shifted to a dual professional model with specific certification programs in place for the equine professional knowledgeable about horses and the licensed clinical professional. Dual competency by a licensed clinical professional is a valuable skill when the clinician is also knowledgeable and experienced as an equine professional. The dual competency model can increase awareness of the interspecies dynamic that becomes apparent in a client session. One professional instead of two, if the clinical professional is also a horse professional, can also provide more privacy when clients are sensitive to a horse professional, in addition to the therapist, also being present in a therapeutic session.

Training expectations for a certification in the practice of equine assisted or facilitated psychotherapy have increased in the last decade and continue to increase. Initially, a two-day weekend training model that some certifying organizations endorsed in the late nineties required no prior knowledge of horses by the clinical professional and limited care and attention was

given to the well-being of the horse. Two decades later, a much higher standard of experience, professionalism, and education is required in some of the models of equine assisted or facilitated mental health and learning activities and therapies.

Professionalism on the part of the practicing clinician, their training, supervision, and the ethical treatment of clients and equine partners to do no harm, is just as much a consideration when conducting psychotherapy with horses and other animals present as a more traditional form of psychotherapy practice. The difference is the acceptance of and credibility already established in more traditional and evidenced based forms of therapy that benefit from state board governance and licensure, and recognition by the healthcare industry.

Safety for the client and the fair and humane treatment of an equine partner is critical when conducting equine-facilitated therapies. Horses become active participants in therapeutic sessions as they read and respond to the client's internal and external emotional states, voice, and movement. Horses appear to attune to the client's emotional state and sense if the external emotional presentation is congruent with what the horse perceives to be the internal emotional state of the individual. If a mismatch between inner and outer emotional affect states is detected by the horse, the horse will reveal through body language and behavior a response to the internal state of the client (DePrekel, 2003). The therapist relies on the horse for a biofeedback loop to help the therapist and client process their thoughts, feelings, choices, and sensory experiences. The survival of the horse as a species depended on their ability to read their environment and assess for non-ordinary conditions.

The ability of the horse to assess for discrepancies in the environment is possible through a highly evolved limbic system located in the mid region of the brain that sounds an alarm, through the amygdala, and prompts a physical response when a change in the environment is

detected. The connection between client and horse originates deep within the limbic system of the mammalian brain (Shambo, 2012). A horse registers a discrepancy when a client's external presentation is out of alignment with their internal state. The horse may proceed with caution if trust is not perceived in the environment. This perceived distrust may present as the horse's reluctance to engage with the client which then gives the horse professional and clinician a visible horse behavior to process and problem solve with the client. A partnership between the brain based limbic system and the body based autonomic nervous system, found in humans and other mammals, is key to discovering the relationship potential between horse and human as two social beings.

In this inquiry, analytical psychology, and specifically Jung's psychodynamic theory, will be explored as a compatible psychology in partnership with equine-facilitated psychotherapy. Jung (1938/1984) wrote, "The sympathetic nervous system is an exceedingly emotional centre, and it rules to a great extent the emotional part of our psychology, not the mental part" (Jung, p. 335). Jung's focus on incongruent or incompatible emotional states as the impetus for advancing the innate psychological agenda of the individual, is well suited theoretically to investigate what happens between horse and client in the interspecies dynamic. It is the horse's innate ability to detect and respond to nuances that are present and incompatible in their surroundings that provide meaning for the client if they are willing to explore their relationship with a horse. The use of psyche and psychic refer to conscious and unconscious dynamics that are activated in an individual's relationship to their environment and others present therein.

The Practice of Equine-Facilitated Psychotherapy

EFP is a hands-on form of treatment based on the psychodynamics of relationship between horse and human (DePrekel, 2003). The role of the horse in the practice of equine-

facilitated psychotherapy is as an active partner and co-facilitator with the mental health professional in the therapeutic process. The mental health professional together with the client design a treatment plan identifying mental health goals and objectives. The human facilitators' role is to design a session that is ethical and responsible, minimizing exposure to risk for all present in the session including the horse. Interventions that work on the resolution of treatment goals and objectives are implemented as part of a treatment plan. Although the horse may know innately how to establish safety within the context of a relationship, the equine professional is there proactively in the care of the horse. EFP practices may include activities such as, but not limited to, grooming, play, arena, and trail riding, driving, and vaulting.

Environmental factors, like the setting where the EFP session will take place, may limit a horse's natural ability to respond to a perceived threat in the environment. A client's emotional or behavioral response may cause undue stress on the horse as the client learns the technique of affect regulation. The role of the equine professional is valuable in identifying stressors or environmental factors that may impact the horse before and during the session to anticipate and plan for potential reactions and responses from the horse or human participants and recommend alternative strategies. Horses and clients need to be evaluated prior to an EFP session by the equine professional and mental health professional to make sure the horse and client's state of arousal, attitude, and physical well-being will be conducive to the goals of the session, and an appropriate choice in the interest of all four participants in the EFP session.

Equine Facilitated Mental Health Association

Trish Broersma (2009) a past president of EFMHA, made the following comments about the role of the horse in an EFP session. Broersma used the terms *active team member* and *co-facilitator* to describe the role of the horse, calling it a "paradigm shift" away from "using the

horse as a tool" (See http://horsesensebusiness.com/efmha) in the psychotherapy session. When asked about the philosophical or theoretical differences of EFMHA and EFP from other models of psychotherapy that include horses, and organizations in the field, Broersma responded by stating that it was the intention of EFMHA to give the horse a more significant role in EFP sessions:

> The idea was that the horse is one of the facilitators in the work we do. It elevates the role of the horse. It [the horse] is given more prominence and helps people remember that we are trying to move away from using the horse as a tool in those kinds of situations. They [horses] have a much greater opportunity in partnering with humans to offer all kinds of benefits. (See http://horsesensebusiness.com/efmha)

Broersma added that this philosophy, about the role of the horse, has never wavered in the history of EFMHA which she felt was maintaining attention to the "fundamentals of the natural world" and "people [who] are more connected to earth in general articulating better the relationship in EFP."

> Their [horses] sentient nature is honored for offering wisdom and insights into the dynamics of an interaction or situation. Their particular gift as a prey animal is their sensitivity to subtle energies operating in any situation enlisted for teaching that same kind of sensitivity to clients and encouraging an awareness of the client's own sensitivity as well as a deeper awareness of those around them. (See http://horsesensebusiness.com/efmha)

Broersma reflected on the creative freedom allowed within an EFMHA session to orient to underlying issues of the client as opposed to prescribing activities that may be more focused on the task than the relationship.

NARHA and EFMHA were both established as membership organizations and have been leaders in the industry dedicated to field tested standards of professionalism, safety, and the well-being of the client and horse for all those who practice and or participate in the field. The large membership that NARHA/PATH Intl. has acquired since 1969 has also allowed them to lead the industry in establishing precautions and contraindications for the practice of therapeutic

horsemanship and equine-facilitated psychotherapy, a code of ethics, psycho/social guidelines, as well as networking, training, and certification opportunities and careers for their members.

The purpose of EFMHA was "to advance the field of equine-facilitated mental health and learning through support, education, and training of professionals who work with equines and humans so that they implement mutually beneficial standards of safe, ethical, effective practices" (Equine Facilitated Mental Health Association [EFMHA], 2008, p. 2). The vision of EFMHA is "a world in which the wisdom of Equus moves us to develop and deepen our greatest potential" (p. 2). EFMHA acknowledges that EFP is an experiential form of therapy that includes equines as integral to the facilitation of the session. EFMHA was established as an organization focused on mental health practitioners. The differentiating factor between EFMHA and other organizations providing certifications in the field of equine assisted therapies and activities is the dual mental health and learning outreach model that other organizations have, compared to EFMHA's single focus on the needs of the mental health practitioners in the EFMHA model. The required areas of competence for mental health practitioners varies widely from competencies required of educators or coaches. For this reason, EFMHA was an organization dedicated to mental health and clinical practitioners.

EFMHA's commitment to the mental health practitioner in the field of equine-facilitated psychotherapy and dedication to establishing field tested standards of professional practice was time consuming and labor intensive. The omission of other practitioners in the field of EFMHA's focused mission may have also reduced their market share of financial and human resources and paying customers when membership and professional certifications drove revenues. EFMHA began to explore the benefits of pursuing more of an integration with NARHA rather than remaining a subsection of NARHA. EFMHA's intent for the integration with NARHA included

the opportunity to grow the organization, combine resources and intellectual capital, and harness the mission creep EFMHA perceived to plague NARHA. At that time, EFMHA perceived NARHA to need to direct more attention to the well-being of the horse in therapeutic horseback riding lessons and give more care to promoting the therapeutic benefits for the whole of the individual beyond just the physical and or occupational therapy benefits, which was the focus of therapeutic horseback riding at that time.

EFMHA required of NARHA, as part of the integration between organizations, a name change from North American Riding for the Handicapped Association, established in 1969, to a more inclusive and respectful representation of who these integrated organizations served. In 2011 the name change became official as NARHA evolved to Professional Association of Therapeutic Horsemanship International (PATH Intl.) PATH Intl. more accurately reflected their combined mission, international membership and community, their professional standards and certifications, and all combined services. The equine driven services included: driving, vaulting, therapeutic riding and equine-facilitated psychotherapy, which fell under the newly created umbrella of Equine Assisted Activities and Therapies (EAAT; PATH Intl, 2017b, About page).

The intention of the EFMHA board was to fold into NARHA the values of EFMHA that embodied a comprehensive approach to the human horse interaction; an approach that considered the whole person as mind, body and spirit, and the horse as a sentient being in the implementation of activities that brought therapeutic outcomes (Broersma, personal communication, October 21, 2016). The EFMHA board put forth several conditions to NARHA if a merger were to be transacted. One condition was NARHA's commitment to a name change. The EFMHA board had concerns that North American Riding for the Handicapped Association did not represent the whole person and the name was not inclusive of the large spectrum of those

being served and those capable of benefitting from the horse human interaction. Another requirement was the implementation of EFMHA representation to be included on every committee within NARHA to ensure the values of EFMHA were properly infiltrated throughout the organization. Also, the establishment of a certification process that included assessment, supervision, and on-going training for the equine mental health and learning specialist (EMHLS).

What did transpire was a name change from NARHA to Professional Association of Therapeutic Horsemanship International (PATH, Intl.) and a focused shift within PATH Intl. to take a whole person-centered and horse-centered approach. Modifications to the certification process for the therapeutic riding instructor and equine mental health and learning specialist have been made by PATH Intl. The next step will be to meet the type of competencies the American Counseling Association also deems necessary to practice in a specialty field that is thriving and gaining popularity.

The unfortunate outcome is EFMHA, as an organization, lost its identity in the merger with PATH, Intl. Those dedicated individuals that contributed to the founding and operation of EFMHA lost a sense of community and belonging within a unified set of values, vision and purpose that opened the door to a whole industry of practice organizations, higher learning institutions and foundations dedicated to research in the field of human horse interaction. It was a professional home for many like-minded women and men committed to advancing the concept of the horse as a sentient being capable of influencing positive experiences for diverse populations beyond physically and cognitively challenged riders served by therapeutic horsemanship programming. It is also unknown, at the time of this research study, if EFMHA is represented on all the PATH, Intl. committees to assure the values and mission of EFMHA are truly maintained and represented across the services and practitioners of PATH, Intl.

Ultimately, PATH Intl.'s integration with EFMHA, although well-intentioned, later became the disappearance and dissolution of EFMHA as a pioneer in the industry of EFP. Many of the original founders, past presidents, and dedicated members of EFMHA can be found on the boards and committees of the Certification Board Equine Interactive Professional (CBEIP), Human Horse Research Foundation (HHRF), PATH Intl., and full-time faculty or adjunct faculty members of higher education institutions.

EFP continues to be a term used by many practicing mental health professionals who align with the mission, purpose, and values that EFMHA established in 1996, although equine assisted psychotherapy (EAP) appears to have become the term more commonly accepted and used. More significance is given to the contributions made by the horse when engaging with a human in an EFP session. It is understandable how other practitioners or organization have a different view of how to engage the horse in service delivery. Less significance on the horse in session may translate to more care and concern for what is expected in an EAP session. The belief that co-facilitation between a human and horse in a psychotherapy session may potentially invite a higher level of combined awareness and contribution to the resulting psychodynamic outcomes will be explored further in this study.

The Evolving Industry of Horse Human Interactions

Equine Assisted Psychotherapy

Equine assisted psychotherapy (EAP) is a term chosen by organizations other than EFMHA, replacing the term *facilitated* with *assisted.* Organizations providing EAP established themselves after EFMHA was associated with EFP. Equine Assisted Growth and Learning Association, (EAGALA), founded in 1999, began the use of EAP as a way of differentiating themselves from EFMHA. Equine Guided Education Association (EGEA, n.d.), emerging in

2003, chose to use guided rather than equine assisted or facilitated with a mission focused on education. The CBEIP (2007 - 2011) recognizes both EFP and EAP practices and provides certification opportunities for Masters' level professionals. Eponaquest, a multi-disciplinary educational organization with an apprenticeship program, uses EFP and *equine facilitated learning* and views the horse as co-creator in a new way of being (Eponaquest, 2017, About and What pages). Natural Lifemanship™ (Jobe, Shultz-Jobe, & McFarland , 2016) offers education, training, and certification in two Trauma Focused Equine Assisted Psychotherapy™ (TFEAP) models, an organization emerging in 2010.

Foundations dedicated to research in this field as well as higher education institutions across the United States have added certificate programs or course work concentrations and areas of specialty to bachelor or masters' degree education requirements in the college or university departments of psychology, counseling, or animal science programming.

Equine Assisted Growth and Learning Association

EAGALA was founded in 1999, is governed by a volunteer board of directors, and reports a membership of 4,500 in 50 nations and 700 EAGALA programs (Equine Assisted Growth and Learning Association[EAGALA], 2009-2010a, Home page). Their mission states that "EAGALA provides education, standards, innovation, and support to professionals providing services in equine assisted psychotherapy and learning around the world." The EAGALA model uses a team approach where a horse professional and a licensed mental health professional are present in a client session, has a defined code of ethics for their practitioners, and offers EAP certifications. EAGALA clearly states riding is not a part of their solutions-oriented model that "Horses have a special ability to help people work through emotional barriers, serving as metaphors and powerful stand-ins for the people, issues, and challenges in

the client's life" (EAGALA, 2009-2010b, Military page). EAGALA has developed specialty services for veterans and military services personnel and their families as well as recovery services for substance abuse and addiction treatment. Lynn Thomas, licensed social worker, and co-founder of EAGALA, is currently the chief executive officer and has been in a leadership role with EAGALA since 1999. EAGALA lists Carroll College in Helena, Montana, as a collegiate collaborative partner (EAGALA, 2009-2010c, uni page).

Equine Guided Education Association

In 2003, Ariana Strozzi, June Gunter, Alyssa Aubrey, and Gaby Fabian co-founded the Equine Guided Education Association (EGEA, n.d. about history of egea page). EGEA was formed as a membership organization to promote human growth and learning in the field of equine guided education. EGEA carefully explains their choice in the word guided:

> the word "Guide," defining the horse's role in the learning process, has a specific meaning and most appropriately describes the horse's amazing gift. As we see it, the horse does more than facilitate or assist the learning process, the horse literally "guide's" the process in that the EGE professional follows and listens to the horse's input as of paramount importance. The word, "Guide" was carefully chosen because it means, "one who can find a path through unknown or unexplored territory." This describes the profound and magical aspect of horses in the learning process. We invite you to explore the magnificence of this opportunity. (EGEA, n.d. about history of egea page)

Magical is a word used multiple times within the EGEA website to describe the horse. The question, what is equine guided education, is answered as the horse's ability to represent "the ancient archetypes of strength, courage, dignity, power, honor, beauty, endurance, resilience, mystery, integrity" (EGEA, n.d.).

EGEA (n.d., about history of) appears to have a mission of educational coaching as well as promote therapeutic models that encourage relationship, social, communication, and coordination skills. EGEA's vision is focused on reconnecting individuals to nature and land through the horse. The mission of EGEA values supporting the union of the horse as a respected

guide in learning, human growth, and development. EGEA also provides standards for competency in the field and a certification program. According to the organization's website, the EGEA model is noted to appeal to creatives, somatic healers, shamans, pet communicators, therapists, equestrians, riding instructors, horse trainers and educators.

Certification Board for Equine Interactive Professionals

The CBEIP was established in 2006 as an independent certifying organization providing a documented system of examination that demonstrates an advanced knowledge base in specialized practices that partner with equines (CBEIP, n.d., About page). CBEIP promotes professionalism, specialized training, and a certification credential to establish public credibility in the field of equine assisted interaction. The CBEIP board consists of a group of professional women who hold advanced academic credentialing, present or past affiliation with other notable EFP and EAP organizations in the field, and a long history of collaborating with horses in therapeutic riding, mental health, or educational practices.

The difference in the Equine Interactive Professional (EIP) certification and other certification models already mentioned, is the higher standard of education and experience. A master's degree or Ph.D. in the areas of psychology, counseling, social work, and other mental health areas, for example psychiatric nursing, is required if pursuing the mental health certification. An advanced degree in education or human services or a post-graduate certificate in teaching or in human services is required for an education certification. Both the education and mental health EIP certifications also require documented experience in the field that is required to obtain the certification credential (CBEIP, n.d., Certification page). Documentation of 60 hours of human-equine interaction training and 60 hours of supervised human-equine interaction work must also be provided to submit to the Board along with letters of reference verifying the

experience within the field of mental health or education. This higher level of graduate education, experience, and scrutiny by the highly qualified EIP board comes with the benefit of its certified members receiving the opportunity for general liability insurance. The EIP may also be registered on the CEIP web site for potential referrals.

Eponaquest Apprenticeship

The Eponaquest apprenticeship was developed by Linda Kohonov, author of the book *Tao of Equus* (2001). The Eponaquest apprenticeship is an equine facilitated learning (EFL) model in an interactive format (Eponaquest, 2016). Kohonov's model emphasized co-creating a collaborative relationship with the horse based on authenticity and experimentation where expanding the potential of consciousness in both human and animal is valued:

> Eponaquest considers the constant interplay of body, mind, spirit, and emotion, developing intuition, flexibility, and inter-subjective relationship skills to balance Western indoctrination in logic, rigid methodology, competitiveness and objectivity—ultimately bringing these opposites into an empowered balance. Conventional and unconventional theories on the nature of human and animal consciousness/behavior are investigated, challenged, and constantly updated through a process of experiential investigation. (Eponaquest, 2015, "Best Practice")

Contained within the Eponaquest apprenticeship model are key principles a practitioner agrees to: one being open and honest communication and the ability to give and receive feedback. The purpose of the feedback loop is to maintain integrity in the model and promote self-examination and personal growth in ethics. Principles and standards of practice are clearly outlined in the areas of competency, confidentiality, safety, horses and partners, welfare of client, conduct with client, professional conduct, instructor community and business relationships, and commitment to best practices guidelines. This process appears to be a clearly stated and easy method of lodging a concern or complaint if a client, practitioner, or interested party feels these guidelines are not followed.

Linda Kohonov established Epona Equestrian Services in 1997 and has authored six books since. She has grown the Eponaquest apprenticeship model to a worldwide initiative with 280 instructors, as of 2015, on five continents (Eponaquest, 2016). She is a sought after international speaker and has been an enormous influence and powerful presence in the field of human horse interactions.

Natural Lifemanship™ - Trauma Focused Equine Assisted Psychotherapy™

Tim Jobe, horse professional and former EAGALA board member, and Bettina Shultz-Jobe, horse professional, licensed professional counselor, and former NARHA/PATH certified therapeutic horseback riding instructor, have developed the *Natural Lifemanship*™ model using a trauma focused equine assisted psychotherapy approach (*TF-EAP*™). The Jobes use a developmental neurobiological foundation for their trauma informed approaches that incorporate an understanding of biological principles that apply to both horses and humans (Jobe, Schultz-Jobe, & McFarland, 2016). The Jobes refer to their unmounted equine assisted psychotherapy (EAP) model as *Relationship Logic*™ (RL) and mounted model as *Rhythmic Riding*™ (RR). Both RL and RR models focus on emotional affect regulation. RR teaches co-regulation and self-regulation through the rhythmic patterned and repetitive movement of riding a horse.

Clients may need to learn how to manage emotions and sensations of distress through co-regulation with the horse's rhythmic, repetitive, patterned motion before they can learn how to self-regulate emotional affect. "Self-regulation is a large part of both the Relationship Logic and Rhythmic Riding programs…by controlling ourselves we can have influence over others" (Jobe et al., 2016, p. 78). Co-regulating emotions with a horse can help the client learn about self-regulation and how healthy relationships can contribute to a sense of well-being. The idea that relationships can heal is a change in basic assumptions or a well-established belief system

especially when the client's developmental history has taught them that relationships are unpredictable, hurtful, or abusive.

The client is encouraged to study how the horse adaptively releases pressure by shaking, sighing, yawning, and by releasing air through their mouth, which vibrates their muzzle to release stress. These methods of releasing pressure or stress may be experienced as intentional rhythmic, repetitive sensations that help rebalance or reset the nervous system after a stressful event can stimulate the fight, flight, or freeze response. This process works the same way in humans when the lower regions of the brain are activated as the natural biological response to actual or perceived threat. Miller-Karas (2015) noted yawning "to be one of the most important mechanisms for regulating the survival-related behaviors in mammals" (p. 14). Newberg wrote, "Yawning may be the brain's attempt to eliminate symptoms by readjusting neural functioning…yawning may be a way to cool down the overly active cortex, especially in the region of the frontal lobe" (as cited in Miller-Karas, 2015, p. 14). Adaptive strategies learned experientially through connection with or observation of the horse when a client participates in a psychotherapy session brings the coping skill to life in the present moment. This experience may make more of an impression on the client and motivate her to use yawning or breathing as a relaxation technique when a release of stress is needed.

RL is an EAP model built on the principles of pressure and release as four sequential steps that communicate to the other in relationship, the horse in this case, a client's interest in forming a relationship. Jobe, Schultz-Jobe, and McFarland (2016) wrote, "The ultimate goal is to build a connected relationship" (p. 21). Pressure experienced within the context of relationships in the RL model is viewed as a request. A request, as pressure, can simply be an invitation into the relationship set by a client's intention to engage with the horse through a

mutual exploration of needs and interest which is a natural request or expectation in forming a relationship.

The principled application of RL begins with the least amount of pressure with the intention of always giving the horse a choice whether to engage in relationship with the client or not. If the horse does not respond to the least amount of pressure, the client increases to the next level of pressure continuing to give the horse choice by applying this pressure at the rear of the horse. This gives the horse an opening to move forward and away from the pressure if desired. Pressure is typically applied through the client's proximity to the horse, posture, volume, facial expression, or motion. If the horse ignores the application of pressure, the therapist or horse professional guides the client to increase pressure and search for answers about her relationship with the horse shifting responsibility back to the client. The client may be prompted to assess what she is observing, experiencing, or sensing about her relationship with the horse or what she may be perceiving the horse is experiencing or sensing about her.

If the horse is resisting the client's increase in pressure in obvious and active ways, the client is asked to maintain pressure until the desired result is reached or not reached. Maintaining pressure rather than increasing pressure in relationships, when refusal or resistance is experienced, supports choice given in the context of a healthy relationship and avoids power struggles which impairs relationships. The purpose of applying these principles of pressure and release in the RL model is to teach the horse it is safe to avoid and resist. If the horse, or a human, learns through experience that it is safe to resist or refuse, they will learn safety is also present if cooperation is chosen. These are valuable principles for the client to transfer into human relationships.

The Jobes' TF-EAP™ models teach that if choice is removed in the context of relationship, the choice to cooperate is also removed. Compliance may be offered by an individual or horse in response to pressure perceived from an expectation or request, but compliance may be a disguise for cooperation. Often compliance reflects conformity and not a true desire to cooperate because the relationship is valued. Healthy limits or expectations set in relationships are a form of pressure introduced, for example, by a parent with the intention of teaching a child self-restraint, responsibility, or self-reliance as a normal milestone to be achieved in the developmental process. All individuals need to learn to set boundaries in relationships to protect their own needs and desires, and view them as equally important to those needs and desires of the individuals with whom they are in relationship.

Typical desired outcomes set through an intention at the onset of the RL psychotherapy session would be for the horse to turn and look at the client, turn, look, and take steps toward the client, or the horse turning, looking, and walking over to directly engage with the client. When a desired outcome is met, the client is instructed to immediately release pressure following the principle that pressure motivates, release teaches. This process may take one or many sessions depending on the client's ability to learn what level of pressure is appropriate for their relationship with the horse, how and when to apply, increase, maintain, or release pressure.

Other learning opportunities about what healthy relationships look and feel like are the ability to reflect an authentic desire to be in relationship with the horse, appropriately manage frustration tolerance, exhibit emotional integrity where congruence is exhibited between internal and external emotional states and affect presentation, and the communication of trust and respect. This process reflects the social relatedness and reciprocity needed to form healthy relationships with humans as well as nonhumans where choice is always offered.

The client's true desire and motivation to continue to search for answers in her relationship with the horse and not give up, signals to the limbic system of the horse that the client is safe. If the client instead demonstrates the inability to accept that a horse may choose to ignore or avoid, instead of engaging, and this causes the client to give up on the relationship, then the client may be asked, what are you teaching the horse about relationships and how might this choice to give up resemble an ingrained pattern of relating in other relationships (T. Jobe, personal communication, October 2, 2015).

The limbic system is the area of the mammalian brain responsible for relating, connecting, attuning, and forming memories. When clients learn cognitively and emotionally to control themselves through focused intention in the company of a horse, they learn that the horse is capable and responsible for their own control and safety. What this instills for the client is, when I can learn to control the chaos within myself, I no longer need to control the chaos in others (Jobe, 2016, [video file]).

The four sequential steps of increasing pressure in (RL) are described as: suggest, ask, tell, and insist. The client is asked to begin with the least amount of pressure by making a request through a suggestion. Pressure is increased only if the request is ignored. Pressure is increased through an awareness of how energy is being communicated through mind, body, and spirit. The client sets a clear intention about a response they would like from the horse at the beginning of the session. Compliance, as a response to pressure, is not the goal and can be fear based or self-serving (Jobe & Jobe, 2015). The genuine desire of the horse to engage with the client in relationship is the result hoped for to establish an authentic connection.

Jobe and Jobe (2015) maintained that blind obedience or compliance can be responses that are offered meant to temporarily meet the needs of only one participant in the relationship.

RL teaches that healthy relationships meet the needs of both participants. It becomes evident if compliance was offered rather than genuine cooperation when the one who complied continues to avoid or resist pressure when a similar expectation is presented again. Understanding the difference between compliance or conformity, and cooperation, is another important principle to help identify if relationships are genuine or if a relationship is self-serving.

Often, what transpires in an RL psychotherapy session is an opportunity for the client to better understand their patterns of relating to others which may be assertive, aggressive, passive, avoidant, passive-aggressive, or the tendency to give up easily if they do not get the expected result when they want it. The client may exhibit an over-reliance on others to define for them how to create and be in relationship rather than taking responsibility for forming their own healthy relationships. The RL model teaches clients how to create healthy relationships based on vulnerability, open and honest communication, trust, authenticity, and respect. The following expectations are presented in RL: a healthy relationship is reciprocal and meets the needs of both, the relationship comes before the task to establish a connection, connect before you correct.

A principle offered throughout instruction of the Natural Lifemanship™ models of RL and RR is that a healthy relationship communicates “we thinking” versus, “me thinking” (Jobe, July, 2016 [video file]). If it is not good for both in the relationship, then eventually, it is not good for either becomes a guiding principle. The NL™ trained professionals present in a psychotherapy session with the client and horse are expected to provide caring, empathic, processing of experiences and observations which are reflected within the context of relationship. The RL model focuses on relationship principles and begins a session with an invitation to the client to build a relationship with a horse.

The client has the option to choose a relationship horse among the herd and begin to explore what an appropriate level of intimacy will look like with a horse where choice is always offered in the context of the relationship. The mental health therapist will present the following relationship principles experientially as the opportunity arises in the session: healthy, predictable relationships can heal an individual and a horse, relationships are always more important than the task at hand, trust that the horse will know how to control itself so you can focus on learning to control yourself, relationship is the vehicle for change, the horse is going to help you find the relationship you need with humans, connect before you correct.

Pressure in relationships creates motivation to look for answers; application of pressure motivates and a release of pressure teaches. Start with the least amount of pressure in relationship, if expectations in healthy relationships are not increased, then relationships cease to grow. The human relationship with a horse is not a metaphor or a mirror. Objectification of the horse projects another identity onto the horse; relationships are reciprocal where the needs of all are given importance. Trauma victims may have inappropriate boundaries and a limited understanding of intimacy in relationships: being assertive in relationships and asking for what you need raises energy in the body to avoid revictimization, and human relationship patterns will be recreated with the horse (Jobe, 2015). Tim Jobe shared with me that his reason for leaving EAGALA, as a former board member, was due to a lack of focus on relationship within the EAGALA EAP model (personal communication 2015, October 2).

Tim Jobe also commented on his choice to use the term equine assisted psychotherapy (EAP) versus Equine-facilitated psychotherapy (EFP). Tim responded saying he felt it was placing too much responsibility on the horse to consider them as a co-facilitator rather than assisting in the psychotherapy session (personal communication, October 2, 2015). Bettina Jobe,

co-founder with her husband, Tim, has a background with NARHA/PATH Intl. as a therapeutic riding instructor. Both Tim and Bettina Jobe have a history with two different leading organizations in the industry that have maintained competitive relationships in standard terminology, establishing industry standards of care and professionalism, instructor and equine professional certification programs, and gaining membership market share.

The Jobes' TF-EAP™ models are based on healthy dynamics in relationship that combine the best of both the mental health model and partnering with horses for the well-being of horses and humans based on recent developments in the neurobiology of relationships. The Jobes' believe it is the neurobiological scientific base that makes their EAP models replicable (Jobe, 2016, [video file],). Natural Lifemanship™ (NL) is an educational and membership organization that offers a fundamental and intensive training in their TF-EAP™ models as well as a mental health and equine professional certification and a train the trainer opportunity.

Horses and Humans Research Foundation

The Horses and Humans Research Foundation (]HHRF]; n.d., about pages) promotes the significant influence of horses on humans, educates the public, including insurance companies and physicians, to help make equine assisted activities more available to those in need. Research that increases knowledge and awareness about the health and wellness benefits from horse-human interactions will help to unite the industry in a common goal. HHRF's primary goal is to further scientific research to provide evidence of the benefits associated with participating in equine assisted activities and therapies. Research will help to identify the most effective methods and techniques in service delivery.

Many of the HHRF board members are or have been affiliated with EFMHA, NARHA/PATH International, EAGALA, and CBEIP. The mission of HHRF is, "through

investment in rigorous research, Horses and Humans Research Foundation will serve as a catalyst to advance knowledge of horses and their potential to impact the health and wellness of people" (HHRF, n.d., about page). Many of the grants awarded by the HHRF have funded research studying the effects of equine assisted activities and therapies on social engagement and functioning, post-traumatic stress disorder, basic neurobiological and psychological functioning, coping self-efficacy and emotional regulation (HHRF, n.d., about page).

The most recently awarded research project recorded on the HHRF website explores the horses' ability to distinguish between neurotypical and mentally traumatized humans. As of 2015, 10 projects have received research awards in addition to a proposal accepted in 2016 for completion in 2018. HHRF acknowledges the varied use of terminology used to describe the horse-human interaction and provides a grant glossary of terms to be used by grant applicants. HHRF recognizes the use of Equine-assisted activities (EAA), equine-assisted therapy (EAT), equine-facilitated psychotherapy (EFP) and equine-facilitated mental health (EFMH) is recommended.

Higher Education Programming in Equine Assisted Activities and Therapies

Another development in the growth of the equine assisted activities and therapies industry is the number of higher education institutions offering curricula focused on equine assisted activities and therapies and individual certifications through animal science, counseling, and education degree programs in universities and colleges in the United States and abroad (Brady, Hernandez, & Guay, 2011). NARHA introduced the higher education membership in 2010 for colleges and universities interested in offering education in equine assisted activities and therapies (EAAT).

PATH Intl. offers different levels of membership for interested institutions. There is a Level I membership for institutions providing EAAT curricula and a Level II membership for institutions providing curriculum that meets criteria for a PATH Intl. certification as a therapeutic riding instructor and/or an equine specialist mental health and learning (ESMHL). The Level III membership includes everything in Level I and II in addition to providing the actual PATH Intl. certification (PATH Intl., 2017c).

This type of higher education membership was subsequently established by EAGALA as the collegiate collaborative partner membership. EAGALA has one member referenced on their website: Carroll College in Helena, Montana. A bachelor of arts degree within the psychology department as a subspecialty in human-animal studies is awarded as part of the human-animal bond degree program featuring an equine or canine track. Students must complete a two-part training to achieve certification in equine assisted psychotherapy and receive a two-year EAGALA membership (EAGALA, 2009-2010c).

PATH International (2017c) colleges and universities offering a PATH International certification as part of a degree program are (a) University of New Hampshire, (b) Texas Tech University, (c) Ohio University, (d) North Dakota State University, and (e) University of Wisconsin River Falls. SUNY Cobleskill College and SUNY Old Westbury in New York, Lake Erin College, Rocky Mountain College, and Waubonsee Community College provide curricula to meet PATH International criteria for therapeutic riding instructor certification although the actual certification process is completed outside the degree program.

Colleges and universities that offer curricula related to equine assisted activities and therapies but do not offer a PATH International (2017c) certification are (a) Azabu University, (b) Arkansas State University within the College of Nursing and Health Professionals, (c) Utah

State University within the Animal, Dairy and Veterinary Science Department, and (d) West Virginia University within the College of Agriculture. Other colleges or universities not affiliated with PATH International or EAGALA membership programs are Rogers State University (2017), which also offers a certification program for therapeutic riding, and Saint Mary of the Wood College offers a minor in EAP with an emphasis in education/special needs, organizational and leadership development, or mental health (Saint Mary, 2017).

University of Montana Western (2017) offers a four year degree in natural horsemanship, a relationship based horse training model; Ashbury University in Kentucky (2002-2017) offers equine facilitated wellness tracks as part of the health and physical education within the Equine Center, while Wilson College in Chambersbury, PA (n.d.) offers an equine-facilitated therapeutics emphasis on physical and emotional growth for individuals with special needs.

Prescott College in Arizona was one of the pioneers offering an equine assisted mental health concentration as a graduate and post master's certificate in fulfillment of a Master of Science degree in counseling. Prescott College (2017) describes itself as "The leading academic program in its field in North America, the Prescott College Equine-Assisted Mental Health (EAMH) certificate program offers training in the rapidly evolving field of partnering with equines in providing psychotherapy and other mental health services" (EAMH pages). Requirement for completion of this concentration entails earning 15 credits within five specialized graduate courses focusing on exploration in equine assisted mental health (EAMH), considerations of equines in a therapeutic environment, the EAMH individual and group facilitation, EAMH best practices, and EAMH clinical field experience. The program design is a hybrid of distance education on an e-learning platform and a four-day residential intensive workshop. Four of the courses require a full semester of course work and a fifth course is

supervised clinical field work. Prior equine experience is required for this post master's certificate program in EAMH.

The University of Denver (2017) operates the Institute for Human-Animal Connection (IHAC) within the graduate school of social work: "The Institute for Human-Animal Connection is a center for the study of the interrelationship and health of people, animals and the environment" ("Equine Assisted"). Clinical professor, Philip Tedeschi, introduced the first course in animal-assisted social work for master's level students in 1996. In 2002, funds were received as part of an alumni estate left to support the development of human-animal interactional study. This provided the funding to establish the first animal-assisted social work certificate at the master's level. By 2005, Philip Tedeschi and Jennifer Fitchett co-founded the Institute for Human-Animal Connection (IHAC) through grants received from Animal Assistance Foundation and American Humane Association. Several other grants have been received that focus on animal abuse and maltreatment. Philip Tedeschi is currently the Executive Director of IHAC.

In 2015, the University of Denver issued a release announcing plans for a post-master's equine assisted mental health practitioner certificate program. The program provides education, training, and supervision, fulfilling "the educational requirements for independent board certification through the Certification Board for Equine Interaction Professionals (CBEIP) in the U.S." (Institute for Human Animal Connection [IHAC], 2015, p. 1). This partnership between IHAC and CBEIP ensures dual competencies in clinical skills and equine welfare. IHAC recruited Nina Ekholm Fry, a practitioner and educator in the field of EAMH from the EAMH program at Prescott college where Ekholm Fry was an associate professor. Ekholm Fry is also

listed as a board member of CBEIP. Similar to the EAMH program at Prescott College, the program at IHAC is a 10-month limited residency and distance learning cohort format.

International Organizations

Federation of Horses in Education and Therapy International

Horses in Education and Therapy International (HETI) was founded in 1980 to share, at an international level, educational and technical expertise in the field of therapeutic riding (HETI, n.d.). Their vision and mission states an intention to facilitate collaboration worldwide between individuals and organizations with shared philanthropic, scientific, and educational objectives in the field of equine assisted activities. HETI publishes a monthly newsletter and the *Scientific and Educational Journal of Therapeutic Riding*.

International Association of Human-Animal Interaction Organization

The International Association of Human-Animal Interaction Organization (IAHAIO) founded in 1990 to bring together national associations and organizations interested in advancing the human-animal interaction for international leadership in the areas of research, education, and collaboration with policy makers, clinicians, and other organizations of similar interest and the public. IAHAIO publishes the *International Journal of Research and Practice* within the section of People and Animals (PAIJ). It is a peer-reviewed and open accessed publication. IAHAIO (n.d.) reported, "PAIJ publishes articles related to research and practice in the fields of animal-assisted interventions (AAI) and human-animal interactions (HAI)" (http://iahaio.org/new/index.php?display=about). The aim of the journal is to bring science and practice together in "the fields of psychology, medicine, education and special education, sociology, social work, nursing, veterinary medicine, ethology, biology, ethics and law"(http://iahaio.org/new/index.

php?display=about). IAHAIO hosts an annual international conference featuring speakers presenting the latest research and developments in the field.

International Society for Anthrozoology

The International Society for Anthrozoology (ISAZ) was formed in 1991 dedicated to supporting scholarly and scientific study of human-animal interactions. ISAZ (2014) publishes *Anthrozoös,* the peer reviewed multidisciplinary journal of the interactions of people and animals. *Anthrozoös* has published scholarly articles on horses and human interactions.

American Counseling Association

The American Counseling Association (ACA) is included within the evolving field of equines in service delivery due to the governing council's endorsement and newly released animal-assisted therapy (AAT) competencies in the spring of 2016, a collaborative effort of Stewart, Chang, Parker, and Grubbs (2016). Leslie Stewart is a licensed professional counselor and assistant professor of counseling at Idaho State University. The competencies "were developed to establish best practices for counselors who use animals in therapy" (Bray, 2016, p.1). Johnson (as cited in Bray, 2016), expressed a desire to spread the message that AAT "is an intentional technique that involves another being with needs and sensitivities" (p. 1). Johnson and Stewart (as cited in Bray, 2016) were encouraged by the growing enthusiasm in the human-animal bond, and "there's a lack of awareness that this is a specialty area within counseling that requires training and knowledge beyond [a counselor's graduate course work]" (Stewart, as cited in Bray, 2016, p.1.).

A mental health professional working outside the scope of their practice in a specialty area needs clinical skills training specific to that intervention to be deemed competent. The newly released AAT competencies can be found at the Center for Counseling Practice, Policy

and Research at the American Counseling Association governing at the national level the state licensing of professional mental health counselors. There are three areas of competence required by the ACA defined as knowledge, skills, and attitudes based on and adapted from a qualitative investigation establishing competency by animal assisted therapy practitioners (Stewart, 2014, p.66)

Stewart (2014) suggested that to maintain competence a level of knowledge must be attained in the following three areas: (a) knowledge gained from formal animal assisted training in assessment and supervision, (b) in-depth animal knowledge specific to the breed and species of animal the counselor will be working with, and (c) knowledge of existing ethical requirements that include client suitability, informed consent, safety and risk-management. A mastery of basic counseling skills should be demonstrated prior to pursuing animal assisted therapy in counseling (AATC), intentionality, as well as a specialized skill set within AATC are also expected of the licensed professional counselor working within this specialty area in addition to attitudes embracing animal advocacy, professional development, and professional values.

The Care of Equine Partners

It is important to address questions that arise about the care of equine partners in therapeutic service to humans. Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw (2010) collaborated on responding to that question and others that pertain to assessing factors necessary to do no harm to horses and animals in general. Separate fields of Western knowledge address human concerns and animal behavior and healthcare, “nonetheless, animals continue to be denied a psyche” (p. 212). The perspective on this separation is slowly shifting through advances in ethology, the study of behavior in natural habitats mostly related to animals but not exclusively (Colman, 2001).

The equine assisted and facilitated psychotherapy industry continues to mature in efficacy and experience growth in higher learning programming due to interest and opportunity in this field and those related. Bekoff commented, “Overall, there seems to be a huge shift in attitudes towards animals but it’s slow-going,” and reflected, “most ethological research used to focus on what humans wanted to know about animals” (As cited in Bradshaw, 2010, p. 320). “Marc Bekoff, is Professor Emeritus of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology at the University of Colorado, Boulder. In an interview with G.A. Bradshaw (2010), Bekoff shared that attitudes towards animals have shifted to the belief and agreement that animals have minds and feelings.

The ethical implications in the humane treatment of animals have reached a new level of awareness, although “good welfare” is *not* “good enough,” were remarks Bekoff voiced related to improvements that could be better (as cited in Bradshaw, 2010, p. 320). The emotions of animals are taken seriously not only because attitudes are changing about research on animal subjects but also because reliability of data is compromised when animals are confined, manipulated, and develop stress from these conditions. Stress changes behavior and physiology in both humans and nonhumans.

Ethologists and psychologists are now finding themselves partners in a joint cause. Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw (2010) wrote, “Not only are animals psychological beings with human capacities and “immortal souls,” but they are vulnerable to psychological wounding” (p. 213). Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw published a case study focused on a traumatized domesticated horse. They documented the application of a specific technique, Eye Movement Desensitization and Reprocessing (EMDR), developed to treat post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw echoed the concerns of animal protection advocates who have argued, “domestication is a form of slavery as the psychological evolution of today’s cows,

horses, and chickens has been manipulated and tailored by human perceptions and purposes" (p. 213).

Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw's (2010) study considered the other species dynamic when suggesting human psychotherapy practices be extended to nonhumans by acknowledging "the tangled interface of animal psyche and human projections...[and] how ethical and psychological aspects of equine domestication influence how horse wellbeing is framed and its implications of equine psychotherapy" (p. 213-214) are discussed and identified in the study. It would be relevant to mention and clarify how the practice of equine assisted and equine facilitated psychotherapy can mix terminology in a way that can be confusing. Equine facilitated or assisted psychotherapy refers to the horse assisting or facilitating with a human practitioner the service of psychotherapy with humans as recipients. Equine psychotherapy used in the study conducted by Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw (2010) referred to the horse as the recipient of the psychotherapy by a human practitioner, and the human practitioner in this case study may be referred to as an equine therapist.

Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw (2010) were very careful in stating their purpose of "contextualizing assumptions across species" (p. 214-215) to evaluate what that means relative to the protection of agency and individuation of the equine participant in the case study. This was also the case to establish shared concepts, methods, and exchange across disciplines of human psychology and equine behavior where anthropocentric definitions of psychological states would be reexamined in the application of EMDR on nonhumans. Transformational changes in humans would be examined to prevent future trauma to horses. Attachment theory was used as a common model to understand developmental species-specific differences.

The study assumed that “domesticated animals who have co-evolved with humans are expected to have a psyche heavily influenced by human psychology” due to human expectations in food, habitat, socialization, behavior, tolerance and development (Muller-Paisner & Bradshaw, 2010, p. 218). The horse patient’s affective cues, symptoms, and other relevant information had to be conveyed through the horse guardian to overcome the lack of verbal narrative by the patient. This brought maintaining agency for the horse into question. Miller-Paisner & Bradshaw (2010) suggested, “By refined observations and intimate communications, an equine therapist becomes a ‘culture broker’ who comes to learn the language spoken by the horse, his/her preferences, moods, demands, and fears” (p. 221).

Developments in observational technique have been made in this area to consider a more integrative and relational view of animal affect and expression as opposed to a reductive behavioral approach. Muller-Paiser and Bradshaw (2010) believed this initiates a therapeutic dialog. Similar considerations for providing a safe container in a therapeutic alliance in human to human therapy have been adjusted for implementation with equine clients in therapy. Assessing the ingrained relational system is a primary factor in both human and nonhuman evaluations.

Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw (2010) defined PTSD for their study as an “overly conditioned fear response to stimuli that threaten death” (p. 226). The predictable association of events that plagued their research subject, Hero, an eight-year-old Lusitano stallion, was extreme stress and affect dysregulation exiting and entering his stall at a private boarding facility. Hero came to his trainer at age three. Highly agitated and dangerous behavior was noted at that time. EMDR was chosen due to the belief that Hero’s trauma needed reprocessing to order to disconnect the anxiety from the memory. Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw wrote, “Once the

memory and anxiety are separated, the memory obtains a different value and will no longer create a high level of fear response" (p. 227).

The tactile form of EMDR with bilateral tapping was adapted to Bilateral Equine Tapping (BET) for its application with horses (Muller-Paisner & Bradshaw, 2010). EMDR is an evidenced based form of treatment used to treat the memories of adverse experiences and post-traumatic stress disorder. Van den Hout and Englehard (2012) wrote, "EMDR has been validated as an effective treatment for PTSD based on controlled clinical research. The clinical findings have been confirmed in the lab, where memories change as a result of eye movements and other dual tasks" (p.733).

Tapping devices were placed at Hero's jaw and calibrated to his movement. Corresponding protocols specific to Hero's needs were put into place. Muller-Paisner and Bradshaw (2010) wrote, "The taps alternate, causing 'dual attention' to both internal and external events. Tapping alternate sides of the body causes the corpus collosum to allow intercortical communication between the left and right hemispheres of the brain" (p. 227). The fearful event is experienced differently, and the memory value associated with the event carries a lower level fear response. After 12 trials, Hero's behavior was reported to improve by 50% measured quantitatively by a decrease in symptoms and an overall improved presentation. Hero's ability to move in and out of his stall improved with less resistance and hesitation although some panic persisted randomly. He also became more relaxed and engaged when ridden and an increase in confidence was observed. A routine of cognitive exercises was included to reinforce new behavior.

A synopsis of this study was referenced to illustrate human conducted research involving nonhumans to increase awareness of all the considerations that are needed to bridge the gap

between the human perspective of what is beneficial for the nonhuman participant and the care needed to better adapt that perspective to the intricacies involved in assessing human practices for nonhuman application. Equine assisted or facilitated psychotherapy and "animal assisted therapies (AAT) are designed to improve human health often at the expense of the animals forcibly recruited. It is critical to distinguish whether therapy involving nonhuman animals is truly for their benefit or humans" (Muller-Paisner & Bradshaw, 2010, p. 214).

Muller-Paisner & Bradshaw (2010) maintained it is equally important to adapt any human interface for nonhuman application according to that animal's habitat, values, and culture, and lastly, to be ever mindful that psychopathology observed in animals is largely inflicted by humans, and humans are the beings making those observations. For this reason, all agencies and institutions involved in therapeutic work or work involving nonhumans in service delivery or nonhuman clients, need clear standards and protocols in place with routine audits for compliance to reduce the occurrences of, not only do no harm to humans, but also, do no harm to nonhumans.

Summary of Horse Human Interaction Industry

As the researcher, I would like to acknowledge the emphasis on the representation of EFMHA, EFP, NARHA/PATH International and Natural Lifemanship™ in this study. This is due in part to my direct exposure and personal experience with these organizations, their leadership, philosophy on the role of the horse in service delivery and dedication to professionalism, training, competencies, and a rigorous evaluation process to achieve certification in a domain of knowledge. This may be perceived as a bias in this research study. There was a distinct curiosity driving my desire to capture where the focus is today on what the

horse brings to the interspecies dynamic and the responsible treatment and welfare of horses and animals in service delivery for human benefit.

I was also interested to investigate whether the field of horse human interaction has matured in the need to collaborate and provide a more cohesive ontological frame of referencing the culmination of knowledge and experience in this specialized field within the mental health industry. It is my belief the industry of horse-human interactions has evolved with important discoveries in ethology. With this shift, there is an implied duty to realign beliefs and practices of EAAT to reflect compassionate interactions in horse and human relations.

Since the establishment of NARHA in 1969 and EFMHA in 1996, there have been many organizations that have emerged dedicated to the horse human interaction. EFMHA fell to the background, when their priority focused on establishing professionalism, competencies for the mental health professional working with humans and horses, and initiatives to establish field tested standards for this work became time consuming, labor intensive and expensive. Competing organizations establish a quick equine assisted psychotherapy certification process that would deem those with no prior horse experience qualified to conduct a therapeutic session with horse and client.

The stampede of individuals and mental health practitioners, with or without prior horse experience, eager to receive a two-day training and certification was overwhelming and quickly became popular. This was at a time before the industry wisely moved to the standard of a dual professional model where a credentialed horse professional and a licensed mental health professional received specialty training before the mental health professional attempted to work outside the scope of practice. Fortunately, the American Counseling Association, with the help of experienced individuals in the field of animal assisted therapy, have taken the initiative to outline

competencies expected of licensed professional counselors. Hopefully, other licensing boards in the mental health industry will follow the leadership of the ACA.

There are varied perspectives on the semantics encompassing equine facilitated, assisted, guided or interactive practices. This has, at times, been a controversial topic and one that has created fragmentation in the industry rather than collaboration and cohesion. Those that consider themselves horse enthusiasts, professionals, or advocates, can have very prescribed and often rigid beliefs about the care and keeping of horses, the role a horse plays in the life of a human, and how this interspecies relationship is valued. The horse has never had a say in this matter when choice is not extended to the equine in relationship.

The philosophy and direction of EFMHA is to give more significance and prominence to the horse as a way of honoring their presence and impact in the psychotherapy session. EAGALA and Natural Lifemanship™ want to protect the presence of the horse by using the term *assisted* to limit responsibility given to the horse in the delivery of a psychotherapy session. This view is understandable for different reasons than *facilitated* is also understandable in EFP. It is based on the human's perception of a personal truth and absent of input from the nonhuman participant. EGEA uses the term guided with an educational mission to encourage a unified discourse of the horse as a respected guide in human growth, learning and development (EGEA, n.d., "about history")

Regardless of the choices in terminology that define these organizations, all seem to share the belief that collaborating with equines can offer a powerful approach to experiential therapeutic interventions that effectively promote well-being within an interspecies relationship dynamic. It is the perception of how the horse is involved in the delivery of this experiential form

of therapy that seems to be the most controversial to those professionals whose mission is to preserve the inviolability of the equine.

What seems to have established more difference than cohesion in the industry, apart from the terminology, is the role of the horse in a psychotherapy session. Those practices that still use the horse as a tool to drive a particular outcome or result through a task driven treatment plan, miss the relationship potential the horse models for the client. Consideration given to the social engagement system and offering choice is absent in a task driven plan. Practitioners often lose sight of the relationship value the horse brings to the session and may objectify the horse in their practice.

When the intention of the interspecies dyad is a focus on relationship, this intention invites a discussion and an awareness of the social engagement system. Patterns of social engagement that happen outside the session will appear in session, through the interaction or absence of interaction, between client and horse. This gives the therapist and client the opportunity to explore healthy and unhealthy relationship dynamics the moment they are happening, how they may be self-serving, self-defeating, or enlarging and advancing the relationship with the horse and relationships in general.

PATH International, EFMHA, EAGALA, CBIEP, Eponaquest, and Natural Lifemanship™ at the time of this study, appear committed to established competencies and standards that promote working within the scope of one's practice as a licensed mental health practitioner, credentialed equine professional or specialist, or educator when specialty interventions are implemented to augment one's professional practice. All have established processes of certification in their models as a method to create more accountability, professionalism, and the fair and responsible treatment of equines in this work.

There are different views about professionalism and safety in this industry. Regardless of how careful a practitioner or organization is in their attempts to ensure safety while working with animals in an experiential form of therapy, an element of unpredictability is present and can contribute to a meaningful horse human exchange. When the question of safety is raised in this method of practice, it is more about minimizing risk and the act of due diligence toward best efforts to do no harm to client, professionals, and equine partners. Minimizing risk can be achieved by following established competencies and standards of care in service delivery.

The unpredictable nature of a horse, or any animal, are their instincts to be self-protective. That is why there are equine liability releases used by humans to protect those who venture into this area of uncertainty. The psychodynamics present in the horse human interaction can offer moments that hang in the balance between something known and something unknown. Humans can also be unpredictable and present risk to equine participants who are not protected by a human liability release. The subtle and impactful encounters experienced in a horse human interaction are important to examine from a psychological perspective. The psychodynamics present within the horse human dyad provides a threshold for studying this relationship phenomenon. Carl Jung established, through analytical psychology, a psychodynamic model that brings meaning and validity to inexplicable moments where the dynamism of opposing forces can underwrite providential outcomes.

Analytical Psychology

Carl Jung's theoretical and methodological approach for the psychology of the unconscious was given the name *analytical psychology* following Jung's break with Freud and psychoanalysis in 1913 (Hayne, n.d.). Jung's use of the term *unconscious*, like Freud's, refers to mental contents that are not within reach of ego consciousness and define a psychic realm which

can function autonomously (Samuels, Shorter, & Plaut, 1986/1993, p. 155-156). Jung viewed the unconscious beyond a personal subjective experience. Jung extended the function of the unconscious to include an objective nonpersonal capacity with a phylogenetic nature which Jung termed the *collective unconscious*. Samuels et al. (1986/1993) added, "The contents of the collective unconscious have never been in consciousness and reflect archetypal processes…images, symbols and fantasies may be termed the *language* of the unconscious" (p. 155-156).

Jungian psychology posits the collective unconscious to be inherited as inborn possibilities of ideas in the anatomical structure of the brain ascertained only by their effect and discernable through symbolic or imaginative expression (Jung, 1966/1978). Jung explained the personal unconscious to reside immediately below the threshold of consciousness and amenable to analytic techniques. The collective unconscious, however, Jung believed to resist analytical techniques and make itself known under abnormal conditions facilitated by energies in the unconscious. It is the autonomous capacity of the psychodynamics operating in the unconscious realm that was the focus of this research study to help explain how the presence of a horse in a psychotherapy session plays a role in shaping the expression of creative fantasy.

An abundance of literature is available on the life and work of Carl Jung. In this study, the researcher referenced volumes within Jung's *Collected Works* that dissect key psychodynamic components which form the unconscious and interact with the conscious attitude of the individual. Contemporaries of Jung and current scholarly works that focus on Jung's psychodynamic theory and support the research question were also included in the review of literature. Jung defined a practice of psychotherapy based on his formulation of the personal and

collective unconscious. The psychodynamic encounter that occurs in the relationship between therapist and client Jung understood to be critical to the practice of psychotherapy.

Jung (1954/1985) posited psychotherapy to require of the psychotherapist, patience, an awareness of the limits of their knowledge and ability, and the understanding that things cannot be forced (para. 464). Jung saw psychotherapy as a dialectical process of reciprocity between therapist and client as two unique psychic systems coming together for increased awareness; "therefore I say to the psychotherapist: let no day pass without humbly remembering that everything has still to be learned" (para. 464). Jung used the term neuroses to describe "misdevelopments that have built up over many years" as mild illnesses of a harmful nature (para. 36). These misdevelopments, Jung explained, carry a social and psychological consequence capable of grave effects on the relationships and environment of the client. Jung cautioned that "psychological work is full of snags, but it is just here that incompetents swarm" (para. 464). Jung was clear on the need for competent, humble, psychotherapists to always be asking questions and seeking answers in alliance with the client.

Expectations of professional competency provide measurable, structured, guidelines for developing behaviors, knowledge, and attitudes appropriate to provide safeguards for the well-being of all involved in a psychotherapy session. Jung (1954/1985) also believed the client to be intelligent, discerning, and capable of giving the most truthful interpretations of their experience. The role of the psychotherapist is to guard against jumping to conclusions without regard for the experience of the client. The unsatisfied yearning of the client directs the individual to discover the unconscious need to correct an imbalance in the conscious attitude through a process of self-regulation (Jung, 1966/1978, para. 130-131).

Jung (1954/1985) broke down analytical psychology into stages in approach and methodology. Jung supported the advancement in psychotherapy as a move away from the original view of psychotherapy as a "stereotyped" method that anyone could apply to reach a desired outcome (para.1). Jung believed it was not possible to ever grasp the whole of any individual but to approach the individual as an approximate of the "universal man [person]" (para. 2). Jung expressed his view on the therapeutic alliance between client and therapist:

> If I wish to treat another individual psychologically at all, I must for better or worse give up all pretensions to superior knowledge, all authority and desire to influence. I must perforce adopt a dialectical procedure consisting in a comparison of our mutual findings. (para. 2)

The healing process then arrives through the joint participation between client and therapist influenced by psychic elements that oppose the imbalance in the general attitude of the client (Jung, 1966/1978).

Jung (1954/1985) felt the scientifically responsible approach to therapy is the mutual participation of therapist and client. Jung believed in the "diversity" and "multidimensionality" within human nature to require of the psychotherapist a flexibility of methods and perspectives to "satisfy the variety of psychic dispositions" (para. 11) that inevitably present in therapy. Jung also encouraged the therapist to be sensitive to the clients' needs providing a simplistic approach to treatment rather than over complicating therapy with the "bewildering subtleties of psychological dialectic"(para. 11). Jung urged serious consideration be given to the client's personality as superior to that of the therapist's "in intelligence, sensibility, range and depth" (para. 11) and used the term *cure* as synonymous with *change*.

Resistance to change, Jung (1954/1985) advised, was to be met with acceptance on the part of the psychotherapist notably when the client felt the sacrifice to realize change was too overwhelming. Jung was aware that a client's loss of symptoms could feel threatening if the

symptoms provided the client with a sensory system to warn when an emotional imbalance was approaching. The emotional discomfort felt by the client may accustom the individual to sensing and relying on the internal disturbance to avoid detours from her intended path if there was such an intended path already known. Jung felt the way to healing must remain open so that the client can find meaning in the process. *Individuation* is a term Jung used to define the overall process of personality development often assisted through participation in psychotherapy. Individuation will be explored more fully as an independent component within Jungian psychology.

The Four Stages of Analytical Psychology

The four stages Carl Jung (1954/1985) identified as critical in the dialectical process of the individual's response to his or her environment involve: (1) confession, (2) elucidation, (3) education, and (4) transformation. True to Jung's view of the psychological process is the intentional presence of opposing forces to create psychic unrest and a search for answers that bring relief. Each stage of the dialectic carries with it an antithetical point of view created by the individual who may be resistant to change. The individual who experiences the discomfort that results when managing two opposing points of view often seeks a release from this distress to restore balance in the psychic system.

If the individual does not have the emotional resilience to hold the tension of opposing prospects until a clear decision can be formed, the individual may decompensate by seeking relief through means that are unhealthy. The emotional distress may have to become so intolerable as motivation to discover the old unhealthy pattern of behavior is no longer sufficient to meet the need of the individual.

Confession

The first stage in the analytic process is exploring what may be hidden that is troubling the client. A confession, which is the act of admission, harbors concealment as the antithetical or contradictory aspect to uncover. Jung (1954/1985) wrote, “Anything concealed is a secret. The possession of secrets acts like a psychic poison that alienates their possessor from the community,” although the individual tries to maintain comfort in the status quo despite the presence of psychological distress and disunity, it becomes a burden too heavy to hold privately (para. 124). Secrets and their concealment have varying degrees of malaise. The knowledge of what one conceals, Jung posited, seems to be less damaging if the concealment has remained in the conscious awareness of the individual.

A secret that is repressed and floats in and out of consciousness or that is repressed and lost from memory splits off from the conscious mind and becomes autonomous in the unconscious. The resulting danger is the separate existence of the concealment as a complex and the individual’s loss of awareness of the repression of the secret. This complex, Jung (1954/1985) described, becomes “a miniature self-contained psyche” with a “spontaneous psychic activity” (para. 125) as noted in dreams or in daily activity that persists below the threshold of consciousness. Jung was clear to communicate that it is not only complexes that compose the life of the unconscious but other specific forms that make their way up from below. These specific forms, Jung referred to as archetypes, will be examined later in this study along with other psychodynamic constructs influenced by the archetypes.

Jung made certain that by no means is the unconscious comprised of only discarded conscious material. The unconscious holds material that can surface spontaneously without conscious awareness and distort the conscious attitude. Distortions of the conscious attitude can

take many forms that may appear obvious to others while escaping the awareness of the individual keeping the secret. A distorted attitude can compromise one's social, emotional, or occupational functioning often brought to the individual's awareness by others in her community:

> The possession of a secret cuts a person off from his fellow human beings. Since it is of the utmost importance for the economy of the libido that his [her] rapport with the environment should be as complete and as unimpeded as possible, the possession of subjectively important secrets usually has a very disturbing effect. It is therefore especially beneficial for the neurotic if he can at last disburden himself of his secrets during treatment. (Jung, 1956/1976, para. 300)

The repression of the secret ultimately influences the life of the concealer through which others notice her actions or behaviors as peculiar. Jung (1960/1981) used the term *repression* to describe those memories, painful thoughts, and feelings that fall into the personal unconscious when little to no energy is given to their remembrance or purpose. Jung used the term *libido* to reference disposable energy and the need for its forward movement to encourage the continued well-being of the individual.

A point that is relevant to address within the stage of confession and concealment would be the restraint of one's emotions and affects. This is relevant to this research in that much of the focus of this study is the importance of emotional self-control and regulation. This includes emotional integrity and the belief in one's own ability to manage honestly their emotions in the context of relationships with others. Jung supported emotional self-restraint as healthy and beneficial, and he considered the probability of its virtue; however, when not handled with honesty and care, true emotions can become something concealed and hidden: "Hence the well-known bad moods and irritability of the over-virtuous" (Jung, 1954/1985, para. 130).

Emotional affect withheld from others can become debilitating to both the individual and the whole of the community. The whole of the community is robbed of the contributions

otherwise made on the part of the individual. This withholding of affect then becomes an example where the economy of libido has been restricted from forward movement. Direct confrontation with the concealment of emotional affect, when dealt with consciously, carries the same cathartic experience as the release of a secret. Otherwise, affect concealed out of fear of expression may grow into emotional dishonesty cutting one off from living authentically.

Real feelings about a situation or toward another never addressed become lodged in the unconscious and repressed like a secret. A conscious decision to not make a concealed affect public may be warranted for the safety of the individual, although dealing with this decision may need witnessing as a deliberate act of keeping the concealment conscious. The practice of witnessing on the part of the therapist requires more than an intellectual or emotional commitment. Witnessing a client is about enlisting the body conscious as a listening device. To hear one through the body awakens a sensitivity that encourages connection through noticing one's own sensations in the body (Miller-Karas, 2015). Body awareness can help the psychotherapist to better attune to the client:

> To cherish secrets and hold back emotion is a psychic misdemeanor for which nature finally visits us with sickness-that is, when we do these things in private. But when done in communion with others they satisfy nature and may even count as useful virtues. (Jung, 1954/1985, para. 132)

Private concealments interfere with the growth of the individual and her community, prolongs isolation, and impairs relationships. "But through confession I throw myself into the arms of humanity again, freed at last from the burden of moral exile" (Jung, 1954/1985, para. 134). Jung insisted that confession must be truly cathartic, not limited to an intellectual delivery of wrongs committed, but a heartfelt acknowledgement of what was withheld.

Jung saw the sharing of secrets important to an individual's development and a means to stay in the flow of community life. If one shares some dishonesty that was observed or heard in

the community that may put others at risk, this member of the community becomes valuable to the whole. If the concealment is not shared and the community is at risk, the keeper of the secret may carry the burden of guilt or fear of social exile if the truth were to be revealed by other means. The tension to reveal or conceal becomes a double bind of contrasting positions in need of reconciliation to restore balance within the psychic system.

The degree of harm to self or others by concealment of a secret not confessed appears to be based on the level of participation in, and the concealment of, the secret consciously or unconsciously. The secret is then likely to carry conscious and unconscious aspects within the community for those that had direct or indirect knowledge of or participation in the concealment. Again, Jung (1954/1985): "All unconscious contents, which either approach the threshold of consciousness from below, or have sunk only slightly beneath it, affect the conscious mind" (para. 126).

The potential for differentiation, the development of different views to better tolerate the tension brought on by opposing positions, resides at the community and individual level once confession is chosen. The exception seems to be concealments of a private nature that separate the individual from their growth in a community setting and the loss of potential growth the community may have experienced by the influence of the individual if she withdraws her participation due to harboring a secret. Jung (1954/1985) cautioned the therapist to suspend preconceived notions of normalcy and adaptation when working with a client.

Elucidation

Elucidation, as the second stage within the process of psychotherapy within analytical psychology, illuminates one's inner life for a more focused examination (Jung, 1954/1985). The client is made ready for elucidation following a cathartic experience in the stage of confession,

which typically leads to forming a tighter bond with the psychotherapist. Once the stage of confession is completed, the client may also believe she is cured and capable of continuing the analytic work on her own. Regardless of either of these outcomes, both suggest a fascination or fixation on the relief experienced from the emotional purge that accompanied a confession. This experience of confession needs reconciliation through insight and further integration into conscious awareness. Jung (1954/1985) wrote, "The fixation is at times extraordinarily powerful—its strength is so amazing that one suspects it of being fed by forces quite outside ordinary experience" (para. 139).

The force outside normal experience influencing the client's fascination with the cathartic experience, and with the psychotherapist as a witness, is also outside the awareness of the client. This symptom of fixation feeds the phenomenon of the transference relationship, an expected result after a cathartic experience. The reciprocal influences, the client and therapist have on the other, in the stage of elucidation, develops through the transference countertransference relationship. Neil Russack, (2002), M.D., and Jungian analyst shares his experience of countertransference when working with a client whose dreams featured ever changing images of horses.

Russack (2002) credited the horse with lending a transformative strength and a sensual earthly quality when appearing as a dream image. The instinctual knowing of the horse can help rebalance and ground the overactive human brain into an awareness of the body. "I realized I would have been more helpful to her had I been able to authenticate her spirit, to make a relationship with it, bring it down to earth, rather than being carried away with the horses myself" (p. 140). Russack also became spellbound by the dream image of his client.

Elucidation does assist in uncovering what remains below the threshold of consciousness, “for at least it exercises the mind and may awaken dormant forces which can intervene in a helpful way” (Jung, 1954/1985, para. 150). The dream images of Russack’s client helped to illustrate and give direction to what was needed in the client-therapist relationship.

Jung (1954/1985) was aware that the idea of mystery, which he believed can force itself upon the inquiring mind not as a form of ignorance “but as an admission of his inability to translate what he knows into the everyday speech of the intellect” (para. 482), a mystery Russack (2002) became aware of when listening to his client’s dreams. Psychological healing is encouraged through a creative process that eschews the rational and invites the irrational experience to effect change. The amplification of dream images can aid the process of elucidation.

Amplification is a technique that helps introduce myth and metaphor and invites the universal view of the unconscious to connect with the personal view. Both contribute to the healing process and further support the stage of elucidation as a move away from reliance solely on ordinary and rational approaches to psychotherapy. Jung intended the process of amplification as a synthetic method to widen the foundation upon which an interpretation can work to reveal what is unique and personal to the individual and uncover the unconscious and the universal significance of an image (Samuels et al., 1993). The psychological context is intensified through amplification and encourages further exploration until the image or symbol becomes discernable (Jung, 1953/1977).

Amplification becomes a process of synthesis rather than a reductive procedure that can limit and bind meaning. Myth, rich with symbolism, can mitigate the conscious and unconscious borders of elucidation and coalesce as insight. The collective and personal myth, or mystery,

acknowledged through symbol, metaphor, and experiential methods of therapy, such as EFP, may bring into view the depths at which psychological distress can originate to be more fully understood.

Elucidation is an important stage to retrace the steps that led to the concealment that was confessed and further reveal unhealthy patterns of adaptation. If left unattended, these patterns will continue to return the client back to the threshold of concealment. The acknowledgement of the process that brought the client to the point of concealment also guides her to a new understanding of the unconscious illusions she created. The creation of these errors in cognition, emotion, or action, make the concealment even more distressing and intolerable by the conscious attitude. The necessity to relieve the discomfort of the emotional distress builds and influences a directness of one's moral decision. This forward movement gives the individual's process of elucidation strength and endurance to overcome. A fidelity to the law of one's own being can be ignited or rekindled through elucidation which Jung expressed was more about trustful loyalty (Jung, 1954/1991).

The presence of a horse in an experiential form of psychotherapy may provide a form of amplification by default of the horse's mythic inheritance, intense presence, and willingness to connect. The genuine desire of the horse to relate opens the door for the client to learn how to be in relationship with another living being. If the client is asked to set an intention for the EFP session, this intention can weaken the veil between what is vague and undefined and what needs to be brought into the light. The presence of a horse may give the process of elucidation a quickening of spirit to usher in transparency and advance the psychological agenda: an agenda unknown to both client and psychotherapist at the start of the session.

The horse embodies a spectrum of characteristics traditionally assigned in Jungian psychology to dual designations of feminine and masculine gender. The heavenly and earthly qualities a horse exhibits, within a multidimensional frame of reference, allows one to identify with some or many aspects horses embody. These aspects amplify the analytical process within the stage of elucidation and offer a vast array of associations to broaden a synthetic interpretation. Jung believed treatment outcomes had more to do with the psychodynamic nature of transference and countertransference unfolding between client and therapist co-creating a therapeutic dynamic to influence outcomes. This was Jung's contribution to analytical psychology, which challenged the preconceived and stereotypical methods of treatment during his time. Insights gained through this therapeutic relationship lead to the stage of education required to integrate the knowledge gained in confession and elucidation.

Education

Education, as the transfer of responsibility to the learner, defines the third stage of Jung's (1954/1985) analytical procedure. Jung connected the level of education needed by the client, after the first and second stage of confession and elucidation, to the moral stance of the individual. Jung seemed to stray from clearly defining in *The Practice of Psychotherapy* his intention with educating the client other than to say one's moral conclusions develop from insight. It is clear from Jung in other volumes of *The Collected Works* (1971/1990) that an individual cannot take up the process of *individuation* as the primary goal of psychological education until after there is sufficient adaptation to social norms within the prevailing culture or community: "If a plant is to unfold its specific nature to the full, it must first be able to grow in the soil in which it is planted" (1971/1990, para. 760). It was important to Jung that the growth

of the individual evolve through a process of social and cultural training no matter how determined the individual is to go his own way.

The individual way, according to Jung (1959/1990), will at some point need to orient to the norms. Orientation to the norms is a skill that requires emotional control when the norm opposes the individual way. This is an important step in treatment, and *individuation*, when the individual is accustomed to emotionally acting out in their community to get their needs met through maladaptive patterns, or emotionally acting in, resorting to self-injurious behavior or intent. Jung (1954/1985) stated, "Finally comes education, pointing out that no amount of confession and no amount of explaining can make the crooked plant grow straight, but it must be trained upon the trellis of the norm by the gardener's art" (para. 153). Knowing one's self is the artful attention to the process of individuation. This statement by Jung seems to imply that the individual must be open to her own creative process if she is to successfully cultivate her ability to go her own way by directing and participating in the training process.

The personality of the individual must begin to sprout before it can be trained (Jung, 1959/1990). If the community is psychologically developed and supports the developing individual by making it safe to refuse or resist the norms in the training process, the individual will soon learn that it will be safe to cooperate and conform to social norms that are established to keep a community emotionally and physically safe. Above all, there is a responsibility to oneself in personality development.

Transformation

The transformation stage in analytical psychology rests on the premise that the therapist must complete his or her own work through the four stages. The therapist's experience of a self-directed application of the four stages within analytical psychology and personality development

is essential (Jung, 1954/1985): “The stage of education to self-education is a logical advance that completes the earlier stages” and compels the therapist to change to become capable of changing the client (para. 170). Jung asserted that the stage of transformation is not a foregone conclusion like any another stage in the sequence. It is only an approximation of what can occur when two persons: client, and therapist, are brought together as irrational beings in terms of the joining of undeterminable fields of unconscious influence brought to bear on the psychotherapeutic union.

Jung (1954/1985) summed up the stage of transformation, “all these guiding principles of therapy make so many ethical demands, which can be summed up in the single truth: ‘be the man [person] through whom you wish to influence others’” (para. 167). Jung added a similar antidote for the other three stages and admittedly expressed that each stage is a general truth and not a universally valid rule. Exceptions to one’s own definition of *normally adapted* need to be rightfully challenged so as not to depreciate the unconscious. The use of normally adapted would need to be an approximation in each individual and viewed within the overall spectrum of ever changing diversity present in personality development as a complex and open system.

The Stages of Analytical Psychology and Neuroscience

Recent developments in the field of neuroscience have provided an opportunity to reexamine the four stages of analytical psychology defined by Carl Jung (1954/1985). The psychodynamic components that interact within analytical psychology can be studied through an integration of neurological and biological processes to examine the intricate rhythms between mind, body, and emotion. Neurology, psychology, and biology have recently become more intimate in their scientific relationship to one another. The point where these sciences overlap and influence a combined approximation of healthy adapted functioning for the individual is

mutually beneficial to each field and the overall advancement in the sciences that support a generally dynamic view of mental health.

John Ryan Haule (2011), a Jungian analyst and researcher, has been dedicated in recent years to bringing Jung into the twenty-first century by reexamining analytical psychology through a neuroscientific perspective. Anthony Stevens (2002/2012), M.D., and Jungian analyst, is devoted to Jung's idea of the archetype as the most comprehensive conceptualization of a neuropsychic structure that influences emotional, psychic, and behavioral patterns. Haule and Stevens' literary efforts will be combined with other leaders, in the neuroscientific community devoted to building emotional resilience, to investigate Jung's psychodynamic theory through recent developments in neuroscience.

The importance of attunement in relationship to self and other, the innate will of the individual to thrive, and the need for resilience when adverse experiences threaten the well-being of the individual seemed to be a shared concern within the neuroscientific community. Haule's (2011) and Stevens' (2002/2012) research and experience, when compared to Jung's psychological imperatives reviewed so far, contribute to a broader and more contemporary understanding of Jung's analytical psychology and what is needed to support the individual's personality development. The neuropsychic structures common to analytical psychology are purposive in their advancement of the individual psychological agenda. Attuned relationships that foster emotional resilience are paramount to overcoming adversity and ensuring a healthy psychic economy. Jung was aware of this need evidenced by his emphasis on the importance of the transference and countertransference relationship in the therapeutic alliance between client and therapist.

Jung (1954/1985) explored what he believed to be the problems present in psychoanalysis at that time and proposed analytical approaches that shifted more responsibility to the individual to be an equal participant in the therapeutic process. Haule's (2011) interest in Jung's stages of the analytic process focused on the relationship between client and therapist through the psychodynamics of transference and countertransference.

Confession

Haule (2011) saw "a full cathartic confession" (p.139) as the glue that binds the client in relationship to the therapist. Jung (1954/1985) believed confession to bring about a profound intellectual and emotional release. Haule brought attention to the concealment of unconscious secrets, including the emotional reactions that can be self-injurious as well as injurious to others. Stressful experiences threaten one's ability to cope. Identification with a secret, which becomes a stressor for the one who conceals the secret, takes on a life of its own with the potential to create debilitating distortions that disrupt normal functioning and alter perceptions. These distortions, or illusions, created to maintain the status quo, manifest in the life of the individual as ruptures in relationships that are important to a sense of belonging and well-being. Dependency on the therapist is what Haule believed to be Jung's most important focus as "a natural consequence of the empathy and feelings of mutuality that made confession possible" (p.139) and the precursor to transference which leads to elucidation.

As two individuals join with a focused intention in a shared space, an attuned presence develops. Siegel (2007) commented:

> Shared attention initiates attunement. As we engage with others, we mutually focus our awareness on the elements of a person's mind that become the shared center of the hub of our minds. As this joining evolves, we begin to resonate with each other's states [of mind] and become changed by our connection. (p. 290)

Siegel believed attunement to be at the heart of therapeutic change as did Jung (1954/1985) and Haule (2011) in their belief of the power within the transference counter-transference process. Siegel described resonance as the ability to be seen and felt in the presence of a profound connection and sense a shared embodied experience within the mind of another. Siegel credited mirror neurons and neural process integration for the possibility of such an intense shared experience of connection to another.

Presence and being seen "supports neural processes that enable feelings of safety, a fundamental component for healing" (Porges & Geller, 2014, p. 179). The polyvagal theory provides a neurophysiological explanation for how the autonomic nervous system (ANS) is linked with behavior to provide an optimal therapeutic state "when the nervous system detects features of safety" (p. 179). The polyvagal theory is comprised of three hierarchical subsystems within the ANS. These subsystems evolved to mobilize "adaptive behaviors in response to the particular environmental features of safety, danger, and life threat" (p. 180).

One subsystem is commonly known as the *fight or flight response* that activates the sympathetic nervous system to mobilize the body in a defensive response. Another system enables a *freeze response* activating the parasympathetic system to immobilize or disassociate the body when threatened. The defense responses activate "a phylogenetically more ancient vagal pathway" (Porges, as cited in Porges & Geller, 2014, p.180) There is a third phylogenetically newer circuit, "only observed in mammals, that is associated with physiological states related to feeling safe and spontaneous social behavior" (Porges, as cited in Porges & Geller, 2014, p. 181).

The newer autonomic circuitry "associated with social communication has the functional capacity to inhibit the older involuntary circuits involved in defense strategies" (Jackson as cited

in Porges & Geller, 2014, p. 181). The older vagal pathway originates in the brainstem, is *unmyelinated*, and "shared with most vertebrates and, in mammals" (p. 182). Myelin coats neural fibers for a faster "and more tightly regulated neural control circuit" (p. 181). The newer vagal circuit also originating in the brainstem, is myelinated, and common only to mammals. This circuit is linked to cranial nerves that regulate the muscles connected to facial expressions and movements of the head, "the primary structures involved in social engagement behaviors" (p. 182). The newer vagal circuit also regulates the heart and lungs and can slow the heart rate to support a state of calm. "The neuroanatomically based 'face-heart' connection provides mammals with an integrated 'social engagement system' through which vocal prosody and facial expression functionally convey an individual's present physiological state to others" (Stewart et al., as cited in Porges & Geller, 2014, p. 182).

The experience of feeling a shared connection between client and therapist becomes the catalyst for the confession that unburdens the client of the impediment that causes a blockage of energy. The research of Siegel (2007), Porges and Geller (2014), and Haule (2011) has brought neuroscientific evidence to the importance of attunement and resonance in the transference countertransference relationship. Resonance and a feeling of safety in the company of another removes the loneliness and isolation concealment of a secret can create. Release of a secret occurs simultaneously with what one discerns as truth and restores homeostasis to the nervous system by removing the stress associated with something hidden. A neurobiological explanation of pressure and release brings relief to the distressing antithetical position Jung believed to be the motivation to restore psychic unity.

The initial conscious confession frees inertia from the self-imposed confines of the concealment to be reallocated to a greater understanding of how the secret was purposeful. Jung

cautioned of the frequency at which clients will prefer to remain on the conscious plane in endless reasoning and rationalizing to avoid elucidation through more creative or non-rational methods. It is Jung's belief in the creative process as the deterrent for intellectualizing the therapeutic process that sets him apart and creates a bridge for Jung in the 21st century. Haule (2011) capitalized on Jung's interest in the creative process of the individual to help deepen the therapeutic process and alliance with the therapist.

Haule (2011) pointed out in his research how much material Jung devoted to explaining the importance for the client to develop a dependency on the therapist. Jung (1954/1985) described the dependency after confession, as an expected and new necessary formation of dysfunction to serve a greater purpose in several ways. The dependence on the therapist provides the client with a more secure exploration of the unconscious, which is accessed through non-rational or more creative outlets. As the client's dependency on the therapist lessens, it becomes an index by which to measure progress. The dependency of the client on the therapist prevents a premature release of the patient from the therapeutic process and subsequent relapse thus a return to concealment as an unhealthy pattern is avoided.

Haule (2011) wrote, "When a transference develops, elucidation becomes possible" (p. 139). Jung (1954/1985) made a clear distinction between the stage of confession and elucidation and explained the cathartic method of confession restores unconscious contents that are normally components of the conscious mind that had remained obscure. As an awareness and understanding of the transference process is gained by the client; contents that are rarely destined to become conscious surface and can be absorbed as insight gained from this transformative relationship. Jung wrote: "This is the cardinal distinction between the stage of confession and the stage of elucidation" a restoration and enlargement of consciousness (para.141).

It is the responsibility of the therapist to educate the client on the process of transference. The therapist guides the client to develop a belief in her own capacity to struggle with moral dilemmas and function as a healthy social being rather than continue to transfer this responsibility to the therapist. Otherwise, a dependent relationship develops and *individuation* is thwarted. Haule (2011) stated, "Individuation is impossible so long as an accurate grasp of one's life situation cannot be formed" (p. 138). The therapist plays an important role in attuning to the client and creating an alliance that communicates safety. A secure connection between therapist and client will tolerate a client's need to avoid and resist the therapeutic process. The experience of safety in an attuned relationship between client and therapist during an emotionally painful and uncomfortable process can build rapport, trust, and the client's ability to feel safe.

Elucidation

Haule (2011) viewed the stage of elucidation as a reductive process modeled after Freudian psychoanalysis. The client can access the benefits of elucidation by means other than the analysis of dreams and fantasies. The attainment of new knowledge and insight, Haule believed, can come from the novelty of moving outside one's comfort zone. The transformative experience gained from stepping outside one's comfort zone is where Haule focused his attention on Jung's contribution. Incremental risk pursued outside one's definition of ordinary experience can over time shape a new desire for novel experiences. Repetitive new experiences can render the old routine way a client responds to her environment dysfunctional. For a new belief or practice to take hold, the client will need to learn there is safety in cooperating with a process that is initially alien and uncomfortable. The therapist guides the client through needed detours to ultimately find her own path. This may lead to the client's desire to forego the routine and mundane for something new and different.

Haule (2011) saw a link between the stage of elucidation within analytical psychology and what Jung called *differentiation*. Although Haule appears to view the stage of elucidation more as a reductive process, Jung's concept of differentiation seems to be more compatible with the current direction of neuroscience and what Jung may have intended through the process of elucidation. Jung (1971/1990) explained, "differentiation means the development of differences, the separation of parts from a whole" (para. 705), which Jung saw as necessary for the individual to find direction. Haule appears to be referring to the human capacity to differentiate the regions of the brain so that the appropriate brain region can be accessed for the appropriate response. Jung commented, "Fusion with the irrelevant precludes direction; only a differentiated function is capable of being directed" (para. 705). This separates the parts of the brain from the whole to engage appropriate part and function of the brain for the task at hand.

Haule (2011) reframed elucidation through a neurobiological lens. Conscious reflection is the goal of elucidation and the insight that develops from one's ability to resist the urge to respond on impulse. The automatic emotion-driven centers of the brain drive the habitually trained response to fight, flee, or shut down. Instead, Haule suggested a more considered and self-reflective understanding be reached as a life situation presents itself. The old way of responding to an event becomes differentiated when a response is consciously chosen reflexively. A thoughtful pause to consider consequences and choices engages higher brain functioning where access to critical thinking can become a trained response. Siegel (2007) wrote, "Experience can create structural changes in the brain" and "when we focus our attention in specific ways, we are activating the brain's circuitry" (p. 31). New neuropathways are created as the newly trained, or differentiated, response fires and wires neurologically with old dysfunctional patterns of behaving. Neuropathways of impulsive and reactive responses can

become obsolete when newer self-reflective responses become the norm. The old neuropathways shift from the reactive survival brain to the thinking part of the differentiated brain functioning found in the prefrontal cortex where reason and logic are engaged for a more civilized response.

Siegel (2007) described the brain's physical structure as changeable, also endorsed by Miller-Karas (2015) who added, "we refer to the brain's ability to change in structure and function, especially as a result of environmental influence, as brain plasticity" (p. 14). Miller-Karas explained the brain's neuron to neuron connectivity forms neural networks that can change connectivity based on changes in behavior or thinking. Changes in neuronal use can have a dual impact of either strengthening connections and increasing brain functioning or rendering connections obsolete and decreased functioning. One's directed intention reinforces corresponding brain functioning. If the intention is toward a higher state of functioning, the result will be a decrease in dysfunctional states of being. Differentiation, as defined by Jung (1971/1990), can be conceived as a reflection of brain plasticity resulting in healthy adaptation and a higher level of pro social functioning.

Haule's (2011) point and comparison of elucidation with differentiation appears to address the need for an individual to step back and reflect. Haule suggested the capacity to reflect provides insight, which leads to an accurate understanding of a life event all sequenced in the executive functioning or higher regions of the brain. Those individuals who primarily function from the lower regions of the brain and fail to differentiate higher brain functioning remain fused with lower brain impulsive and reactive responses that arrest emotional and personality development. The awareness that higher brain and cross brain functioning provides for growth in one's social engagement system is necessary for *individuation* and *differentiation*. Otherwise, the acquisition of healthy relationships becomes jeopardized, psycho/social and

emotional functioning is compromised, and the quality of life and health of the individual and their relationships subsequently decline.

Jung (1971/1990) explained the psychological imperative of attaining a more conscious understanding as "the lack of differentiation in the unconscious arises in the first place from the almost direct association of all the brain centres with each other, and in the second from the relatively weak energic value of the unconscious elements" (para. 180). Once the energic value accrues more energy, perhaps through participation in the process of elucidation with the therapist, or taking up the intention of differentiation by embarking on the path of individuation, the resulting increase of awareness elevates the energetic value to cross the threshold into consciousness where a moment of clarity is experienced.

The intensity of this moment causes one to pause for a fuller conscious understanding and any strong attachment to a position can be released resulting in a differentiated conscious attitude and the ability to hold a dual perspective. This moment of differentiation releases the energy that was previously attached to the conscious undifferentiated position, which allows the energetic value to descend and increase in the unconsciousness (Jung, 1971/1990). Jung (1971/1990) referred to this occurrence as "intense illumination" and believed the unconscious to be the "neutral region of the psyche" (para. 180-181) where the conscious mind is unable to distinguish what may hover just below the surface of consciousness.

What may be indistinguishable below the surface of consciousness could be an undeveloped idea, a clarifying thought, a comment that sits on the tip of the tongue and quickly escapes before it is uttered, or the expression of an unintended thought without censorship. Not until the moment when the energetic value ascends from the unconscious or lower region of the brain to the higher differentiated region of the brain can the idea become discernable by the

conscious mind (Jung, 1971/1990). The will and executive conscious functioning have become subliminal in this psychic transaction superseded by an abnormal state where creative fantasy material or an unconscious symbol is activated and forced to the surface of consciousness from below.

Experiences such as these become discernable when one makes the conscious decision to cross the threshold from the ordinary to the non-ordinary. Jung (1971/1990) offered, "This process can take place only in accordance with the laws of energy, that is, a gradient must be created which offers the latent energies a chance to come into play" (para. 130). EFP can offer such an experience when traditional therapeutic approaches prove to be unsuccessful. The presence of a horse may add to the gradient of energy within the psychodynamics already at play in the psychotherapy session.

The individual may choose to continue the status quo and maintain an undifferentiated position within the process of elucidation or strive to maximize the potential offered on the continuum of differentiation, fighting the urge toward inertia and embracing the mediating will:

> They [energetic values in the unconscious] are worthless in so far as nothing clearly distinguishable can be perceived from their configuration, thus leaving consciousness embarrassed and perplexed; but valuable in so far as it is just their undifferentiated state that gives them that symbolic character which is essential to the content of the mediating will. (Jung, 1971/1990, para. 181)

Differentiation, in the case of elucidation, becomes the neurological imperative to push through the tendency to resist making known that which is unknown.

Haule (2011) suggested replacing neuropathways of reactive emotional responses with new neuropathways of responses that access higher brain functioning capable of pause, reflection, and a thoughtful response. The brain looks for repetitive patterns to tag them as normal experience so attention can be directed elsewhere (Perry, 2006). Bruce Perry,

neuroscientist, endorsed patterned, repetitive activity as necessary to rebalance the nervous system and begin carving new neuropathways for healthier functioning. Driving a car becomes routine until the novelty of a bear crossing the road demands attention. Perceptions of what is normal are easily dismissed or go unnoticed so the unfamiliar experience can be perceived rapidly and responded to promptly to avoid danger or to seize an opportunity. Perry (2006) wrote:

> One of the most important characteristics of both memory, neural tissue and of development, then, is that they all change with patterned, repetitive activity…this use-dependent development is one of the most important properties of neural tissue. (p.29)

A horse in a psychotherapy session introduces the presence of something unfamiliar to heighten perceptions and responsiveness. A series of EFP sessions can revitalize the familiar therapeutic routine with unmounted or mounted rhythmic, repetitive, patterned activity in the company of a horse. EFP provides a creative alternative to traditional forms of psychotherapy when progress has reached a standstill. The choice to create neuropathways of healthy behaviors requires habitual use to render the neuropathway of maladaptive coping strategies obsolete.

This ultimately results in an increase in consciousness, healthier relationships, and supports the path toward individuation. Choices that increase consciousness becomes easier to achieve and repeat when a higher level of functioning becomes an ingrained pattern of behavior. This is also the case with repetitive patterned aberrant experiences consistent with neglect, victimization, or prolonged exposure to stress that become a desperate or hopeless state of mind and lead to destructive behaviors.

Jung (1954/1985) felt each stage within analytical psychology to be a salient truth with some sense of finality although each stage needs the other to effect lasting change or perhaps the integration or synthesis of each stage into a differentiated whole. Siegel (2007) drew from a

complexity point of view where linked components of an open system become functional and stable when they are integrated:

> We've seen that the human mind can be defined as an embodied and relational process that regulates the flow of energy and information. The mind emerges as this flow occurs within and among people, and it develops as the genetically programmed maturation of the nervous system is shaped by ongoing experience. (p. 288)

Elucidation helps one understand the origins of the psychological distress and reveals the sense that a life fully lived demands a broader view and a deeper range of experience. The stage of education requires from the individual an educative will that leads to adopting unfamiliar paths and practice of an attitude to know more. Jung wrote:

> And yet each of us can carry the torch of knowledge but a part of the way, until another takes it from him. If only we could understand all this impersonally—could understand that we are not the personal creators of our truths, but only their exponents, mere mouthpieces of the day's psychic needs, then much venom and bitterness might be spared and we should be able to perceive the profound and supra-personal continuity of the human mind. (para. 157)

Education

Haule (2011) saw the stage of education as the client's "need for direction" (p.140) and an opportunity for a discussion about the client's life situation: a genuine examination of the internal and external dialog that would assist the client in self-realization, a concept Jung referred to as individuation. Individuation will be examined in partnership with other psychological concepts specific to Jung that aid the individual in a lifelong commitment to a continued process of growth and transformation.

Transformation

Transformation is needed to move the client from the inertia of complacency toward fulfillment of one's individual psychic agenda. The joining of two independent psychic systems as unique parts in a therapeutic alliance merge into a psychodynamic whole of shared attention.

The stage of transformation in analytical psychology is clearly to be a mutual experience between therapist and client. For Jung (1954/1985), the responsibility of the therapist is less about a treatment program and more about a joint quest with the client to develop and reveal the creative agenda latent in the individual as the impetus for a transformative experience. EFP would qualify as a creative joint quest between client and therapist to invite a transformative experience.

A joint quest requires mutual collaboration, trust, and shared attention. Shared attention as a form of attunement, resonance, and therapeutic presence are the contemporary terms used to explore the phenomenon of transformation. Attunement between therapist and client helps explain the transference-counter transference process as a neurophysiological encounter between two individuals that leads to a transformative experience. Siegel (2007), Porges and Geller (2014), Perry (2006) and Van der Kolk (2014) also suggested mirror neurons and neural processes that operate outside one's awareness are responsible for facilitating this relational phenomenon.

Siegel (2007), a scientist and psychiatrist, encouraged shared attention to create attunement with the other: "As we engage with others, we mutually focus our awareness on the elements of a person's mind that become the shared center of the hub of our minds" (p. 290). This joining with another, which occurs through the dynamic of transference and counter-transference in the therapeutic alliance, creates a resonance between mental states which encourages change through connection. Siegel wrote, "Attunement can be seen as the heart of therapeutic change" (p. 290). Siegel described the connection as "experiencing that embodiment of one's own authentic mind inside another person (p. 290)." Mirror neurons are responsible for the embodied experienced allowing the neural processes to integrate what is perceived.

The social nature of the brain is supported by mirror neurons and demonstrates the mental intention one imagines is going through the mind of the other with whom there is an engagement (Siegel, 2007, p. 166). What we see and imagine, as the experience of the other, relies on mirror neurons. Mirror neurons have the capacity to reflect the social nature of the brain. Siegel (2007) wrote, "Mirror properties of the nervous system provide an important window into examining the nature of culture and how shared ritual behaviors within our families, schools, and communities enable us to resonate with each other's internal states, including intentions" (p. 167). What is interesting in terms of this research and Jung's psychology is that goal-directed behaviors activate the mirror neurons. The energy Jung referred to as libido can be conceived to activate mirror neurons.

Siegel's (2007) sixth sense allows one to sense into the feeling experience of one's own body. Empathy draws from these sensory and somatic experiences via the brain's prefrontal functioning. *Mindsight* is viewed as a seventh sense, which Siegel (2007) explained is the brain's ability, by way of mirror neurons, "to create representations of other people's minds" (p. 169). In effect, these senses provide an inward and outward examination through different levels of perceptions. *Relational resonance* is proposed by Siegel as the eighth sense. Collectively, the eight senses create a resonance circuitry and partnership in a coherent state of mind:

> Empathy requires that we reflect on our internal states. The mirror neuron system and related regions' creation of emotional resonance shifts the limbic and bodily states so that the prefrontal region can reflect on those changes and create compassionate (feeling with another) and empathic (understanding another) responses. (Siegel, 2007, p. 169)

Attunement opens for the therapist and client a connection that leads to transformative experiences.

The neuropsychology of transformation is a phenomenon Haule (2011) researched to try and explain the neural processes that occur in the brain and psyche when transformative states of

consciousness are activated and experienced. Haule took an interest in how "the brain ought to be as unified as the transformative state of consciousness that it supports" (p. 170). Haule saw the brain, similar to Jung (1971/1990), as a collection of opposed pairs functioning independently until the neural circuitry of a transformative state is experienced and the brain becomes agreeably integrated. Haule wrote "The capacity of the human psyche to rise above its imprisonment in the ordinary world of matter and logic Jung calls the *transcendent function*" (p. 167).

Jung approached the transcendent function as a multi-functional process of transitioning attitudes based on the tension within the opposed and independently functioning areas of the brain until the opposition is formed as a living symbol. The experience of the living symbol

> it's profundity of meaning is inherent in the raw material itself, the very stuff of the psyche, transcending time and dissolution; and its configuration by the opposites ensures its sovereign power over all the psychic functions. (Jung, 1971/1990, para. 828)

What Haule (2011) found was the complex regions of the brain operate independent of, or in conflict with, one another. Stevens (2002/2012) saw conflict to be the result of duality and to be present throughout nature: "Destruction, like creation, arises from the juxtaposition of opposing forces, and so basic are these contrapuntal oppositions to the fabric of our universe that consciousness and life itself would be inconceivable without them" (p. 289). Stevens believed duality to be at the very core of what makes consciousness and life conceivable and to be reflected in the body and brain.

The functional centers of the human anatomy can be broken down into dual cerebral hemispheres and an autonomic nervous system (ANS) that runs on a finely tuned dual nervous system divided between parasympathetic (PNS) and sympathetic nervous systems (SNS). These co-regulating systems control the functioning of bodily organs and prepare the body for fight,

flight, freeze or rest. Stevens (2002/2012) focused his attention on the cerebral hemispheres, “it is well established, therefore, that both cerebral hemispheres are concerned with contralateral movements and sensations” (p. 289). Miller-Kara (2015) focused her attention on the elegant design of the nervous system:

> neuroscience not only helps us understand the biological underpinnings of the common human reactions to traumatic experience, but also provides us with the hope that human experience can change the brain and the body. (p. 32)

Haule (2011) was interested in both the ANS and brain functioning that is conflictual. Haule referred to specific brain regions and functions that support Jung’s theories. How these three researchers present the neurophysiology of a transformative moment will be explored.

The elegant design of the autonomic nervous system responds to and works in concert with the perceived environmental demands of the individual which are typically psycho/social/emotional and biological. The ANS is broken down into its respective dual and dependent functions to help simplify and explain how the nervous system drives the psychology of the individual. Jung (1960/1981) wrote, “So far as our experience permits of any inferences at all about the nature of the psyche, it shows the psychic process as a phenomenon dependent on the nervous system” (para. 607). Included in the ANS is the sympathetic nervous system (SNS) and the parasympathetic nervous system (PSNS) (Miller-Karas, 2015).

The SNS prepares the body for action, the release of stress hormones, increased energy, breathing, and oxygen. The SNS acts more as an accelerator for the internal biological systems when mobilization of the body and brain are needed. The PSNS prepares the body for rest, the conservation of energy, digestion, lowers heart rate and slows breathing and perspiration. The PSNS acts as the biological brakes to slow action to a relaxed state. The natural biological

rhythm of pressure (SNS) and release (PSNS) corresponds to what Miller-Karas (2015) defined as the biological zone of resilience.

Resilience is expressed as one's ability to access higher brain functioning in times of distress and to increase the capacity to tolerate stressful events (Miller-Karas, 2015). An individual has the ability to widen the zone where resilient states of functioning become ingrained traits by deepening the neuropathways associated with a more emotionally regulated response to one's environment. The word regulated, used in this context, means the conscious choice to not act on impulse as a reactive response to stimuli. Training or retraining the nervous system to pause, assess the situation, and then act in accordance with a higher state of conscious functioning is where Jungian psychology intersects with neurobiology as a psychic process dependent on the nervous system (Jung, 1960/1981).

Stevens (2002/2012) postulated that the dual structure of the brain may be a collective projection of the functions of each cerebral hemisphere out onto its opposite side, "the left cerebral functions [projected] on to the right and the right cerebral functions [projected] on to the left" (p. 292). Stevens' research took him to the dual and unique capacities of each cerebral hemisphere and Jung's concept of differentiation reviewed earlier. According to Stevens' research, the left hemisphere is dedicated to analysis, language, logic, rational concepts, and specifics, while the right hemisphere is trained to tasks that synthesize sensory or emotional information into complete perceptions, and the construction of universals and non-rational concepts such as creativity and intuition.

Stevens (2002/2012) credited Jung as the champion for promoting creative, intuitive, and receptive modes of apprehension to be as equally valid as rational and logical modes of apprehension. Jung (1956/1976, para. 222) held the intellectual (left brain) dominance of

Western culture responsible for the depreciation of creativity, intuition, synchronicity, and other receptive and relational (right brain) modes as relegated to the unconscious. Stevens (2002/2012) points out how often Jung warned against "one-sidedness" and adds, "Jung uses the 'sided' concepts which have subsequently become common in modern neurophysiology" (p. 296). Right brain individuals appear to be capable of a neutral stance and may be more cerebrally attuned to sense into and regulate their emotional center. Jung (1971/1990) expressed it this way:

> The conflict between the two "truths" requires a pragmatic attitude if any sort of justice is to be done to the other standpoint. Yet, though it cannot be dispensed with, pragmatism presupposes too great a resignation and almost unavoidably leads to a drying up of creativeness. The solution of the conflict of opposites can come neither from the intellectual compromise of conceptualism nor from a pragmatic assessment of the practical value of logically irreconcilable views, but only from a positive act of creation which assimilates the opposites as necessary elements of coordination…pragmatism can be no more than a transitional attitude preparing the way for the creative act by removing prejudices. (para. 541)

Creativity seems to be the bridge that facilitates a willingness to balance and appreciate the truths of both sides of the brain.

Although Jung (1960/1981) cautioned against one-sidedness, he saw the paradox within it, "one-sidedness is an unavoidable and necessary characteristic of the directed process, for the direction implies one-sidedness. It is an advantage and a drawback at the same time" (para. 138). Jung (1953/1977) appeared to suggest in these concepts a perpetual interplay of energy as it flows or ceases to flow within the individual's journey toward an increased state of awareness: "Everything human is relative, because everything rests on an inner polarity; for everything is a phenomenon of energy. Energy necessarily depends on a pre-existing polarity, without which there could be no energy" (para. 115). The reconciliation of opposing views releases the energy gradient held as tension within the nervous system. The directed energy, or libido, motivates the individual to search for solutions. The goal becomes a release of the tension, which transforms as

increased awareness or a new insight and a sense of calm that comes from rebalancing the opposing functions within the nervous system.

Haule's (2011) solution was to encourage practices that tolerate experiences of the non-ordinary to aid in the transformative process. Jung (1963/1989) also endorsed tolerance and the importance of the reconciliation of the opposites:

> human intolerance and shortsightedness are to blame for the open conflict that ultimately broke out between faith [irrational] and knowledge [rational]. Conflict or comparison between incommensurables is impossible. The only possible attitude is one of mutual toleration, for neither can deprive the other of its validity. (para. 150)

The function of brain and psyche is to reduce conflict (Haule, 2011). The role of the left brain is to invalidate its irrational right brain opponent. If creative experiences lean more to the orientation of the right brain, then "all of our [Western] cultural training resists transformation" (p. 168) when the comfort zone of Western culture is oriented to left brain logic and pragmatism.

Pragmatism must be deprogrammed through a retraining of neuropathways that are counter to the cultural norms of the West to facilitate transformative experiences. Jung pointed out there is no standard of comparison or measurement, only tolerance. Haule (2011) suggested, "Unconscious, unintegrated material will appear to the ego as non-ordinary, even absurd" (p. 169) unless there is a fascination that alters the state of consciousness because one's interest in the non-ordinary becomes aroused. This arousal initiates a heightened level of energy that alters the mind and makes psychological change possible and conceivable. Horses often attract a fascination that is non-ordinary through their beauty, stature, grace, strength, and willingness to relate to humans.

A horse present with a client in a psychotherapy session can become a non-ordinary experience that is attractive and compelling enough to spark a sympathetic nervous system response and ignite a new gradient of energy that creates a charged atmosphere. A simultaneous

presentation of the familiar psychotherapy session with the unfamiliar presence of a horse creates the energy needed for an integrative state of consciousness due to an increase in neural connections associated with new experiences that are positive (Miller-Karas, 2015). Rhythmic, patterned, repetitive, experiences of the non-ordinary are needed to make transformative impressions on the structure of the brain.

The left brain linear and logical orientation that is so ingrained in Western culture challenges the acceptance of the non-ordinary. Jung (1953/1977) explained:

> A psychology that satisfies the intellect alone can never be practical, for the totality of the psyche can never be grasped by intellect alone…because the psyche seeks an expression that will embrace its total nature." (para. 201)

Habitual attitudes need to be destabilized, according to Haule (2011), through a process of self-questioning and reevaluation of ordinary assumptions. This process becomes the gateway for further exploration of new experiences like adding a yoga practice, reading a book, psychotherapy with equines, art therapy, travel to a foreign country, or trying a new sport. Haule said, "The accumulation of experiences that conflict with consensus reality is what 'ripens' the psyche for change." The will to direct steady conscious attention in two directions at once until "a compelling course of action is revealed" (p. 168) creates an atmosphere charged and ready for the transcendent function.

The four stages of analytical psychology reviewed through a neuroscientific perspective was intended to lay the foundation for a continued investigation into the specific psychodynamic components important to the understanding of Jungian psychology used synonymously with analytical psychology. The neurobiology of relationships will continue to inform the research as a method for bringing Jung's ideas into partnership with recent developments that support his theories and understanding of psychic functioning.

The Transcendent Function and Individuation

The phenomenon and experience of the *transcendent function* has been explained and functionally broken down through the contemporary views and research of John Ryan Haule (2011). Haule's research supports the existence and function of psychic structures proposed by Jung a century ago. The transformative and integrative states of consciousness, which Jung (1971/1990) described as the *transcendent function*, can now be tracked as harmonious neural functioning in the brain. Haule wrote, "By contrast [to ordinary states of consciousness], transformative or integrative states cannot be co-opted, for they decommission the ordinary and bring about a radical reorganization of brain and psyche" (p. 168). It is the transformative system within the psyche that partners with the archetype, a form of unconscious energy, and brings relief in the form of clarity and purpose when the ego tolerates ambivalence and uncertainty.

It is difficult at times to know if Jung is referring to the transcendent function or individuation since both are so closely linked to one another. They are reviewed together for a deeper understanding of their relationship and interdependence. Jung (1971/1990) defined the transcendent function as complex:

> I have called this process in its totality the *transcendent function,* "function" being here understood not as a basic function but as a complex function made up of other functions, and "transcendent" not as denoting a metaphysical quality but merely the fact that this function facilitates a transition from one attitude to another. (para. 828)

The transcendent function becomes a practice within the process of individuation, a psychological development for the fulfillment of one's unique qualities and purpose. Jung (1953/1977) further defined the transcendent function much like he does individuation as a "true labour, a work which involves both action and suffering" (para. 121).

Jung (1953/1977) credited the natural process of individuation as the guide for developing his method of treatment with the goal of revealing the full potential of the personality

unique to the individual. Individuation becomes a corrective measure to a one-sided conscious position and brings awareness to unconscious aspects in need of synthesis with the conscious position. Jung wrote:

> So every man [person] whose fate it is to go his [her] individual way must proceed with hopefulness and watchfulness, ever conscious of his [her] loneliness and its dangers. The peculiarity of the way here described is largely due to the fact that in psychology, which springs from and acts upon real life, we can no longer appeal to the narrowly intellectual, scientific standpoint, but are driven to take account of the standpoint of feeling, and consequently of everything that the psyche actually contains. (para. 201)

The mental functioning of the individual, Jung (1960/1981) believed, relies on various and multiple psychic functions working together to achieve the same end, wholeness, as a self-directed quest.

Haule (2011) is interested in Jung's work on incongruent inner and outer emotional states to further the psychic agenda by introducing the idea of "destabilizing normality" (p.168). Haule described the importance of simply questioning one's fixed beliefs to invite in new perspectives that decommission the everyday and invite in manifestations of new potential. He wrote, "Therefore any practices that encourage tolerance for the non-ordinary will surely assist the process of transformation" (p. 168-169). Jung and Haule taught the necessity of entertaining the non-ordinary to override the habitual attitude:

> For the collective psyche shows the same pattern of change as the psyche of the individual. So long as all goes well and all our psychic energies find an outlet in adequate and well-regulated ways, we are disturbed by nothing from within. No uncertainty or doubt besets us, and we *cannot* be divided against ourselves…Only then, in this situation of distress, do we discover the psyche as something which thwarts our will, which is strange and even hostile to us, and which is incompatible with our conscious standpoint. (Jung, 1964/1978, para. 160)

Distress and confusion result when the inner condition seeks something different from the outer condition. The unconscious drives the internally directed desire influenced by the archetype. The ego drives the externally directed desire to maintain the status quo of the persona. The conflict

that arises between opposing internal and external position creates turmoil. The distress that results becomes the creative catalyst for a new understanding to emerge to further the individual psychic agenda.

The choice to regulate the tension of opposing energies becomes a neurobiological process that optimizes the breaking system available in the parasympathetic nervous system. Conversely, the choice not to resolve the tension through conscious regulation, bypasses any pause to assess a situation for an appropriate response, hits the accelerator available in the sympathetic nervous system, and without consulting the thinking function accesses and mobilizes the lower regions of the brain programmed to react. Deficits in executive functioning can set the individual up for faulty perceptions in their social environment, which can trigger impulsive and reactive responses originating in lower versus higher brain functioning.

Neuroscience is helping to uncover executive functioning deficits so appropriate neuropsychological interventions can be integrated into treatment to help encourage choices made from higher functioning regions of the brain. Jung explained, "We know with tolerable certainty that disturbance of certain portions of the brain brings about corresponding psychic defects. The spinal cord and the brain consist essentially of interconnections between the sensory and motor tracts, the so-called reflex arcs" (1960/1981, para. 607). Jung seemed to grasp the body-brain connection in 1926 when this was first published and delivered in a series of lectures on the theme of *Nature and Spirit.* Jung was also keenly aware of the individual's innate impetus to thrive. Further, Haule (2011) wrote:

> Our body is not an inanimate machine in need of some other kind of substance to move it and give it life. Our body lives on its own, and the complex processes that comprise the life of its cells, tissues and organs are the psychoid elements whose integration is our psyche. (p. 82)

Haule saw psyche as the process of the whole of humankind and of the individual. Haule's impetus to bring Jung into the twenty-first century helps to reorient Jung's psychodynamic theory and his theory of the archetypes at a time when Jung's contributions can perhaps be more easily understood and meaningful through recent developments in neuroscience.

The application of analytical psychology can appear in stages as a principled method of tension and release by which a transformative process unfolds. The new attitude of the client that often arises through participation in the analytical process is only sufficient to the point where another new adaptation is needed in response to one's environment (Jung, 1960/1981, para.143). The client begins to learn that a continuation of adjustments throughout life is the expectation and a well-adapted response delivers the release of pressure that the flow of life demands. Jung (1954/1985) also saw the individual as merely a collective being with approximations of individuality based on inheritance, culture, and unique imprints of experience that develop through engagement in relationship to oneself and others.

The aim of individuation is to rid one's self of the false wrappings of the persona and to increase one's awareness of the suggestive influence of the unconscious (Jung, 1953/1977, para. 269). For Jung (1960/1981) and others, the hero-figure is the personification of the internal call to individuate. He wrote:

> Individuation means becoming an "in-dividual," and, in so far as "individuality" embraces our innermost, last, and incomparable uniqueness, it also implies becoming one's own self. We could therefore translate individuation as "coming to selfhood" or "self-realization." (Jung, 1953/1977, para. 266)

The natural process of individuation served as a model and guiding principle for analytical psychology (Jung, 1953/1977). The fear of individuation, the loneliness, and isolation one experiences when the task of differentiation is accepted, and the unknown path is chosen, was familiar to Jung in his own life. The fear one experiences may be related to the personal or

professional risks that are taken which may be contrary or unpopular to the status quo of the individual's familial or social environment. Individuation often entails choosing the unconventional path.

The fulfillment of the individual's unique psychological agenda becomes the life's work that few understand or share. Individuation is also a psychic process central to the psychological health of the individual. The goal of the individual is coming to terms with the unconscious, "for the unconscious is not this thing or that; it is the Unknown as it immediately affects us" (Jung, 1960/1981, p.68). Jung approached how one integrates unconscious contents into consciousness as a psychological function and one that requires practice.

Jung called the union of opposites the transcendent function, a practice in how to come to terms with the unconscious. He viewed the transcendent function as vital to the individuation process, present in relationship to the functional purposes of the archetype and capable of embracing the division in conscious states in service to the deepest foundational aspects of the personality (1964/1970). It takes the form of a symbol or image for the archetype to be perceived by the conscious mind. Every unperceivable archetype is also a potential symbol to be observed or experienced consciously. The mission of the transcendent function is to access a symbolic solution that is in accordance with individual's innate agenda. The experience of analytical psychology shows the "lack of parallelism" (1960/1981, para. 132) between the compensatory and complementary position of the unconscious toward consciousness to be purposeful and dynamic for the following reasons:

1. "Consciousness possesses a threshold intensity that its contents must have attained, so that all elements that are too weak remain in the unconscious" (Jung, 1960/1981, para. 132). Neuroscience helps explain the threshold intensity of consciousness as the need of the individual

to engage the higher regions of the brain where one can reflect consciously or creatively, attempt focused consideration, muse, weigh in on what-if scenarios, imagine, visualize and problem solve; mental practices that engage both left and right brain faculties noted previously by Stevens (2002/2012). Weaker elements lacking the intensity from a conscious standpoint reside in the unconscious where untrained reactive responses are impulsively generated. This coincides with lower brain functioning found in the brain stem where survival modes of functioning are shared with non-human mammals.

The directedness of a conscious mind has within its capacity not only to inhibit weaker elements but also the ability to lend its intensity. Discernment can provide a threshold intensity to screen ideas incompatible with the conscious attitude as they are naturally presented. Discernment provides a dual conscious function of holding a protective boundary while also creating an opening for a fuller understanding of the meaning within a novel experience. Discernment straddles the borders on both sides of the psychic boundary. Those capable of discernment as a mental process may be the individual invested in their own unique journey as part of and separate from the cultural norms of a conventional life. They may also be practiced in holding the tension that discernment brings in reaching a decision that serves a higher level of personal or collective consciousness. Jung (1956/1975) encouraged striking a healthy balance and practice between conscious will and natural impulse by regulating upper and lower brain functioning:

> Instead of instinctive certainty there is uncertainty and consequently the need for a discerning, evaluating, selecting, discriminating consciousness. If the latter succeeds in compensating the instinctive certainty, it will increasingly substitute reliable rules and modes of behavior for instinctive action and intuition. (para. 673)

The act of natural impulse needs to be both cultivated and subdued to avoid separating consciousness from its instinctual foundations. Discernment develops from a psychological need and a moral position.

Consciousness has brought many developments in science, medicine, technology, and engineering that have advanced civilizations and humankind. Jung (960/1981) wrote, "We may say in general that social worthlessness increases to the degree that these qualities are impaired by the unconscious" (para. 135). These advances made possible through consciousness can also be used to destroy and devastate if guided by an unconscious standpoint.

Stevens (2002/2012) felt the opposite poles of morality gave direction to the human condition, the lack of which breeds dissension and dismantles the unity that binds social and personal responsibility. Stevens wrote, "The moral condition is incumbent upon every one of us, but none more than the political leaders of the world who…now hold the destiny of the solar system in their hands" (p. 277). Stevens added that with little exception, world leaders are deficient in the areas of insight and humility and therefore individuation is also stunted. This contributes to the moral decay of civilizations and the decline of natural resources.

Stevens (2002/2012) understood Jung to believe that reconciliation of the two moral poles to be possible if conscious suffering of the tension between good and evil could be tolerated and *transcended.* It is here Stevens uses the phrase, "the problem is raised to a higher plane" (p. 277) where resolution of the conflict can be achieved. He returned to the two hemispheres of the brain and their particular strengths and characteristics to explain the process of reconciliation between opposites and the resolution of this tension. Stevens suggested, based on neurological advances in the 1970s, symbols may carry a transcendent function through the connecting neural fibers called the corpus callosum. The corpus callosum serves a function

similar to the symbol creating a bridge through which the left and right cerebral hemispheres of the brain can connect and synthesize the functioning unique to each hemisphere. This synthesis facilitates the understanding of an experience through perception, sensations, emotions, and insight, rational and non-rational modes of apprehending knowledge.

Returning to the discussion of analytical psychology and its "lack of parallelism" (Jung, 1960/1981, para. 132) between the compensatory and complementary position of the unconscious toward the conscious Jung asserted.

2. Jung (1960/1981) wrote, "Consciousness, because of its directed functions, exercises an inhibition" of material that would be perceived to be incompatible with the conscious attitude and therefore slips out of awareness (para. 132). Jung cautioned of the more permeable partition between consciousness and the unconscious common in individuals that lack differentiation and live anchored to a one-sided perspective. Individuation requires faithful stewardship to one's unique path and the mental flexibility that can tolerate perspectives that are incompatible with their own. Jung wrote, "The patient is unconscious of the fact that the obstacle to be overcome lies in herself; namely, a boundary-line that is difficult to cross and hinders further progress" (1953/1977, para. 132). Developing a conscious inhibited view through discernment respects the permeable partition between the conscious and the unconscious so boundaries can be explored with the care and guidance of a psychotherapist.

3. Jung (1960/1981) believed, "Consciousness constitutes the momentary process of adaptation, whereas the unconscious contains not only all the forgotten material of the individual's own past, but all the inherited behavior traces constituting the structure of the mind" (para. 132). Re-membering content, once conscious, can become a neurophysiological and emotional experience that needs careful assimilation. Miller-Karas (2015) added, "In the case of

trauma, the body remembers and stores sensations associated with traumatic experiences even when memories cannot be verbally expressed" (p. 70). Trauma-related cues can trigger implicit memory and physiological reactions even when threat does not exist. Depending on the severity of the implicit memory, the buried experience may be triggered spontaneously to engage the survival brain signaling the nervous system to mobilize. Trauma victims, when on high alert, become less discerning. Their appraisal system malfunctions and the potential threat is not accurately interpreted.

4. Jung (1960/1981) asserted, "The unconscious contains all the fantasy combinations which have not yet attained the threshold intensity, but which in the course of time and under suitable conditions will enter the light of consciousness" (para. 132). Jung (1954/1985) further defined fantasy as "spontaneous psychic activity" (para. 125). For example, the scientist or researcher who may spend many conscious hours searching for a solution to a problem only to have it appear in the liminal space between dreaming and waking mental states.

Jung encouraged the use of a practical psychology that views each human being as an individual, not as a homogeneous psyche although Jung believed each of his four stages of analytical psychology to be a general truth (1954/1985). He cautioned against intellectualizing treatment, "for the totality of the psyche can never be grasped by intellect alone…because the psyche seeks an expression that will embrace its total nature" (para. 432). It seemed important to Jung (1960/1981) for individuation to be understood not as an endorsement for the individual to withdraw from the world, but for the individual to develop a courageous humility as an invitation to the world.

Archetypes

The drive for individuation is archetypal, in the sense that each individual has within one's nature the full capacity to actualize and receive unconscious influence for the development of latent potentiality. Jung used wholeness to refer to the health and well-being of the individual, which included the task of assimilating unconscious aspects into conscious awareness. Jung (1960/1981, para. 435) believed archetypes to be typical modes of behavior as *an inborn idea* presented naturally to the conscious mind and instrumental to the individuation process. Archetypes have an organizing principle on images and ideas that create an embodied experience by the individual who encounters them: "So it is not surprising that when an archetypal situation occurs we suddenly feel an extraordinary sense of release, as though transported, or caught by an overwhelming power (Jung, 1978/1966, para. 128).

An encounter with an archetype via a symbol or an image gives way to an increase in self-awareness that is felt on an emotional, sensory, and somatic level. It is almost as if the body becomes suspended in the release of energy and tension that follows. Jung's empirical understanding of the archetype will be explored with a more current explanation of their biology and function through the work of John Ryan Haule (2011), and Anthony Stevens (2002/2012).

Both Haule (2011) and Stevens (2002/2012) are Jungian analysts interested in Jung's evolving work on the archetypes through advances in neuroscience. Haule stated, "This integrative/transformative state of consciousness is an archetypal pattern in the sense that all humans are capable of experiencing it" (p. 174) and Stevens defined the archetype as "'innate neuropsychic potential'" (p. 284) and added that he was talking about "the *archetype-as-such* which is actualized in the form of archetypal images, motifs, ideas, relationships and behaviours" (p. 284) and not the manifestations of the archetypes. Jung's (1960/1981) references to the

archetypes throughout *The Collected Works* are many and varied such that an understanding of their meaning hangs in the balance of what Jung was able to comprehend. The nature of the archetype, as Jung explained, requires continuous approximations of their meaning and purpose as they are experienced. The archetype's esoteric conceptualization in the past seems to be shifting to a broader understanding through recent interest and developments in neuroscience.

One such description of the archetypes is "intuitive modes of apprehension" (Jung, 1961/1980, para. 279). Jung (1961/1980) further wrote, "The exaggerated actions due to the interference of instinct are caused by intuitive modes of apprehension actuated by archetypes and all too likely to lead to over-intense and often distorted impressions" (para. 279). Jung explained analytical psychology to be concerned "with disturbances of conscious apprehension," influenced by the collective unconscious, which Jung posited to be "the sum of the instincts and their correlates, the archetypes" (para. 279-281):

> Archetypes are typical modes of apprehension, and wherever we meet with uniform and regularly recurring modes of apprehension we are dealing with an archetype, no matter whether its mythological character is recognized or not. (para. 280)

Jung described intuition as an unconscious process that erupts into consciousness as "a sudden idea or hunch" (para. 269).

Archetypes, in relationship to the instincts, appear to have at their energetic will and disposal: intuition, synchronicity, dream images, fantasy, metaphor, and symbols as the medium for transmitting something unknown to the individual. The manifestation of an archetype speaks metaphorically of something unknown and occurs through personification in the form of an image or symbol. Jung (1953/1977) explained:

> The work involved in analytical treatment gives rise to experiences of an archetypal nature which require to be expressed and shaped…the experience of the archetype is frequently guarded as the closest personal secret, because it is felt to strike into the very core of one's being. (para. 119)

Jung (1960/1981) viewed the unconscious, "as the totality of all archetypes…the deposit of all human experience right back to its remotest beginnings… the source for the instincts, for the archetypes are simply the forms which the instincts assume" (, para. 339). It is the existence of the archetypes that Haule (2011) postulated to be generated by inherited brain structures. Haule's (2011) mission has been to demystify the existence of the archetype through reliance on modern biology: "It [the archetype] would have to be inherited with our DNA and give rise to typical brain structures whose employment correlates with the behaviors ascribed to the archetype" (p.12-13).

Haule's research runs parallel with Jung (1960/1981) who wrote, "the collective unconscious contains the whole spiritual heritage of mankind's evolution, born anew in the brain structure of every individual"(para. 342). Jung believed the archetypes to inspire the greatest historical ideas in science, philosophy, and ethics. Haule (2011) suggested Jung's purpose, behind the idea of the archetype, was to support "the hunch that all humans have a fundamentally similar manner of organizing and interpreting the world" (p. 11), which Jung found to be reflected in mythology. Haule interpreted this to mean the archetypes help by providing a *structuring principle* that is unconscious.

The archetype's influence is experienced as internal stimuli, which typically surpasses a subjective understanding, "archetypes guide our perceptions and behavior, often without our awareness" (Haule, 2011, p.11). Archetypes encourage a non-rational interpretation of experience with a richness that includes sensory stimuli not experienced in a more conventional form of comprehension. Haule's (2011) research is helpful in facilitating a distinction Jung (1960/1981) made between the function of the instinct, as a form of action, and the function of the archetype, as a form of apprehension. Jung acknowledged both instincts and archetypes to be

collective phenomenon, and “here we are faced with the same difficulty…we are so accustomed to operating with conventional and self-evident concepts that we are no longer conscious of the extent to which they are based on archetypal modes of perception” ((para. 274)). Jung seems to make this point to demonstrate how qualifying or quantifying a phenomenological experience of the instincts and archetypes encourages a rationalistic standpoint. This runs counter to unconventional modes of apprehension offered by the archetypes that enrich one’s experience.

Jung (1960/1981, para. 604-607) wrote, from an empirical view, about the body and psyche as a living process with purpose; the body as an adaptive system “is a phenomenon of the living being apprehended by our senses” (para. 605), and Jung saw the corresponding necessity of the psychic factor as purposive. Jung continued making biological and psychological references that associate brain disturbance with corresponding psychic defects, and brain and spinal cord interconnectedness dependent on sensory and motor systems which create a reflexive response. The point Jung (1960/1981) seems to be making is the reflexive response occurs so spontaneously that the conscious perception of the experience is registered as an image after the experience has completed a rapid biological process.

It is here that Jung described how conscious images are experienced by means of auditory, visual, and feeling stimulus. Jung referred to the senses separately, “for it is the function of consciousness not only to recognize and assimilate the external world through the gateway of the senses, but to translate into visible reality the world within us” (para. 342). Jung’s view aligns with Siegel’s (2007) seventh sense defined as mind sight and eighth sense of relational resonance reviewed earlier. The research of Miller-Karas (2015) encourages the awareness of the body’s sensory language as a method to regulate emotional affect, “ultimately,

the brainstem responds to sensation and body memory and not to language and conscious thought" (p. 19). The brainstem houses the reflexive instinctual responses.

Automatic sensory information continues to function while the rest of the brain, consciousness, is off-line. This suggests, archetypes and instincts are oriented in the lower regions of the primitive brain, or brainstem, to allow for perpetual on-line unconscious functioning. This may account for the production of dream images during sleeping states. This may also suggest that the *sensory gateway* and threshold between conscious and unconscious functioning are one in the same. If an individual is asleep and consciousness is off-line, the unconscious energy value appears to have more liberty to cross into threshold and gateway territory with visual representation of the inner world.

Jung (1960/1981) clearly denoted an image as merely a representation, "I therefore call all conscious contents images, since they are reflections of processes in the brain" (para. 608). Archetypes have an organizing influence on images and ideas that create an embodied experience for those who encounter them. Haule (2011) attributes this quality to numinosity, "the irresistible emotional force that arrests our attention and move us to what moments before seemed quite unthinkable" (p. 45). It is this vital force of the archetype that Jung compared to the mythological appeal of the gods. Haule explained the affective nature and numinous quality of the archetype, which helps to clarify Jung's attempt to articulate their elusive quality. Archetypes are capable of this "numinous effect" or "luminosity," both terms used by Jung (1960/1981, para. 841) to describe a loading of psychic energy.

The conscious energy is reallocated momentarily, while an individual may become transfixed due to the affective state held in a liminal space between conscious and unconscious positions. This state of suspension creates "a loss of conscious energy so that the awareness is

narrowed down to the archetypal theme" (Haule, 2011, p.45). The weakened conscious orientation allows the unconscious to assume the energetic value suspended by consciousness and "find expression in the affect" (Jung, 1960/1981, para. 841). Jung mentioned synchronicity as a phenomenon bound up with this quality of expression by the archetype.

Jung, (1960/1981) believed the confusing aspects of psychic content to be explainable due to the relative space-time continuum, "as soon as a psychic content crosses the threshold of consciousness, the synchronistic marginal phenomena disappear, time and space resume their accustomed sway, and consciousness is once more isolated in its subjectivity" (para. 440). Jung believed synchronistic occurrences to be more common than uncommon. Stevens (2002/2012) described synchronicity as a "dance transcending the world of mind and matter…an *acausal orderedness* dependent upon archetypal functioning" (pp. 86-87).

What seems important to this research study is what Jung (1960/1981) said later about how emotional states affectively alter space and time when an event is observed unrestricted, "there is a certain narrowing of consciousness and a corresponding strengthening of the unconscious which, particularly in the case-of-strong affects, is noticeable even to the layman" (para. 856). Jung followed this statement with details of this psychic transaction where the affective "tone of the unconscious is heightened" allowing instinctual impulses and contents to shape a behavioral response loaded with emotional affect. This seems to be what Haule (2011) referred to as the "archetypal theme" (p. 45).

Jung (1960/1981) encouraged the need to let go of a cause and effect explanation in these events and accept "an inexplicable 'knowledge,' or 'immediacy' of psychic images" (para. 856). This type of knowledge is also referred to as "tacit knowledge" a synchronous ordering that is perceptible as "knowledge based on body and connection" (Rowland, 2012, p.36). Susan

Rowland, professor, writer on Jung, literary theory, and gender, understood "Jung's synchronicity is the notion of an ordering in nature accessible to the human psyche" (p. 36).

This type of knowledge grounded in the body forgoes the need for articulation and seeks a creative generative force for expression. Knowledge may be transferred in a way that is not verbalized but relies on the body as a mechanism of expression. Jung's urging to accept the inexplicable forms of knowledge is essential to the process of individuation and key to dynamics that arise in the horse-human interaction. This type of knowledge develops through an awareness of nuances in human to human, or human to nonhuman communication that is nonverbal and comprehended through the senses. Tacit knowledge also facilitates a connection to the natural world and creates a shared space with the animals.

A tenet of affective neuroscience posits that processes of emotions, also experienced subjectively as a feeling state, set off a "causal chain of events" influencing behavioral actions of animals and humans which occur as a neurobiological event (Panksepp, 1998, p. 14). Panksepp, an affective neuroscientist, researches the science of emotions in animals as a way of understanding human emotion. He identifies similarities at the bottom of the brain and differences at the higher regions of the brain between humans and animals (Panksepp, 2014, [video file]). Panksepp referred to humans as cognitive creatures and animals as emotional creatures. Jung (1960/1981, para. 25) knew humans to have

> a highly differentiated subjective system for recognizing and evaluating affective phenomena in others. There is present in each of us a direct instinct for registering this, which animals also possess in high degree, with respect not only to their own species but also to other animals and human beings. We can perceive the slightest emotional fluctuations in others and have a very fine feeling for the quality and quantity of affects in our fellow-men.

Jung's statement supports Porges and Geller (2014) research and findings on the polyvagal theory. Although Panksepp refers to a causal link between affective states in humans

and animals which drive behaviors, affective states and related emotional processes appear transient in an open neurobiological system designed for rapid and unpredictable fluctuations.

These feeling-toned events, that take place at the neural level, mediate, and modulate the instinctual nature of human and animal tendencies to act. Panksepp (1998) wrote, "Subjectively experienced feelings arise, ultimately, from the interactions of various emotional systems with the fundamental brain substrates of 'the self'" (p.14). These emotional systems serve adaptive functions as part of the evolutionary history of mammals. Emotional states charge the brain to synchronize various neural events. Behavioral and cognitive responses to archetypal survival problems are coordinated as general types of affective experiences. Panksepp assumed that emotional states mediate learned behavioral changes, sustain certain unconditioned behavioral tendencies, and guide new behaviors.

The natural "internal value-coding" driven by emotions creates a "self-referential salience" that humans and non-humans internalize and use to guide and inform future behavioral responses (Panksepp, 1998, p.14). Species-typical diversity has evolved in higher brain functioning and lower motor and sensory systems although "the basic affective value systems, deep within ancient recesses of the brain, appear to be reasonably well conserved across mammalian species" (1998, p. 303-304). Panksepp's findings align with Jung's theory of the archetypes as inherited modes of patterned behaviors and feeling-toned affective states as part of the collective unconscious:

> The term I chose for this, namely "archetype" therefore coincides with the biological concept of the "pattern of behaviors." In no sense is it a question of inherited ideas, but of inherited, instinctive impulses and forms that can be observed in all living creatures. (Jung, 1960/1976, para. 565)

The hope would be that the self-referential system guides the individual choice toward a well-adapted emotional and behavioral response that advances relationships and consciousness.

Stevens' (2002/2012) and Panksepp's (1998) research and ideas parallel and intersect across species. Stevens also referred to the existence of a "self-regulating propensity" (p.84) that is generative, discernable, and privileged to all organisms. Stevens (2002/2012) pointed out that "Jung declined to attribute to human beings a monopoly on consciousness" and "he rejected the ruthlessly anthropocentric prejudice which maintains that the only mental phenomena are human and that, therefore, such phenomena by definition, cannot be experienced by animals" (p. 84). Stevens appears to agree with Jung that animals are privileged to also have mental faculties like humans. Each living system responds in relationship to a forward trajectory operating in tandem with the intention of the archetype, Stevens believes, to be encoded in the gene as the process of *individuation* with consciousness as the goal.

The "self-referential salience" Panksepp suggested (1998, p. 14), appears to parallel the function of Jung's *Self* as a primary and directive archetype in the unconscious. Rowland (2012) suggested, "Evidently, the evolution of living, breathing beings is all about change. Evolution proves not to work via cause and effect, and is not a closed system" (p. 77). The archetypes are capable of energetically bridging the collective unconscious to the preconscious liminal space as potentials of affective expression whether they are ideas, creative inspiration, or moments of clarity. An expressed affective state can be synchronous to a new conscious awareness and an associated image.

The integration of conscious and unconscious psychic components in an open system is explained through the science of complexity, already considered by Siegel (2007) in his research on attunement. Complexity science becomes evident again through tacit knowledge. A method of knowing that is in relationship to Jung's intuitive modes of apprehension and the interdependent reliance of one psychic function on another. Tacit knowledge refers to a complexity that cannot

be comprehended in the moment it is occurring like the function of the archetypes (Rowland, 2012). The relationships between analytical psychology, biology, neuroscience, and other related areas of research dedicated to pushing the boundaries of conventional and unconventional methods of acquiring and sharing knowledge are converging in a complex system that is multidimensional and dynamic.

These relationships are forming a complex system committed to advancing the overall understanding of the interconnectedness of human and non-human nature and the sciences. Rowland (2012) wrote, "The science of complexity was born to examine evolution that is non-linear, where a small cause can produce profound unpredictable effects" (p. 77). This is evident in Panksepp's (1998) findings and assumptions. What is interesting is Jung (1960/1981, para. 49) referred to the psyche as a "relatively closed system" due to the equalizing difference of transformations of energy. Perhaps Jung meant this only in terms of psychic energy equalizing for example in terms of transcendence or synchronicity. The psyche seems to be a relatively open system in many other ways. A broader examination of tacit knowledge and complexity theory is beyond the scope of this research although its salience is reflected in this study.

Haule (2011) defined an archetype as "a species specific behavior pattern that recognizes and imagines the settings in which the behavior is an appropriate response," is "inherited with our genes as an empty program" (p. 62) and responds to stimuli that over time is shaped by a process of socialization. Stevens, (2002/2012, p. 73) referred to Jung's psychosomatic model as a phylogenetic structure comprised of archetypal units that link the actualization of the archetypes to the personality development of the individual. This process is known as individuation and expressed biologically.

Stevens (2002/2012) reestablishes Jung's commitment to the individual as a whole system, an unknowable single entity based on combinations of symmetry and polarity. Jung's principle of individuation, Stevens felt, to be useful outside the analytic container as "an evolutionary principle universally present throughout nature; a dynamic potentiality active within the cells of every organism working towards the goal of self-completion" (p. 83). Stevens believed Jung to have an archetypal model that could potentially unify the biological sciences and science as a whole. Jung's boldest contribution was to propose the psychoid nature of the archetype. This meant the structure of the archetypes "were fundamental to the existence of all living organisms, and that they were continuous with structures controlling the behaviour of inorganic matter" (p. 80). Jung (1960/1981, para. 420), proposes the location of the archetype to be "beyond the psychic sphere, analogous to the position of the physiological instinct." This connects the archetype within the substance of the organism whereby creating a bridge through its psychoid nature to matter in general.

The *psychoid* is known only indirectly and refers to the unconscious as a "fluid state of affairs" (Jung, 1960/1981, para. 382). Jung explained the gradual transformation of the archetype from a biological instinct into the physiology of the organism that merges into the chemical and physical aspects of the organism:

> Although our inheritance consists of physiological pathways, it was nevertheless mental processes in our ancestors that traced them. If they come to consciousness again in the individual they can do so only in the form of other mental processes; and although these processes can become conscious only through individual experience and consequently appear as individual acquisitions, they are nevertheless pre-existent pathways which are merely "filled out" by individual experience. (Jung, 1960/1981, para. 100)

Jung continued this thought by suggesting every impressive experience one encounters is a "break-through into an old, previously unconscious river-bed" (Jung, 1960/1981, para. 100). This biological process describes the archetype as an experience driven dynamic force.

Stevens (2002/2012) traced the evolution of an original template that formed from inorganic gases replicating itself bringing stability to an unstable world of infinite variety of organic forms:

> Thus the replicator was the original biological archetype – the first structure from which copies could be made; and we see in the replicator and its copies the primordial archetypal quality, namely, that of stability and invariance. (p. 81-82)

Stevens described the manifestation of the *perfect biological principle* as "the self-replication of the gene" that "popped out" during a pub conversation between Francis Crick and James Watson for which a Nobel Prize was awarded for their discovery of the structure of DNA.

The replicable archetype of the species relies on a characteristic patterning of matter. Jung's archetypal model, Stevens (2002/2012, p. 83) posited, offers the potential for unifying biological sciences, science as a whole, and extends Jung's principle of individuation beyond the individual. Individuation becomes not only a psychological imperative for the development of the individual, "but an evolutionary principle universally present throughout nature; a dynamic potentiality active within the cells of every organism working towards the goals of self-completion" (Stevens, 2002/2012, p. 83).

Another emerging science that shares Stevens (2002/2012) enthusiasm for a characteristic patterning of matter is the field of epigenetics. David Moore (2015, p. 6-7), a developmental cognitive neuroscientist is devoted to exploring epigenetic factors in human development. Epigenetics has become more established in the field of biology and has created momentum in other related disciplines such as psychology, philosophy, and oncology. Moore postulated the things attached to DNA referred to as *epigenetic marks* influence the functioning of DNA in ways that are critical to the development of individual characteristics or traits. Some of these epigenetic marks are believed to be impacted by individual experience and environment such as

diet, maternal and paternal behaviors. This idea has been substantiated through the Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) study (Felitti, Anda, & Nordenberg, 1998).

The release of the ACE study (Felitti et al., 1998) relates the leading cause of death in adults to adverse childhood experiences. The higher the number of adverse childhood experiences the higher the risk of an early death. These risks included social, emotional, and cognitive impairment, the adoption of health-risk behaviors, which research suggests were typically used as unhealthy coping strategies to deal with exposure to adverse childhood experiences. These adverse experiences were reported as emotional, physical, or sexual abuse, divorce, household members abusing drugs or alcohol, caregivers that were mentally ill, suicidal, or incarcerated. More than half of the almost 14,000 study participants surveyed reported as least one adverse childhood experience and a quarter of the participants reported two or more.

The number of adverse experiences showed a graded relationship of adult health risk behaviors and diseases such as alcoholism, drug abuse, depression, suicide attempts, increased smoking, sexually transmitted disease, severe obesity, heart disease, cancer, lung disease, skeletal fractures, and liver disease. Felitti et al. (1998) reported:

> The seven categories of adverse childhood experiences were strongly interrelated and persons with multiple categories of childhood exposure were likely to have multiple health risk factors later in life. (p. 245)

If individual experience and parental behaviors influence epigenetic marks, the ACE study is a predictor of genetic outcomes and a dismal collective inheritance if this trend continues. This is also a concern of complexity science as Wendy Wheeler (2006) suggested:

> Not only has the inheritance of acquired characteristics been shown to be possible, but such epigenetic inheritance indicates our inseparable lived relation to our environment, including our cultural environment…if what we feel and experience both biologically and psychobiologically is capable of heritability, this has far-reaching social, ethical and political implications. (p.14)

How DNA, proteins, and other molecules in our cells contribute to our psychological traits have only recently come into focus (Moore, 2015). Epigenetics can provide a window into how characteristics and traits develop not as an either-or argument of nature versus nurture, but how they arise from both. According to Moore (2015), "The nature-versus-nurture debate is passé, because scientists now understand that genetic factors and situational factors both always play roles in the development of our traits" (p. 5), including the molecules of DNA inherited from parents. Moore broke down the etymology of epigenesis. *Epi* originates from the Greek root meaning *above*, or *on top of*, which Moore interpreted to mean factors above the genes that influence genetic functioning and development. These factors also include nongenetic factors like social contexts and those referenced in the ACE study (Felitti et al., 1998).

Moore's (2015) work focused on a two-way exchange of influence in behavioral epigenetics that examines how molecular biology influences psychological states and how psychological states influence molecular biology. The field of epigenesis also relies on the integration of other sciences and factors that work on top of or above the genes. This form of functioning resembles the relationship found between the archetypes and instincts and the nonlinear interrelated dynamic of a complex system.

The archetype, as an inherited mode of behavior, is believed to be a necessary component of biology and vital to one's psychic economy (Jung, 1959/1990). As such, it is a psychic economy that is an open system of energy exchange even though the energy may be equalized in the exchange. The archetype expresses the instinct on which it is grounded through individual experience and perceptions that develop and linger from that embodied experience. Rowland (2012), encourages a new understanding of perception in relationship to how images emerge: "Imagined images are equally valuable as perceptual ones, for they nurture the health of the

dreaming and creating psyche" (p. 45). To truly understand them, perceptions need to be sorted between an ego perceived image that is sensory driven and an image that is driven by the influence of an archetype and creatively imagined.

Sensations are a physiological form of communication through the medium of the body originating from an environmental cue that may not be conscious although the sensation alerts one to its presence. Jung (1960/1981) offered:

> whereas the sense-perceptions can be related to probable or possible sensory stimuli below the threshold of consciousness, this "knowledge," or the "immediacy" of unconscious images, either has no recognizable foundation, or else we find that there are recognizable causal connections with certain already existing, and often archetypal, contents. But these images, whether rooted in an already existing basis or not, stand in an analogous or equivalent (i.e., meaningful) relationship to objective occurrences which have no recognizable or even conceivable causal relationship with them. (para. 856)

Jung's explanation seems somewhat convoluted when discussing the role of the senses in perceptions, although he does indicate that sensory stimuli can exist below the threshold of consciousness. Jung admits to the incapability of causality explaining the facts in this case. Perceptions, at the most fundamental level, are an assembled process.

The archetype chooses a form or symbol, which becomes the currency appropriate to elicit the response needed. A new value of awareness is felt when a symbol is experienced as something originating from the archetype. It is not until the archetype takes form can its presence be experienced as a personification of the unknown and a phenomenon perceptible through that experience.

Symbols

Jung saw the symbol as the psychological mechanism that transforms energy (1960/1981, para. 88). Symbol-formation is expected as part of the therapeutic process. The purpose of this, Jung (para. 93) explained, is the transformation of libido, "By this I mean an idea that can give

equivalent expression to the libido and canalize it into a form different from the original one" (para. 92). This is possible when the libido is not completely invested in the natural flow of other functions and has disposal energy to be directed to other forms. The symbol makes the deflection of energy possible. Jung (1956/1976) added, "symbols are not signs or allegories for something known; they seek rather to express something that is little known or completely unknown" (para. 329).

Edward Edinger (1994), M.D., Jungian analyst, offered clear distinctions between signs, symbols, and allegories to reduce confusion between use, meaning, and function. Edinger referred to signs as emblems that reference something else known, and an allegory is intended to reveal something hidden. Edinger (1972) raised the question of "another kind of meaning" (p. 108), which he referred to as *subjective, living meaning* as meaning that begins with a subjective understanding, is alive, and evolves to meaning abstracted from the lived experience. Edinger was referring to a symbol experienced as a phenomenon, something unknown.

Symbols require intentional reflection and amplification to approach their meaning. The importance of solving the mystery of what a symbol may be presenting, Edinger (1994) suggested, "is what keeps our work with the unconscious always alive and never reduced to a formula" (p. 41). It is the work of always searching for answers that brings one closer to an understanding of what is unknown. This searching describes the lifelong quest of individuation, a lived experience of the symbol and the resilience required to approach the symbol subjectively to discern its purpose or meaning. Edinger (1972) lamented the pressures of Western society, which steers human meaning to be found in external objective pursuits rather than toward an inward subjective search for meaning. Symbols, as the conduit for recognition of subjective meaning,

have been replaced by illusions of grandeur and hopes of aggrandizement often in a digitized pursuit for meaning.

Symbols are grounded in the unconscious by way of the archetype, and their form is shaped through conscious ideas (Jung, 1976/1956, para. 344): “It is not possible to discuss the problem of symbol-formation without reference to the instinctual processes, because it is from them that the symbol derives its motive power” (para. 338). The symbol acts as an outlet for libido transforming it from a lower to a higher form of energy and works through suggestion to express the content of the conviction it raises. A symbol together with the experience of the archetype, “is not only impressive, it seizes and possesses the whole personality, and is naturally productive of faith” (para. 344). The psychological truth found in the symbol, as a manifestation of the archetype, is an internal truth which Jung believed to be the bridge to the best of humanity.

Jung’s idea of the symbol is the mechanism by which unconscious psychic energy is channeled as a form of communication expressed through the body and the imagination (Rowland, 2012). The symbol is the place where human nature converses with non-human nature unobstructed by the barrier of human language. Faith or the belief in an undivided reality requires an inward subjective search for meaning where trust in the unknown is nurtured and equanimity becomes a familiar state. Rowland (2012) wrote, “Jungian symbols are living in an embodied psyche, for the unconscious embraces the body without being governed or restricted by it” (p. 46). Rowland explained the unconscious is what links humans with non-human nature while also connecting humans to their own nature as the unconscious.

Jung (1956/1976, para. 346) urged the psychotherapist to understand symbols as a way of understanding the unconscious. The patient’s striving for an attitude that reflects the desire for wholeness, and the need to be a unique undivided individual in relationship to everything other,

directs the therapeutic alliance and the process of individuation. Jung (1960/1981, para. 93) also warned the therapist to expect a symbol-forming process to be present at the beginning of treatment: “The individual unconscious produces such symbols, and they are of the greatest possible value in the moral development of the personality” (para. 680). This process is likely to be in an elementary form where the forming symbol at the start of treatment will register a gradient of energy too low to be effective initially.

Jung (1960/1981, para. 94) encouraged symbol-formation in a synthetic direction. Jung (1954/1985) outlined in the four stages of analytical psychology the need for symbol-formation to produce an energy gradient better suited to the inner and outer condition for treatment outcomes to materialize. This readjustment of the psychological attitude is the goal of analytical treatment (Jung, 1960/1981, para. 142). A new attitude creates the possibility for the individuation process to begin and energy to flow in the formation of a symbol.

Human society in the present moment is going through a psychic reordering. There is an emerging complexity that continues to evolve in meaning and across scientific disciplines, which support Jung’s theories. How knowledge is acquired and understood, and the role non-human nature plays as part of an inherited collective unconscious is an expanding phenomenon. A reordering of the individuation process as Stevens (2002/2012) proposed, helps to broaden individuation as a psychological process not limited to the individual, but a universal principle of evolution active in human and non-human nature.

The collective unconscious represents humans and non-humans who have contributed collectively to an inheritance of mental, affective, and spiritual functioning and therefore assures to be a unique experience available to all human and non-human beings and as Stevens (2002/2012) suggested, a universal principle of evolution. Symbols call to be acknowledged as a

creative and generative force in service to the individual drive for consciousness or the desire to find meaning in the dilemma presented by something unknowable. Archetypes can take form and be given expression through many creative mediums. Jung (1966/1978) wrote, “The impact of the archetype, whether it takes the form of immediate experience or is expressed through the spoken word, stirs us because it summons up a voice that is stronger than our own” (para.129). Myth, as a collective voice, narrates a chronicle not bound by time and can also mirror a unique reflection of experience.

The mythical images that appear for the listener or writer are creatively imagined. Rowland (2012) wrote, “Myths are symbolic narratives that shape the liminal borders of the conscious and unconscious psyche” (p. 45). Jung (1966/1978, para. 149-150) referred to mythologies as rich deposits of mystery that have captured glimpses of the psychic world that can terrorize or fascinate. The primordial experience, Jung asserted, is the source that lends creativity and mythological imagery to the creator even if “it is nothing but a tremendous intuition striving for expression” (para. 151). The challenge of the artist, whether writer, poet, dreamer, or painter, is to arrest the exhaustive possibilities of a visible form.

Mythological figures transcend time and make modern day appearances within the creative endeavors of film, literature, or other forms of artistic expression as manifestations of the collective unconscious. Dowd (2017) wrote, “Myths are universalized patterns of meaning–they are forms with which human beings comprehend and make sense of themselves and the world–past, present, and future” (p. 16). Amanda Dowd, a Jungian psychoanalyst, author, and lecturer, placed clinical authority at the intersection of an engaged many who contribute to myth making as a democratic, and an holistic approach to human suffering. Dowd defined this approach as a relational, spiritual, and emotional matter inclusive of the natural world and a

feminine perspective. This entices the imagination to find a creative adaptation between unconscious and conscious attitudes to restore balance.

The study of alchemy, for Jung, (1953/1968, para. 382) brought to the creative process the importance of the psychic condition and the mental attitude of the creator. The inner creative dialog that is present within the artist, Jung believed, to be a living relationship that guides the unconscious potential to one unfolding as a living symbol. The state where unconscious potential passes into conscious form is the subtle body of imagination. The subtle body mediates the dialectic between the unconscious, the substance which the artist seeks to transform, and the imagination. Jung referred to this intermediate realm between mind and matter, "a psychic realm of subtle bodies" (para. 394). Characteristic of the subtle body is its ability to take form in the material or physical sense as well as in the mind as the imaginative or creative process.

Jung (1953/1968, para. 396) turned to the faculty of projection to further explain how the imagination develops by the way of the soul in the body as well as outside the body through projection. The alchemists projected, involuntarily, the mystery of their own psychic nature into the mystery of the unconscious to illuminate it: "He [the alchemist] experienced his projection as a property of matter; but what he [the alchemist] was in reality experiencing was his own unconscious" (para. 346). This scientific process of alchemy becomes a metaphor for one's encounter with the unconscious. Archetypal psychologist, James Hillman (1997), made metaphorical reference to the alchemical process:

> Alchemical psychology also uses an image of horse manure for this introverting heat. The closed glass vessel that holds the psychological stuff being "processed" may be kept warm at a steady temperature by burying it in horse dung….Stashing your soul stuff in a pile of manure means paying attention to the residues of your horse-driven urges and actions. You become conscious of the horse-shit component of your drivenness, the consequences of the life you have sped through and ridden over. As you stew in this fermentation, another kind of awareness begins to form. (p. 51)

It is through metaphor that a symbol or image comes to life to shed meaning on what shows up in the present moment. It can be an unassuming reference, like manure, where meaning is conveyed. Alchemical language cultivates the non-ordinary through imagination or non-rational modes of thinking and challenges the ordinary modes of thinking for more dramatic effects.

Hillman (1997) cautioned against making distinct interpretations when encountering animal imagery: “the interpretation settles the emotional quivering and mental uncertainty” (p. 26) that comes with the animal image. Hillman saw this process as banishment by interpretation and warns, “meaning replaces image; animal disappears into the human mind” (p. 28). Rather than a process of interpretation, Hillman suggested keeping the image around, “imagined as a felt presence and talked with, it may need to be fed and housed, painted and modeled” (p. 28). He referred to this as *animating the image* rather than jeopardizing the existence of the image as living or soulful by trying to understand it, “for its arrival is a summons to divert your intentions from yourself at least partially toward it” (p. 28).

The method Freud and Jung used to interpret symbols, Hillman (1997) discouraged, “they both made a move we no longer want to repeat. They both translated the images of animals into crystallized symbolic meanings” (p. 28). This comment by Hillman may ring true as well as withhold the truth that Jung referred to symbols as living. Hillman’s concern seemed to be oriented to the idea that Jung’s living symbol “is *not* for the sake of the animal’s soul, but for yours [the human’s soul], the dreamer’s” (p. 28).

Pat Berry (1982/2008) and Jerome Berstein (2005), both authors interested in Jungian concepts particularly those related to the function of the archetypes, shared their understanding of the body, as subtle, or embodied experience. Berry explored image as a body, “a psychic body that holds tension and supports being. Though we foolishly interpret, simplistically allegorize,

reduce meanings to symbols and signs, the image remains–never changing, never yielding…the image puzzles us with questions, but yields no answers" (p. 94). To preserve the virginal integrity of the image as body, Berry suggested, resistance is necessary to create an intensity in which psyche can go to work. In this respect, virginity becomes a symbol in the purity of the image because it points to something unknown that may resist a single definition or understanding.

Bernstein (2005) shared his experiences with clients that helped him to realize and understand what he called the borderland, a different dimension he described as "the psychic connection with nature is the source of–and at the same time is inseparable from–spiritual and psychical health" (p. 8). This dimension, that initially was unfamiliar for Bernstein, became symbolic of an impending process that would lead him to a new form of communication. Bernstein explained, "everything animate and inanimate has within it a spirit dimension" (p. 8). Those who can access that dimension can conceive of a world joined with nature in all respects. Those that cannot are those who have split off from the natural world and psyche as nature, mainly the western overspecialized ego as Bernstein sees it.

The *borderland personality* is one that is highly sensitive, intuitive, and feels "the plight of animals that are no longer permitted to live by their own instincts" (Bernstein, 2005, p. 9). Bernstein (2005) also referred to this borderland state as a phenomenon *liminally emergent* in non-Native people. A phenomenon that carries within it an urgency, on the prowl, alert and wise to an encroachment on the liberty of nonhuman existence. Bernstein's conceptualization of the borderland phenomenon is a literary symbol that serves up images to affect meaning of this unknown dimension. A phenomenon that is sacred: transpersonal, numinous, and non-ordinary, inviting humans to reconnect with nature.

Those individuals Bernstein (2005) had experienced as borderlands, he believed, are leading a silent and unseen collective evolution in consciousness to avoid self-extinction. The feeling realization, as a somatic embodiment of emotion, is being shut down, Bernstein warned, to avoid truths that are frightening. The frightening truth is the Western ego's obsession with the expansion of civilization and culture that has culminated in a series of wars over the last three centuries and recurring acts of terrorism. Bernstein urged a rapid awareness of western ego's own violent and self-destructive nature.

Stevens (2002/2012) shared Bernstein's (2005) concern, "the only alternative to global catastrophe can be a collective refusal to project Shadow qualities on to social systems, political institutions and each other, and an acceptance of full moral responsibility for them in ourselves" (p. 253). Western culture is not only the target of many projections but also equally participates in contributing their own projections directed at home and abroad: "Shadow projection is an intractable vice of our species: it is at the bottom of all internecine strife and suspicion, all pogroms and wars" (Stevens, 2002/2012, p. 252). The 2016 U.S. presidential campaign, election, 2017 inauguration, and presidency thus far, has exacerbated the level and intensity of Shadow projections worldwide.

Projection as the Vehicle for the Archetype

The function of the instincts in relationship to their psychic partner, the archetypes, is important in understanding projection as another psychodynamic function within analytical psychology. Jung found projection to be beneficial in helping to facilitate the integration of unconscious traits that are often projected onto others by the individual who denies the projected material as their own. Jung (1960/1981) encouraged the individual to look inside rather than outside when irritations are commonly attributed to external factors, "we then turn round and

unhesitatingly condemn the object of offence, while all the time we are raging against an unconscious part of ourselves which is projected into the exasperating object" (para. 516). In doing this, Jung explained, the individual gives her power away to the object receiving the projection rather than recognizing that her own power resides within as an unconscious aspect in need of integration into consciousness.

Stevens (2002/2012) described projection as an ego-defense mechanism that provides the individual with a method for displacing, onto others, those unsavory parts of oneself that have been repressed and denied. This leaves the individual with a desirable image of oneself, which can be idealized, rather than taking ownership of one's undesirable traits and weaknesses also known as the shadow. Projection of Shadow material can be both personal and collective. Jung (1960/1981) attributed the psychic functioning within the unconscious to be a form of projection:

> Everything that works from the unconscious appears projected on others. Not that these others are wholly without blame, even the worst projection is at least hung on a hook, perhaps a very small one, but still a hook offered by the other person. (para. 99)

Once the projection is realized, the individual can learn to withdraw it so that the content of the projection can be brought back to the point of origin, within the individual, to be worked on psychologically.

The challenge for the therapist is helping individuals reach a level of self-awareness and humility to recognize the projection. Projections are favorable or unfavorable, according to Jung (1960/1981), although projections are often thought of as negative or undesirable aspects of the personality the individual refuses to acknowledge. The projected positive aspects of the personality may be experienced as an admiration or a longing for the confidence, authority, or achievements one perceives in another person while unconscious of the fact that he or she

already has the potential within one's self to develop those same qualities or pursue similar achievements.

It is as equally important to reclaim and integrate the discarded empowering and enriching aspects projected outward onto others as it is to withdraw the negative aspects attributed to others. If the Shadow is projected outward, the individual projecting is misappropriating energy as a valuable psychic resource that could be redirected for their own benefit. Until the individual can reclaim the energy directed outward, in the form of a projection, the process of individuation loses momentum. It is the unfavorable aspects or disagreeable traits that are very much a part of the internal landscape one would rather not accept as one's own that need conscious integration.

Jung (1964/1978) saw projection as a fundamental barrier that increases a lack of understanding in human relationships. He wrote, "Since they [archetypes] usually occur as projections, and since these only attach themselves where there is a suitable hook, their evaluation and assessment is no light matter" (Jung, 1953/1977, para. 152). Until an individual can acknowledge their own imperfections and tolerate a self-critique, their psychological knowledge limits self-awareness and their ability to tolerate the other in relationship. Jung (1953/1977) wrote, "If the unconscious simply rides roughshod over the conscious mind, a psychotic condition develops" (para. 253). Jung attributes moral complacency and a lack of responsibility to one's inability to withdraw projections.

A Summary of Analytical Psychology

The structure and functions of the psyche reviewed thus far are present to meet the individual's basic psychological needs and facilitate the individuation process. It is critical to the psychological health of the individual to understand how the sum of the functioning parts of the

psychic system contribute to a complex psychodynamic whole. An overview and study of these psychic components within the theoretical framework of analytical psychology was necessary to organize a better understanding of how the horse may live symbolically in the psyche. Horses, if experienced symbolically, help to facilitate the integration of unconscious material into consciousness by activating the archetype as a psychic function which can decommission the habitual attitude for a potential transformative experience.

Haule's (2011) work endorsed the need for novel experiences, which he believed create the opportunity for transformation if the human participant is receptive to change. The possibility of transformation is explained energetically as an increase in the unconscious energy value often possible through engagement with a psychotherapist (Jung, 1954/1985). The manifestation of the horse as a symbol or image of the archetype in the psychology of women who seek them as companions may point to the need for development of unconscious aspects that have not been given the appropriate outlet for expression and integration.

Symbols deliver a collective quality of humanity that encourage acceptance and change within a broader framework that exists beyond the limits of reason. According to Jung:

> all the mythologized processes of nature…are in no sense allegories of these objective occurrences; rather they are symbolic expressions of the inner, unconscious drama of the psyche which becomes accessible to man's [humankind's] consciousness by way of projection—that is mirrored in the events of nature. (1959/1990, para. 7)

Perspectives on Carl Jung's Formulation of Gender

Jungians, post Jungians, and feminists are challenging and modifying some of Jung's theories to construct a dialectal discourse that brings validity to the female experience. Jungians, as adherents of Jungian psychology, post Jungians, those who follow and endorse Jung and his psychology but dismiss essential and universal aspects of Jung's work, and feminists, those who

largely take offense to Jung's binary measure of gender rooted in the grand narratives of patriarchy, join in a literary discourse on the topic of gender.

A discussion on Jung's formulation of gender is relevant to the research topic in that it situates the feminine experience in a transitional space between perspectives that limit and subordinate her and perspectives that reaffirm and value her. A woman's relationship with a horse can offer her a living, breathing, companion that provides psychological comfort, grounds her to an inner strength, and motivates her to push the boundaries of traditional gender designations typically required of women in the care and keeping of a horse. Horses embody many of the characteristics Jung appointed to gender specific poles. Horses require women to expand beyond the traditional roles assigned to women, embrace her feminine traits, and cultivate traits and tasks commonly identified as masculine.

The feminist view has evolved from representing a single category: women, to representing others whose differences have also disenfranchised them from a larger community of privilege (Rowland, 2012). The post Jungian and feminist views about Jung and their responses to areas of Jung's work, focused on contrasexual archetypes, challenge the boundaries of a delineated discourse. Rowland (2002) wrote, "A discourse is a body of knowledge that is also a social practice" (p. 137). As a form of social power, discourse influences thinking, constructs meaning, and is politically dynamic. The boundaries defining Jung's grand narratives on gender constructed in modernism become blurred in a postmodernism critique to reflect inclusivity and diversity.

These rigidly defined narratives of the past, which have restricted gender fluidity, have been under scrutiny and revision for a more unified flow and benefit. Rowland (2002) wrote, "Since postmodernism is about the absence of secure rules and fixed points in philosophy,

culture, *and* society, it is unsurprising that postmodern theories themselves do not fit together to make a coherent agreed whole" (p. 128). This is where Jungian psychology may have an opening to intersect with postmodernism in the belief that the human psyche is unknowable, and can be approached only speculatively through rational and non-rational means.

Psychology and the sciences are finding common ground in the mind body connection and a shared view of the benefits in the human and non-human bond. Stevens (2002/2012) suggested, "Postmodernism purports to be a sweeping philosophical critique of our claims to establish *truth* whether it be in history or science" (p. 348). Stevens defended the biological roots of Jungian archetypal theory and the contemporary parallels that have been noted through recent developments in neurobiology. Current changes in basic assumptions about therapeutic approaches, backed by recent developments in the sciences, are helping to erode differences between psychotherapeutic practices and offer the opportunity for a subjective and an objective view of the healing nature of the therapeutic relationship. A synthesis of theories that include the "evolutionary conception of the psyche" and its biological roots promote the archetypal nature of humanity and all its potential as a universal idea (Stevens, 2002/2012, p.348).

Stevens (2002/2012) saw the benefit in celebrating the symbolic and imaginal life of the psyche and the empirical strength of the ego to create subjective and objective hypotheses. He discouraged the abandonment of objectivity and cautioned against the fragmentation only a subjective view will bring when a synthetic foundation in the sciences is unfolding. The postmodern idea that truth is constructed subjectively and "postmodernists hold that objective truth does not exist" (p. 348) is what Stevens passionately brought into question. This argument for how truth is determined is valid in the industry of equine assisted activities and therapies (EAAT) where therapeutic benefit resulting from the horse-human connection is difficult to

describe or explain. It is the empirical and heuristic data that can be the most convincing within a phenomenological framework.

Objective reality can be a risk-taking endeavor and a reality that requires accountability. The scaffolding supporting postmodernism does not appear sound enough to support definitive claims on reality or knowledge. This uncomfortable and cautionary state of flux would be expected as a natural response to the transition from modernism to postmodernism and a destabilizing of normality. If everything that postmodernism proposes is to be tolerated to the exclusion of what occurred before, then this reveals a postmodern collusion with the exclusionary grand narratives of its predecessor (Stevens, 2002/2012). Stevens (2002/2012) saw this postmodern form of liberation as a "more pernicious dogma that relativizes and trivializes everything" and promotes a superior attitude to Enlightenment values based on "objective truth, empirical method and science" (p. 349).

The value of objectivity appears to be eroding in the confusion postmodernism brings. The cultural clash between postmodernism and modernism requires both sides to tolerate an overdue cultural correction, but with a balanced perspective. Stevens' (2002/2012) plea is to find the hypotheses in Jungian psychology that have manifested valid empirical evidence: "To ignore or dismiss the biological contribution to this evidence…is to squander a priceless asset" (p. 350). Jung's (1961/1989, para. 777) attitude to biology was also positive as was his attitude to the empiricism of natural science.

Jung's (1961/1989) attempt to understand the psyche and the cosmos was based on a subjective and objective approach: "This picture is hypothetical, of course, but it offers a hypothesis which is so valuable that I will not give it up" (para. 778). Jung believed his hypothesis to be "heuristically and empirically justified," confirmed by the agreement of the

people, for which Jung used the term *consensus gentium*. Jung continued with the idea that, "knowledge rests not upon truth alone, but upon error also" and that his own psychology was "subjectively coloured" (para. 774-775). Jung's humility, belief in the human and nonhuman potential, and his grand narratives make frequent appearances throughout *The Collected Works* and normalize his fallibility as a strength in his humanity.

This literary discourse relies on a collaboration of similar and contrasting opinions to support the sustainability of Jung's theories that do bring value to postmodernism. Perhaps a new modernity may emerge as the chaos, confusion, and uncertainty of postmodernism clears. True followers of Jung may be prepared to tolerate the ambiguity of the currently constructed reality. It has afforded the opportunity for Jungians, post-Jungians, and feminists to also reaffirm and or redefine existing beliefs about alterity to move the discourse on Jung's controversial topic of gendered archetypes forward. Many may respect certain areas within Jung's prolific body of work and reject others.

The value Jung brings to topics like gender, individuation as a subjective process, his support of nonrational modes of apprehension, and the symbolic life of the archetypes, appears to draw enough interest to elicit dialog about salvaging, revisioning, and repurposing these ideas. Women can begin to reorient to a perspective of Jung in a way that validates those characteristics he attributed to archetypes of gender and the feminine as she defines them for herself. Jung's work supports the pursuit of knowledge through modes of apprehension that rely on the body, mind, and spirit as diverse forms of meaning making and understanding.

Those qualities Jung assigned as traits dominant in men and inferior in women, and vice versa, defined through an opposing pair of archetypes of gender, have been scrutinized in a Jungian, post Jungian, and feminist discourse. A compensatory and complimentary dynamic

exchange between the ego and the unconscious creates a unique experience in one's relationship to a perceived other. Rowland (2012) wrote:

> Most significant for his psyche is his own founding principle: the creativity, and in part unknowability, of the unconscious. So significant is this understanding of the unconscious other that even gender cannot be excluded. The unconscious is more important, more fertile than the ego. It follows that gender cannot be fixed or essentialist. One gender has to be processed with the other in the unconscious. (p. 57)

This understanding is also significant in that it establishes the possibility of gender fluidity where one's gender identity fluctuates, overlaps, and is not fixed. This understanding of the unconscious promotes tolerance in gender diversity within and outside the binary definition of the masculine and feminine. It is important that women, men, and other identities of gender or sexual orientation, realign their outer experience to an inner dialog of unconscious potential based on a validating and inclusive appraisal of self.

Experience or reality as a human construct is thus limited and constrained by the human condition from which it develops. If this is the variable condition in which one exists, postmodernism brings into perspective the transient state of human experience. The postmodern agreement acknowledges limits, entertains multiple perspectives, and differences, encourages the suspension of biases, understands experience to be influenced beyond the individual, and supports the acquisition of knowledge through interdependency as an act of inclusivity. An acceptance of uncertainty emerges as the new narrative moves away from rigid beliefs and yields to a stance of not knowing.

Personal experience narratives define and give meaning to individuals and communities and shift in tandem with environmental or cultural changes experienced on the local level. As modernism has given way to postmodernism, certainty and exclusivity evolve into uncertainty and a growing inclusivity. Common within transitions, "increasingly we emerge as the

possessors of many voices. Each self contains a multiplicity of others, singing different melodies, different verses, and with different rhythms. Nor do these many voices necessarily harmonize" (Gergen, 1991. p. 85). Kenneth Gergen (1991), author, and professor of psychology, raised a concern for *social saturation* and an erosion of objectivity when exposure to varied others in postmodernism results in the accumulation of self-doubt.

Gergen (1991) endorsed a relationship approach to psychotherapy rather than an individual-centered approach, which Gergen associated with exploring the unconscious or modifications in human behavior. It appears difficult for many to understand that the social engagement system of the individual will be impaired, as will their relationships with others, until the individual is centered in a healthy relationship to self as a whole dynamic psychic system. Gergen sees social networks as sick rather than the individual who engages in them.

Disagreements, tension, and instability would be expected in response to such a dramatic shift even when it may be a welcome change for many. Individuals and communities need to locate meaning within change and adjust their narratives based on subjective and objective experience. Hauke (2000) suggested, "Expressed in forms of 'local' narratives which do not make claims to being whole truths, such 'local' forms of knowledge are always in tension with the opposing tendency to cling to unitary truths" (p. 116). Local narratives may also emerge as counter narratives when individuals need a way of processing or challenging the dominant narrative. Postmodernism is evidence of such a challenge through confrontation of the androcentric narratives experienced in modernism.

Interpersonal effectiveness and analytical prowess seem critical to maneuver the ever-changing environments one is expected to navigate to avoid being buried under the wake of inclusivity. The flexibility and attention to one's experience and relationships required in

postmodernism is staggering. Gergen (1991) wrote, “It is precisely this exposure that undermines commitments to objectivity. For as the range and variability of reactions to any condition are increased, so does ‘the truth of the matter’ become increasingly cloudy” (p. 85). In this contemporary correction, or perhaps over correction, to balance out the power differential and gender deficits experienced in modernism, it has become difficult to discern if connections are meaningful and relationships are authentic.

How one defines what is meaningful and authentic comes into question, self-questioning and self-doubt. Stevens (2002/2012) believed Jung to be both pluralist, in his complex theory, and an essentialist in his archetypal theory of psychic activity as biological norms. Embracing Jung’s wisdom that comes from tolerating incompatible points of view is helpful when postmodernism prioritizes the construction of personal subjective truths and marginalizes objectivity. Stevens wrote, “He [Jung] understood that the tolerance of paradox is the root of wisdom” (p. 348). A personally constructed reality that will immediately begin to fade in the spirit of postmodern pluralism takes adjustment. Berry (2008) wrote, “By remaining critical, Jung never stopped making psychology, but we have—insofar as we content ourselves with the piling-up of amplification, the fitting of more and more cases into our selfsame puzzle” (p. 151).

Change that is constant needs markers that locate one to an inner place of experience with which to connect regardless of what is happening in one’s outer experience. The principle of relatedness and the desire to connect and ground found in Eros, which Jung (1959/1990) believed to be more naturally occurring and dominant in women, is needed to regulate and balance the ever-increasing relational demands that postmodernism delivers. The analytical principle found in Logos is just as critical to deconstruct and reconstruct information required to

make decisions and attend to demands that invade one's emotional, cognitive, and physical space daily.

Jung assigned clarity of thought as an attribute more naturally occurring in men. This polarized assignment of characteristics required objective thinking on Jung's part supported by modernism's commitment to objectivity and certainty. Objectivity was thought to be a social achievement, which implies Jung had company in reaching this conclusion (Gergen, 1991). Chances are a woman's view was overlooked or limited when dominant characteristics were assigned to a binary identification of gender by Jung. If a feminine influence was present in Jung's formulation of these gender ideals, her social context would have been limited by the time in which she lived as was Jung's.

The Feminine as the Principle of Eros in Jungian Psychology

Jung's (1964/1978) approach to conceptualizing the feminine took an uncustomary rigid position and polarized approach to gender. Jung made claims about dominant and inferior functions and aspects related to both the masculine and feminine gender by attributing a form of cognitive, affective, and behavioral traits specific to men and women. Jung defined their existence through what has been referred to as contrasexual archetypes in the unconscious although they focus on gender differences and not sex. The *anima* represented a man's unconscious aspects of Other as feminine, and *animus* represented a woman's unconscious aspect of Other as masculine. Jung wrote:

> Woman's psychology is founded on the principle of Eros, the great binder and loosener...the ruling principle ascribed to man is Logos. The concept of Eros could be expressed…as psychic relatedness, and that of Logos as objective interest. (para. 255)

Jung associated the masculine gender with the analytical aspects of Logos.

Eros was assigned by Jung to the feminine gender as the principle of relatedness as a dominant attribute that many feminists have perceived as sexist (Lauter & Rupprecht, 1985). Some scholars in the fields of psychology and sociology speculate that Jung's formulation of gender was conjectural, which may have become codified to reduce ambiguities by those that followed Jung. Jung's approach to gender was inflexible notably within the manner feminine gender was defined. Lauter and Rupprech (1985) declared, "By associating men with thought, the cultural category with the higher value in the twentieth century in most Western societies, he helped to perpetuate the inequality of women" (p. 6). Jung was privileged to the androcentric liberty of expression of his time.

Jung's polarized position on gender contradicts the range of thought and speculation he gave most topics. The depth of how Jung approached a subject is reflected in the way he chose aspects of alchemy and the natural world to define the masculine and feminine. Jung (1963/1989) shared the "the alchemical texts were written exclusively by men, and their statements about the moon are therefore the product of masculine psychology. Nevertheless, women did play a role in alchemy" (para. 221). Jung suggested that *symbolization* within the alchemical texts will show traces of a woman's influence.

Jung (1963/1989) also mentioned the effect a woman's absence or presence has on the unconscious of a man. If she is unattainable or absent, then Jung suggested this produces a feminine expression through the unconsciousness of a man that "gives rise to numerous conflicts" (para. 221) if the man is one-sided in his masculine, spiritual, or conscious attitude. This implies he lacks the integration of nurturing, receptive, relational, and grounding traits often identified with Eros and the feminine in Jungian psychology. Jung suggested a lack of integration causes a vulgar and banal display of the unconscious feminine in the man. Jung

pointed out that a man's misogynistic attitude toward women, as a protective factor of his masculinity, becomes "unpredictable moods and insensate resentments" (para. 222), which implies that man, at his worst, resembles a woman's temperament.

Alchemical metaphorical descriptions suggest, according to Jung (1963/1989), that "Luna [Moon] is primarily a reflection of a man's unconscious femininity but she is also the principle of the [conscious] feminine psyche…Sol [Sun] is the principle of a man's [conscious psyche]" (para. 221-223), which also implies that Sol is a woman's unconscious masculinity. Jung's presentation of Luna and Sol as unconscious representations for the feminine and the masculine, and their equivalents Eros (*f*) and Logos (*m*) respectively, provided a rich and interesting study of how Jung used alchemy and nature as a guide in conceptualizing unconscious aspects and functions of his archetypes of gender.

Jung used a dialectical procedure in the practice of analytical psychology, a procedure based on an analytical-reductive view. Jung (1954/1985) wrote, "The dialectical procedure has another source too, and that is the *multiple significance of symbolic contents*" which requires a "synthetic-hermeneutic interpretation" (para. 9). These procedures are also helpful in understanding the diversity of gender and sexual orientation. Although Jung's position on gender can appear rigidly defined and misogynistic, his view of the feminine and masculine can also be liberating. Jung's unconscious pair of archetypal otherness needs a revision not based on binary forms of gender inferiority and superiority, but based on what Jung suggested:

> the more deeply we penetrate the nature of the psyche, the more conviction grows upon us that the diversity, the multidimensionality of human nature requires the greatest variety of standpoints and methods in order to satisfy the variety of psychic dispositions. (para. 11)

Jung's approach to understanding human nature could be applied to gender if a contemporary approach to gender is viewed as a variety of psychic dispositions.

A revision of Jung's archetypes of gender would be useful if gender fluidity was the aim rather than restricted to a binary discussion of gender. The growing contemporary discourse on lesbian, gay, bisexual, transsexual, queer, intersex and asexual (LGBTQIA) needs to be represented and the meaning and diversity expanded to the point where the topics of gender and sexuality blend into a multidimensional frame of self and other. The dialectical discourse of the past has been based largely on a sense of feminine inferiority in comparison to Jung's definition of the masculine.

The feminist, Jungian, and post-Jungian criticisms of Jung are important to acknowledge and counter with a literary review that also reflects contributions Jung made that honor and advance the feminine. Rather than continuing a dialog based on inferior functions by comparison through a binary gender frame, a revision of gender and sexuality are needed at a more diverse and multidimensional level. Gender theorists, feminists, Jungian, post Jungians, and progressive thinkers contribute to social and political change on the matter of sexual orientation and gender identity confusion, but do not critically examine the meanings attached to these terms (Stein, 2009). Stein supported the separation of the biological realm from the social to challenge "biologically deterministic viewpoints" (p.8). If the significance of gender and sexuality is simply assumed and the complexity of it is overlooked, a binary designation of gender is reproduced and perpetuated.

It is time to look within the binary assignment of gender for fluidity. Jung's *anima* and *animus* can be integrated through discernment to release the binary definitions of gender for a more pluralistic perspective. The art of discernment resembles the alchemical process where

> the alchemist saw the essence of his art in separation and analysis on the one hand, and synthesis and consolidation on the other. For him there was first of all an initial state in which opposite tendencies or forces were in conflict; secondly there was the great

> question of procedure which would be capable of bringing the hostile elements and qualities, once they were separated, back to unity again. (Jung, 1963/1989, p. xiv)

Discernment offers a neutral principle, that can also be viewed as a discipline, a process and or a practice that embodies the idea of deconstructing for the purpose of reconstructing possibilities. The receptive principle of Eros and the analytical principle of Logos can be reassigned not as polarized gendered positions but degrees of personal experience in need of collaboration.

Feminists have suggested detaching the anima and animus from a specific gender to make it equally available (Rowland, 2002). Rowland (2017) wrote, "It is not only desirable but inevitable that Eros, associated with a male's unconscious anima, be integrated through individuation" (p.85). Individuation for a woman also needs to bring to life the integration of Logos as her unconscious animus. The integration of these dual unconscious figures needs to be included by all genders in their individuation to become more whole. It is evident to many that Jung, on the topic of gender, needs a revisioning and repurposing to relocate gender appropriately to a contemporary view.

Balancing the Dialectical Discourse

Receptivity and connectivity are among the qualities Jung (1964/1978) assigned to women by way of his identification of the feminine with the principle of Eros. Jung's vision of the feminine was based on sociocultural constructs true to his day and time. Assumptions about receptivity and connectivity can be explored as an expression of the female experience in ways that challenge or build on the traditional meaning of these terms. Guy Widdershoven (2001), a professor of philosophy and ethics in medicine, evaluates dialog from a hermeneutic perspective. He cautions against simply stepping out of a dominant discourse grounded in tradition and instead encourages taking a reflexive approach that confronts limiting preconceptions as a method of reaching a new understanding. Widdershoven wrote, "They may be questioned both

for their actual relevance as well as for their practical consequences" (p. 261). Traditional values that are discarded as obsolete risk creating a counter-narrative that may marginalize or silence traditions that can be applied or adapted to present conditions and situations.

Jung's version of psychology pushed against the typical boundaries of modernism inclusive of Jung's attempt at understanding women. However, Jung was limited by the prevailing cultural during an era that was exclusive and often absolute in how literal meaning was assigned. When taken in the context of early to mid-twentieth century, Jung still managed to give an extraordinary amount of attention and devotion to the concept of the feminine. Wehr, (1987) remarked, "For nonfeminist Jungian women, Jung's validation of the 'feminine' has great appeal" (p. 6). Demarias Wehr, a Jungian psychotherapist, considered feminism and Jungian psychology to function as ideologies and felt loyal followers could become rigid and inflexible to consider other viewpoints that could potentially enhance or compliment their own beliefs. Wehr does not disregard Jung solely based on comments construed as offensive and pejorative to women long ago, as some postmodern feminists have:

> Jungian psychology is a meaning-giving psychology. It does not reduce the human condition to pathology. In fact, it has the happy tendency to see symptoms as symbolic of the psyche's effort to redress an imbalance, to right an unconsciously felt wrong. Jung's view of the contemporary world situation offers the most complete psychological/spiritual explanation of it I know. (Wehr, 1987, p. 8)

Wehr's perspective of Jung implied openness and a willingness to accept views, ideas, and perceptions beyond the personal. Both receptivity and connectivity embody qualities of inclusivity needed to balance the tension of opposing viewpoints common in the postmodern dialectic. Wehr (1987) wrote, "Jung's portrayals of the 'feminine' often include receptivity, and many women feel validated by Jung's recognition of the importance of receptivity" (p.122). Although Jungian psychology valued the truth in natural sciences and history, Jung also endorsed

truth as a composite of one's engagement with his or her environment where upon acceptance of other forms of knowing could shape experience through intuition, and an encounter with the unconscious through synchronicity, symbol, image, and metaphor.

What defines gender seems to be a mixed review of biological and socially constructed factors which vary depending on cultural influences and experience. Hillman (1996) wrote, "Once we pass through the sociological descriptions of body build, skin color, and sexual habits, of profession, age, and marital status, the Truth of the Imagination begins to emerge" (p. 121). Hillman provided a contemporary revisioning of psychology based on beauty and personification with a deliberate intent to avoid the "gender war" (p. 37). Hillman believed "we all dissolve together" in varying composites of masculine and feminine (p. 37).

The sex one is born into is embodied; the boundary of gender is more flexible (Young-Eisendrath, 1997). Polly Young-Eisendrath, Jungian psychoanalyst, described gender as an evolving container of meaning that creates an interpersonal experience narrative based on opportunities, and limitations. In the discussion of gender, sex does not seem to be separate. Gender defines how one perceives the world as accepting or rejecting, safe or threatening, as expansive or an abridgment of rights. When recognized psychologically, gender difference signals power difference when forms of patriarchy have secured global dominance for centuries. Young-Eisendrath (1997) commented:

> Differences in power and social roles play an important part in self-esteem and perhaps in mental health, although power difference rarely is included in our interpretation of mental health. When power is defined as decision making, status, and control of resources, whether at home or in the workplace, it comes clear that power affects the ways we feel about ourselves and others. (p. 29)

One's sex and gender influences the ability to trust, determines how one perceives threat, and measures the degree of a power differential.

Jung examined gender through archetypal references for the male and female person. His notion of an unconscious contrasexual figure allowed women to imagine life outside the confines of a male-oriented culture and contemplate an image of shared authority and privilege. Zabriskie (1990) wrote, "In the name of integrating an opposite, in the form of masculine "animus,"…women could extend beyond gender-bound arenas" (p. 273). Beverly Zabriskie, Jungian analyst, comments extensively about Jung's *intrapsychic poles of otherness* defined as feminine and masculine. She considers them to be important psychological and cultural contributions; however, she points out the inconsistencies in Jung's references to women in his descriptions of the *anima* and feels Jungians have not done what is necessary to "transcend the gender biases of their masculinized histories and cultures" (p. 275).

Zabriskie (1990) implied the version of receptivity, Jung assigned as a characteristic common to the feminine, to be often misrepresented and romanticized and to suggest constant availability. Zabriskie's version of receptivity suggested openness to ambiguity and the willingness to struggle through internal and external discord. Zabriskie's concern regarding Jung's depiction of receptivity seems accurate based on the literature reviewed. Receptivity may be perceived by some women as mother, homemaker, sexual partner, or constant availability in all those forms; however, Jung may have also meant women as a receptacle to a man's projection of his inner feminine figure. Gender has provided an emotional and psychological means by which individuals formulate identity and find place (Zabriskie as cited in Hauke, 2000, p. 119). Feminists advocate for a form of gender acceptance that eschews hierarchy and identification with one particular gender.

Postmodernism advocates for the consideration of a multiplicity of perspectives that Zabriskie (1990) entertained while reconciling Jung's perceptions on gender to a version she felt

more accurately represents the feminine today. She also offered a much more appealing definition of the Eros principle to replace Jung's version limited to a women's love of a man or an achievement fueled by love. Zabriskie wrote about Jung's view on Eros:

> this view also denigrates eros, which is more fully understood as the intense engagement with, and passionate relatedness to, the actuality and potential, both within and without, in all aspects of being: soul, spirit, mind, heart, and body. It [Eros] posits intactness and individuality implied in the ancient idea of virgin and widow expressing autonomy rather than sexual abstinence. (p. 275-276)

By comparison, Zabriskie's definition of Eros would likely be more popular among women than Jung's definition of Eros. The division Jung creates by presenting a dualistic and universal approach to gender, further separates people rather than unites them, according to Zabriskie, and runs counter to the feminine sensibility as portrayed by Jung. This culturally conditioned and sanctioned view of gender is not just limited to Jung. This view also reflects the pervasive patriarchal perspective that persists.

Zabriskie (1990) accused Jung of being caught in his own psychology and milieu, generalizing from an inferior feeling function and *anima* attitude when masculine thinking was his dominant function. She also points out that Jung was certainly influenced by the women in professional and social circles who were also "formed and shaped by a masculine value system" (Zabriski, 1990, p. 276). Zabriskie, Young-Eisendrath (1997), and Wehr (1987), established that Jung and his psychology were influenced by time, place, culture, and patriarchy. Women of the same era were equally influenced and instructed through a male-dominated narrative and often succumbed to fulfilling the projected *anima* figure as necessary to navigating her way.

Irene de Castillejo in *Knowing Women* (1973) advocated for the development of a strong ego in women as opposed to the diffused one endorsed by Jungian scholars of Jung's era. De Castillejo's (1973) concern for the feminine examines a woman's connection to growth and

nurturance, “the deeply buried feminine in us whose concern is the unbroken connection of all growing things is in passionate revolt against the stultifying, life-destroying, anonymous machine of the civilization we have built” (p. 42). This deeply buried feminine remains below the threshold of awareness, manifests as an inner rage that can be passive, or destructive obstruction against the desecration of the natural world.

This inner objection to outer events is expressed by women as well as men who identify with the natural world which de Castillejo (1973) hoped to be rechanneled with more consciousness through creative intention rather than developing into neurotic illness. De Castillejo proposes three levels of responsibility that can raise a conscious awareness: (1) shadow recognition and ownership to avoid projection, (2) cultivate the bright personal shadow of dormant potential, and (3) give voice to the deep feminine spiritual quality found in men and women.

De Castillejo encouraged personal responsibility for exposing the dark and bright shadow aspects as an attainable achievement on the individual level, attainable through a meeting with the unconscious. Failure to unite the opposites, de Castillejo (1973) warned, leads to indifference, a poison which stifles dynamic growth: “Indifference…hiding beneath a cloak of culture and rational behaviour, is the negation of love” (p. 129).

Marianne Woodman (1990), Jungian analyst, described the gender dynamic in concrete terms. When gender opposites are left unattended in the unconscious they remain undeveloped at an infantile level inhibiting personal growth, “so long as they are in control, conscious masculinity and conscious femininity are merely words” (p. 18). If this is the case, men and women are held captive in an unconscious power drive, which limits their freedom and the freedom of those with whom they come in contact. Woodman added, “women can be worse

patriarchs than men" (p.18) as a way of illuminating that men are not the only persecutors of women and recognizes that crossing gender lines unconsciously in a dual system, or any system, will distort the individual's ability to function.

Andrew Samuels (1990), a writer and professor of analytical psychology, preferred referencing *Other* in place of the terms Jung used. He wrote, "Animus and anima images are not of men and women because *animus* and *anima* qualities are masculine and feminine. Rather, for the individual woman or man, anatomy is a metaphor for the richness and potential of the 'other'" (p. 301). Samuels argued that anatomy cannot represent any emotional characteristics. To speak of contrasexuality is to speak of woman and man as the symbolic other although the personification of the sex or anatomy of man and woman is really about gender difference in the other, which circles back to masculine and feminine. Samuels suggested the use of "contrapsychological" (p. 301) in place of contrasexuality. This too has its limitations when the personification of contra can have more than one reference.

The post Jungian project has failed on the topic of gender according to Samuels (1990). His explanation for the numerous submissions of writing about the feminine principle, according to Jung, is not so much to defend, correct, or reappraise Jung but to celebrate an opportunity to critique through confrontation with the feminine. Samuels recognized a woman's need to honor her experience through written narrative. The power of writing and appreciating feminine literature is also celebrated by Marguerite Duras (1981), a French feminist. Duras believed literature written by women is organic and translated:

> Women have been in darkness for centuries. They don't know themselves. Or only poorly. And when women write, they translate this darkness….Men don't translate. They begin from a theoretical platform that is already in place, already elaborated. The writing of women is really translated from the unknown, like a new way of communicating rather than an already formed language. (p. 174)

By personally confronting Jung's position on the feminine principle, a woman or man can engage with the questions of identity, gender, differences in gender, sociocultural implications of patriarchy, and address the desire to understand its lasting implications. For some, writing can be a spiritual practice, a way to critique Self and other against the changing sociocultural and psychological context.

Samuels (1990) acknowledged the draw to Jung's conceptualization of the feminine. The permission and possibilities postmodernism offers women warrants an outpouring of individual and collaborative attempts to comprehend Jung's meaning. Jung's assumptions about the feminine are eternal, there is an expressed exaltation, a romanticizing of women. This can be alluring to women to experience their gender as idealized especially when past experiences of their gender identity have been marginalized and dismissed.

Samuels (1990) expressed an understanding of the reason so many women have felt compelled to write about the feminine, "they desire to bring the feminine gender in from the condescending margins and to promote an alternative philosophy of life to that expressed in the power institutions of a male-dominated society" (p. 296). On the other hand, Samuels voiced a valid concern about the status the feminine principle has attained as an ego ideal, which could lead to a reversal of power and hierarchy. Several decades of idealizing the feminine gender will probably not risk a power reversal after centuries of sexism and misogyny under patriarchy; however, Samuels' concern about binding people to traits that are accessible to any gender and his demystification of gender difference and the feminine raises valid points.

To dismiss Jungian psychology as only valid in relationship to modernism would be a tragic loss. Jung's polarized views in terms of how he defined or omitted differences in gender and his understanding of the masculine and feminine gender, which further substantiates the

inequality marked by modernism, leaves much to be desired from a feminist or post Jungian framework.

Jung's work on gender related aspects of the feminine psyche and his sensitivity to the receptive and connecting nature of the feminine creates an understanding of how women construct beliefs and assumptions related to a sense of place and belonging. The Western contemporary discourse among Jungians, post Jungians, and feminists is helping to bring validity to the female experience narrative as feminine or otherwise. Jung's approach to gender may provide some with a place to reconcile traditional ideals with new insights or create a rich blend of varied perspectives about the ways in which Jung limited and or advanced women and men.

The Feminine-Equine Dyad

Equines have been trusted and faithful companions throughout Western civilization. Literature devoted to the unique nature of horses and their bond with humans will now be reviewed. Women and horses in some ways seem to share parallel experiences within a male dominated system of decision making and authority. Western culture has historically, and in the recent past, typically assigned defined roles for women in society. Jung (1953/1977) commented, "The growth of culture consists, as we know, in a progressive subjugation of the animal in man [and woman]" (p. 19). This cultural subjugation creates a disunity within oneself according to Jung: "It is a process of domestication which cannot be accomplished without rebellion on the part of the animal nature that thirsts for freedom" (p.19). Expectations related to behavior, disposition and temperament, physical appearance, and social engagement were all tightly defined standards for women well into the twentieth century in Western society that still exist today.

The cultural constructs needed to honor the wild feminine archetype or the animal nature within that thirsts for freedom were absent for women for centuries (Casanova, 2009). Both women and horses have lived with restrictions defined by a rigid set of expectations that limit the full expression of who they are. The role of women and horses historically has been as a helper to man. Jungian analyst Casanova (2009) wrote about the considerations of the outer world as a source for reflection and consideration for the state of one's inner world: "If we lose connection with the wild, primordial, primitive parts of our souls then we lose a vital source of energy for psychological life, and we can become sick" (p. 115).

Until women and horses are seen and experienced as sentient beings with a collaborative spirit, and domination is suspended as a distorted and traumatic form of relating, relationships between men and women and humans and horses will result in compliance that does not honor the needs of all present in the relationship nor is the relationship valued when compliance is chosen. Casanova is interested in animal appearances in dreams as a symbol of the deeper instinctual areas of the soul that are oppressed or neglected.

Mary Midkiff (2001), a horsewoman and author, understood the need to increase body awareness so that a woman does not lose touch with sensual experience:

> Sitting bareback astride a horse, touching the warm sides along the full length of our legs, feeling the movements up the length of our backs and into our heads, sensing in our hands as we hold the reins, we tap into the physical nature of the horse and become aware of our bodies the way a horse is. (p. 42)

The non-rational and non-linear methods of fully absorbing an experience, which include attuning to information through sensation and emotion, have often been overlooked, discounted, or dismissed as inferior forms of understanding or perceiving. Western culture's over reliance on purely logical or rational acquisitions of knowledge sever women from the wisdom present in the body and an intuitive sense of knowing.

Linda Kohanov (2001), horsewoman, lecturer, and author, believed women have lost their ability to attune to their internal warning system due to a split between mind and body experience. Jung (1960/1981) believed that humans like the animals have a highly tuned subjective system for reading affective states in others: “There is present in each of us a direct instinct for registering this, which animals also possess in high degree, with respect not only to their own species but also to other animals and human beings” (para. 25). A standard upbringing in Western society teaches young girls to be sweet, brave, and helpful, to live from a linear and logical space while ignoring their internal compass that teaches body and emotional awareness.

Girls become women conditioned to live counter to their instinctual compass in favor of meeting the cultural demands to become objects of another’s desire rather than subjects of their own desire (Young-Eisendrath, 1997). Girls and women lose touch with their own needs and wants and become dependent on fulfilling the needs and wants of others. Meeting the needs of others becomes a gauge for self-worth and relies on constant praise and reassurance from others for self-validation. This weakens an innate system in the body that alerts one to danger. Defenses are lowered and risk is heightened as women lose touch with their innate system for sensing people and situations that are safe or unsafe.

A woman’s experience with horses can help her to reconnect to the body as a guide to self-realization. When a woman reconnects to her internal source of knowing she becomes attuned to the instinctual voice of her own body narrative. It is a highly-tuned system that signals the body to action or rest. This is also true of horses as Barbara Hannah (2006), Jungian analyst, pointed out:

> the more their wills are broken, and the more we treat them like robots, the less independence and intelligence they show, but that is actually because we cut them off from their instinct and they form the habit of blind obedience that replaces the inner guidance just as the white man replaces the inner guidance of the primitive. (p.92)

A culturally defined existence that values the rational over non-rational sources of information can mislead girls and women into trusting situations and people when one's instinctual forms of assessing or acquiring information have been conditioned to misguided cultural norms. Blind obedience impedes psychological development. Jung (1964/1978) wrote, "When any natural human function gets lost, i.e., is denied conscious and intentional expression, a general disturbance results" (para. 544). Women and horses can join in the reclamation of an instinctual force and live from an honest expression of who they are. Midkiff (2001) commented, "One of the greatest gifts a horse offers us is a chance to explore constructive ways to meet danger and manage our private terrors" (p. 106).

Linda Koch (2008) researched the emotional well-being owning a horse can provide for women. Women referenced their ability to learn from the positive challenges they faced when learning to manage the size, power, and unpredictability of the horse which reinforced and boosted their confidence. Through their engagement with horses, Koch noted research participants comments about their improved physicality and coordination, an ability to drive a large truck and horse trailer, and the thrill that came from being outdoors which the research participants shared as confidence builders. Koch stated, "The horse is a social animal that seeks alliances. This need of the horse to be social and the need of a woman to nurture and bond make the horse an ideal companion animal for women" (p. 124).

Catherine Anne Held (2006) also focused her dissertation research on women and horses and remarked:

> I believe that the coming together of women and horses in large and increasing numbers in the western world signals a new age of the horse that is as important to the two species as the so called dawn of civilizations when humans first learned to ride and exploit horses. (p. 310)

Held contrasted the rise of girls' and women's ownership of horses during the last 50 years to cultural changes in postmodernism that reflect technological advances that could increase the devastation of warfare with a renewed ecological awareness.

Horses, as nonpredatory beings, have perfected a way of surviving and not becoming victimized, which Kohanov (2001) referred to as the "wisdom of the prey" (pp. 101-103). Kohanov cautioned against operating from only a logical standpoint when emotions are overruled and instincts are subdued when working with horses: "As my own mind formed a reciprocal relationship with feeling, instinct, and intuition, my success with horses increased exponentially" (p. 30). Kohanov began to rely on forms of relating that aligned with the Eros principle of connecting and nurturance rather than the principle of Logos aligned with reason and logic. A quote Kohanov discovered in her study of Taoism, "know the yang, but keep to the yin" she translates to "know the masculine but keep to the feminine" (p. 38). Kohonov decidedly adopted that insight as the equine perspective and a basis for her work with women and horses.

The end of the age of territorial conquests, with men on foot or horseback, created an opening for the instinctual aspects of horses to be experienced by women and acknowledged in other forms. Midkiff (2001) wrote:

> Women are drawn to the power of horses. On an earth where most of us are shorter, smaller, and less muscular than most members of the opposite sex—where "man-power" is the standard measure of human force, not "womanpower"—horses are the great equalizer. No man on foot is a match for a woman on horseback, and any woman on horseback is a match for any man similarly mounted. (p. 117)

Horses provide for women an equalizing instinctual energy to balance those characteristics historically reserved for the feminine with those characteristics assigned as masculine within a male dominated system of authority.

Perhaps it took the burgeoning interest women have in horses to fully recognize the diverse qualities horses embody that transcend boundaries that have been assigned to a specific gender or sex. Women are embracing the raw power and strength of horses as well as their gentle need to connect and rely on inner systems of awareness. The increase of women interested in horses and the cultural move toward an acceptance of women riding in a standard saddle or bareback, versus a side saddle, seemed to mark a shift toward a feminine way of being in relationship with horses.

Kohanov's (2001) research led her to a broader study of the horse in myth from various cultures, "I realized there was a persistent connection between these animals and aspects of feminine knowledge that were routinely suppressed or demonized in patriarchal societies" (p. 15). For some women, the horse provides a nurturing and supportive relationship that teaches her how to embrace and recover parts of herself that facilitate a sense of well-being and develop self-worth.

The Feminine in Fairy Tales (1993) is a valuable literary contribution by Marie-Louise Von Franz to substantiate the importance of archetypal structures present in a woman's life. Von Franz, a contemporary of Jung, was well versed in interpretative techniques used to understand fairy tales and dream images:

> Women have a very deep relationship to nature in its positive form. Relationship to animals can also effect the cure, and many women make a relationship to a pet, which at that time may mean more to them than anything else because its unconscious simplicity appeals to the wounds within them. Relationship to a human is a differentiated task; but relationship to an animal is simple, and in feeling for it, the lost tenderness may be discovered. (p. 98)

The responsive inner system of the horse registers and communicates important messages that can reach the awareness of humans who share their company and are attuned to them. Jung (1990/1959) wrote, "Again and again in fairytales we encounter the motif of helpful animals.

These act like humans, speak a human language and display a sagacity and a knowledge superior to man's" (para. 421). Although the horse is ridden by humans and therefore is subordinate to humans, "in these circumstances we can say with some justification that the archetype of spirit is being expressed through the animal form" (para. 421). The horse as a *psychopomp*, a guiding agent into the inner world of knowing, creates an awareness of the body, and has become an appealing companion for women. Horses help to connect a very disconnected and distracted culture to a slumbering inner life and the wisdom of the natural world.

Women, Horses, and Nature in Relationship

The horse inhabits the natural world and becomes the mediator between the world of nature and the world of humans. The majestic and powerful image of a horse, real or imagined, often demands an intentional focus and an inward centering to connect to their inner wisdom and benefit from their freedom of spirit. Horses help facilitate an experiential opportunity that give women a sense of control over something that feels larger and more powerful than herself. The feminine-equine relationship dyad is not just about a woman's relationship to horses, but also brings her into relationship with the wild feminine archetype and the natural world.

As a woman stands face to face with the instinctual and unpredictable energy of the horse, the magnitude of that moment seeks a clarity of meaning and purpose and requires a response from the depths of her being. As Jung asserted, "The impact of an archetype, whether it takes the form of immediate experience or is expressed through the spoken word, stirs us because it summons up a voice that is stronger than our own" (1966/1978, para. 129). When she realizes her partnership with a horse can be nondemanding and nurturing, she finds a place to rest and explore her own creative agency. A personal dimension, that has been partitioned off to meet the

demands and expectations of others, can be rediscovered. In their natural habitat, horses offer a reconnection to nature and a companionship based on presence.

Horses exist in a present moment awareness most humans no longer have the capacity to give one another or themselves. Horses, that have not been traumatized by their human relationships, can teach humans how to live in the power of that presence and create a bridge to natural world experiences. A present moment awareness provides a temporary respite from longing as a human condition, "the human longing to creatively embrace life in meaningful, vital, connective, and purposeful ways" (Avery-Clark, 2014, p. 3). It is a presence that is embodied and offers resolve when the endemic disconnection human beings experience becomes immeasurable and incomprehensible. Horses, for some, become the solution for the disconnect between human and nonhuman nature, the separation that creates an overwhelming divide in need of healing.

Melissa Holbrook Pierson (2000), author and motorcycle enthusiast, wrote about the horse as someplace better than the feeling of being alone. She experienced the horse as an animal that speaks a deeper, superior language than her own:

> And then the image of a horse struck my eyes. In it was something that vibrated below the level of hearing, below that of thought. Here was something that could bear me away, and all the outcasts who could find no one to talk to. (p. 15)

Pierson described the paradoxical nature and appearance of the horse as telegraphed through their bodies. She believes in a secret she shared with horses as a little girl, the protean qualities that both little girls and horses embody and expect the world to deny.

The barn for Pierson (2000) meant a sweet smell—hay mixed with molasses, feed, manure, "the thousand breaths expelled by its denizens, breaths from a dark, moist interior that must be, she imagines, home somehow to wildflowers" (p. 16). The barn was a place where

secrets where kept, where dirt, hay, blisters, and sweat were all welcome reminders of a new friend and silent confidant: “Nothing less than the entire self undergoes transformation” when girl meets horse (p. 19). Pierson shared a quote by Yi-Fu Tuan in *Landscapes of Fear:*

> We tend to suppress [the knowledge that fear is a universal emotion in the animal kingdom] from our consciousness, perhaps because we need to preserve ‘nature’ as an area of innocence to which we can withdraw when discontented with people. (p. 219)

Pierson mourned the idea that compassion is a commodity in danger of depletion if directed toward causes that are non-human, “the creature I have become is contained in the creature I was, and a double strand of longing has been braided into one” (p.247).

The horse for Pierson (2000) is “an emblem of desire” ready to satisfy the “perpetually famished,” as “the call of Eros,” “life companion,” an embodiment of mystery that is essential and “Always Other, always somehow irreducible; there and not there” (p. 247). The horse becomes the voiceless being, for many, that closes the distance humans have created from the natural world. Pierson’s appreciation for horses goes beyond a shallow explanation of why women choose horses as companions, and reaches into the depths of this phenomenon. She wisely connects women and horses to a return to nature and the lost aspects of herself.

Patricia Reis (2010), writer, and psychotherapist, explored animals in the landscape of their natural habitat. Humans used to rely on animals for clues about how to live and survive. She wrote, “Today, we understand that unless we grasp our interconnectedness at the deepest levels of existence, neither the animal’s or the human’s survival is necessarily guaranteed” (p. 100). Reis warned of the widespread concern shared among scientists, “that we are currently in the midst of the most rapid extinction of plants and animals the world has ever known” (p.101). This extinction is due largely to modern humanity’s encroachment of the wild habitat.

Reis (2010) questioned her relationship to her local landscape and "other-than-human inhabitants" (p.101) and searched for a fuller natural connection: "Deep in my own body I know and remember that our bodies—the earth's, the creature's, my own—are made up of precisely the same elements" (p. 101). Anguish, desperation, yearning, unspoken hunger, and desire are all sentiments shared by Reis in her conviction to act on behalf of the natural world. She spoke of the impending pain, terror, and despair that will be the companions of her longing for contact with the natural world and recognizes human suffering to be the entry point into the imbalance humans have created for nonhumans.

Lyn Cowan (2017), Jungian analyst, teacher, and writer, blamed cultural attitudes, prejudice and history for perpetuating a lack of human consciousness, "those things about which we ought to be most conscious and to which we ought to be most naturally and organically connected" need an adaptation, which Cowan proposed as a "sharper, instinctive sense of our own physical bodies, a sensitivity to wild animals and their habitats as we are co-relatives and co-habitants, a responsiveness to climate, and an appreciation of the land itself" (p. 3-4). Cowan saw this loss of connection with nature as a double metaphor, one as a woman separate from her land, as psyche from body, misappropriated for male purposes, and the other as the loss of human conscious with the natural world and the misappropriation of its natural beauty as a disconnection to soul and spirit. Horses have the capacity to heal that divide for women.

David Tacey (2010), professor and author, believed in the subtle bond between humans, nature, and place:

> In a sense, these bonds create the vital link between humanity and the natural environment, and when they are severed by excessive rationality or a collapse of awe or reverence toward nature we are left outside the field of nature and in an alienated state. (p. 329)

We are alienated from the symbolic world nature creates for humans as a place of reverence and unexpected beauty. Tacey called for reanimating soul through a connection to the natural world. An interspecies consciousness and companionship that is found when horses and women connect returns a sense of awe to experiences found in nature. Horses offer a nurturing relationship that facilitates a rediscovery of human nature rooted in the soulful nature of the natural world.

The History of the Horse in Myth, Metaphor, and Symbol

The horse appears frequently in myth, literature, film, and fable as heroic and powerful, unruly and terrifying, a kind and benevolent creature, and a companion and helper to humans. The history of the horse, whether in war and heroic quests, as a source of food for humans, pulling a plough or wagon for a working farmer, or carriage for the transport of aristocracy, always returns to the relationship between horses and humans as an ancestral link in their co-existence for survival. “Our struggle for freedom has been won through the freedom they have sacrificed for us in exchange for a powerful mutual bond and benefit” (Ronnberg & Martin, 2010, p. 312). The evolution of the horse dates back 50 million years although discrepancies were found across the literature referenced about the origins of the horse.

The utility of the horse was vital to most civilizations after domestication. Brehm (1895) reported, “History does not record, nor does tradition tell us of the time when they [horses] were first won to our service; no one can with certainty affirm upon which continent the Horses (*sic*) were first tamed” (p. 405). Alfred Brehm, devoted to natural history and the study of animate nature, approximated subjugation and domestication of the horse to central Asia and central Europe. Although Brehm was conservative in citing dates related to the history of the horse, he was generous in his description of their temperament and character. Brehm saw the horse as a lively, active, and intelligent animal. He described the conformation of a horse as elegant,

graceful, noble, and stately depending on the breed, and their temperament as peaceful and good-natured. Horses have evolved from a preindustrial relic to the role of companion and teacher in tandem with the innovations and pursuits of humans.

An animal known for its complex symbolism is the horse (Cirlot, 1962). Horses historically are associated with burial and sacrificial rites, water and Neptune, the underworld and Pluto, blind chaos, intense desires, and baser forces. Omens of war, death and life, and clairvoyance were thought to be associated with the horse. Cirlot (1962) wrote, “Jung came to wonder if the horse might not be a symbol for the mother, and he does not hesitate to assert that it expresses the magic side of Man, ‘the mother within us’ that is, intuitive understanding” (p. 152).

The horse has an extensive history in myth. In *The Horse in Magic and Myth,* Howey (1958) cataloged a variety of mythic possibilities connected to the horse. Howey’s exploration of the horse included personifications of the horse as fairy, angel, and ghostly demon and headless horses; creation, prophetic, and sacrificial horses, as well as centaurs and unicorns. For the purposes of this study, the horse will be explored as a potential symbol for libido or instinctual energy, as a mediator or psychopomp, and a highly sensitive creature attuned to the environment.

The collective experience, explored in therapy through dream images, animals, and art, influence and inspire psychological development often when the therapeutic alliance reaches a standstill (Jung, 1954/1985). Animals are a recurring motif commonly referenced in Jung’s work. Jung often referred to animals as symbolic of the animal nature or instinctual energy in humankind (1956/1976): “Legend attributes properties to the horse which psychologically belong to the unconscious of man [humans]: there are clairvoyant and clairaudient horses, path-

finding horses who show the way when the wanderer is lost, horses with mantic powers" and horses with prophetic powers (para. 421).

The extrasensory qualities humans assign to the horse include what Jung (1956/1976, para. 421) referred to as clairvoyant and clairaudient. Clairvoyant abilities refer to an extrasensory perception or clear vision that relies on obtaining information beyond the five senses as a conjectural phenomenon (Colman, 2001). A clairaudient ability, also a conjectural phenomenon, refers to sensing sounds beyond the normal range of hearing. Clairsentient beings collect emotional information through the senses, feeling, and touch. The horse seems to have an innate ability to scan their environment for an energetic resonance and sense when an imbalance is present or forthcoming.

Debra Smith Knowles (1999) asked the question, "what is this body that the horse so exquisitely symbolizes?" Knowles described it this way:

> To be in the presence of a horse is to be aware of body. One can feel its physicality, libido, and energy…by nature of the horse is the animal of flight, but it has overcome this instinct to the extent that our histories and legends are full of tales of the horse's courage and nobility. (p. 127)

Knowles questioned again "with what emotions does the archetype symbolized by the horse announce its presence?" (p. 129). Knowles looked to Jung for answers and referred to the body as "a guarantee of consciousness" (p.127) and fundamental to apprehending meaning. The questions Knowles raised are essential when one encounters a symbol manifested by an archetype.

Knowles' (1999) questions pointed to the nature of the archetype and the energy the archetype has at its disposal to communicate itself to ego consciousness. The horse personified through its strength, beauty, and physicality grips the ego and is compelled by the archetype to correspond to what the ego needs to experience, through the symbol of the horse, to advance the

unconscious attitude (Jung, 1956/1976, para. 101). The horse as a symbol of the archetype and the mystery of its meaning, is specific to the individual that encounters that phenomenon. The dynamic presence of a horse can be captivating and difficult to put into words. James Hollis (2000), Jungian analyst, puts it this way, "without the tools of metaphor and symbol we could have precious little to say, for they allow us to talk about that which we cannot talk" (p. 48). Symbols and metaphor provide tools to express what human language cannot.

Jung made many references to the horse throughout *The Collected Works*, the one most common is the horse as the representation of the human instinct or libido:

> Since the horse is man's steed and works for him, and energy if even measured in terms of "horse power," the horse signifies a quantum of energy that stands at man's disposal. It therefore represents the libido which has passed into the world. (1956/1976, para. 658)

It is worth noting in para. 658 how the horse is objectified as subordinate to man in terms of power at man's disposal. Women value horses so differently than men. Now that horses have been replaced by other forms of power, woman and horses have the freedom to co-exist in a mutually beneficial relationship.

Jung often linked the horse, as a symbol of libido, to the mother. He saw the need for an individual to let go of the original state of the unconscious found in the containment of the primal mother and enter the possibilities of life where libido, or instinct, can flow toward its biological aim (1956/1976). Horses have been a gift to women in helping them in a goal directed quest toward a biological aim. Jung (1956/1976) wrote:

> The mother-imago is a libido-symbol and so is the horse; at some points the meaning of the two symbols overlaps. But the factor common to both is the libido…the hero and his horse seem to symbolize the idea of man and the subordinate sphere of animal instinct. (para. 421)

Jung (1956/1976) rejected a one-sided definition of libido and found it impossible to consider that the whole of psychic phenomena could be derived from a single instinct and

therefore rejected Freud's definition of libido as sexual drive. He also pointed out that Freud "calls things symbolical when they are only semiotic" (1938/1984, p.540). Further, Jung (1971/1990) wrote:

> Every view which interprets the symbolic expression as an analogue or an abbreviated designation for a known thing is semiotic. A view which interprets the symbolic expression as the best possible formulation as a relatively *unknown* thing, which for that reason cannot be more clearly or characteristically represented, is *symbolic.* (para. 815)

Jung (1938/1984) "uses the word symbol for something which one can only vaguely characterize. A symbol expresses something which one cannot designate otherwise; one can only approach the meaning a little by using certain designs" (p. 540). Trying to decipher meaning from a symbol or image manifested by the archetype, becomes the intended task of the individual to enlarge one's conscious orientation to what may be presenting from resources in the unconscious.

The horse and rider can also represent the centaur figure, or ego consciousness as the rider and the horse as the shadow or nonhuman nature (Jung, 1956/1976, para. 678). McCormick and McCormick (1997) wrote, "The fabled centaur that is half-man, half-horse represents an attempt to resolve this inner division and integrate our human nonhuman sides" (p. 19). Adele von Rüst McCormick and Marlena Deborah McCormick are psychotherapists who partner with horses in the treatment of severely disturbed youth. Contact with the energy of animal instinct helped their clients learn in a natural setting about their own dualistic nature. They wrote, "Jung saw the horse as a symbol of our base instincts and a symbol of water—the most life sustaining substance…horses in myth express the magical side of us, the mother within who is intuitive and understanding" (p. 19).

The McCormicks (1997) explored the history of the ancient Celts and their relationship with horses who they believed were sacred creatures, embodied Earth, and the cycle of life in

seasonal changes and fertility: “The Celts revered the white goddess mare Epona as a great queen” (p. 18). A fertility cult began in honor of Epona that reached across Western and Eastern Europe. Epona, as a horse goddess, was also responsible for transporting the human soul between its existence on earth and thereafter.

Chiron was the most commonly known centaur who personified wisdom and was associated with archery and famous heroes, Achilles being one of them (Babejová, 2009). The skill of the nomadic riders and their maneuverability on horseback left a mythic impression of the half human, half horse representing the lower animal nature combined with higher human nature. Babejová (2009) acknowledged this split as one that goes beyond just a human/animal split and includes a split between mind and body and the wild and civilized:

> The horse stands for the poise of a person able to contain their vitality, to identify and process their emotions, and to be powerful without losing their connection to the earth…I want to show the symbolic power of the horse to carry for us humans a knowing that comes through our bodies, our sense, proprioceptive imagery, and imagination. Human knowing and horse knowing are strung together by a resonance more akin to the vibration of a sensitive instrument than the sound of a whip. (p. 132)

The body is where Babejová believed the human and equine consciousness overlaps. It is a “resonance with” rather than a reaction to stimuli which embraces an intuitive way of knowing. “It is the horse, our animal body, our sympathetic system, that picks up resonances and false notes that move like waves from an under-water volcano that is still alive” (p. 141-142).

Babejová (2009) also referenced Jerome Bernstein (2005) and his interest in the borderland personality. Babejová sees the gift of the borderland personality to be courage in their ability to rely on non-rational forms of knowing instead of following the Western paradigm dependent on cause and effect. *Borderlands* exist in an in-between state of tolerating the cultural preference of reason and logic and relying on other forms of acquiring knowledge that can lead others to believe they are psychotic. Environmental demands required the horse and human to

adapt to survive and evolve as a species. It is the inner adaptation to what is instinctual that becomes the life giving and affirming evolution if managed appropriately and within the social norms of the human environments in which they live.

Kohanov (2001) commented on "the image of a man on a horse is often used to symbolize the intellectual and moral superiority of the mind ruling the animal passions of the body" (p. 30). This image may leave one wondering about what is experienced when one reflects on the image of a woman on horseback. Kohanov remarked, "I've come to realize that women and horses are fully capable of weaving new myths into the future, perspectives based not on conquest and domination but on harmony and collaboration" (p. 3-4). Historically, horses have proven their ability to collaborate and live in harmony with their environment.

Jung (1964/1978) cautioned to never be mistaken and assume that the living nature of a myth is something "'thought up'; it [myth] comes into existence of its own accord, as can be observed in all authentic products of fantasy, and particularly in dreams" (para. 836). Birdsall (2005) used amplification to understand the appearance of a horse in a series of dreams. She shared that her amplification of the horse through a masculine association left her puzzled; however, through associations with the feminine, the amplification of the horse helped her recognize, "the horse is a symbol that is invaluable in bringing the instinctual, libidinal, embodied, and wild side of the Maiden back into the light" (p. 64). The paradox of the feminine nature may appear as animals in dreams as was the case with Birdsall.

Casanova (2009) related to animals in dreams as an expression of the instinctive, neglected, or oppressed parts of the soul. She encouraged development of the wild feminine archetype, "for the life of the soul, this translates as: a well-developed consciousness need not repress the wild, primitive layers of the psyche, provided they are treated with respect and

knowledge" (p. 116). Cultivating, with care, the wild feminine side of the soul can motivate women to reach for the transformative quality of the non-ordinary experience.

The wisdom contained in myths that includes the symbolic horse carries an experience narrative that resonates with present day accounts of the horse. When speaking of the mythical quality of symbols and images, Jung (1959/1990) made this aesthetic reference, "indeed we are compelled to say that the more beautiful, the more sublime, the more comprehensive the image that has evolved and been handed down by tradition, the further removed it is from individual experience" (para. 10). It would be easy to imagine that Jung is referring to a horse.

The horse has co-existed in its evolution and tradition in tandem with humans and has never been removed from human experience, as Jung (1959/1990) suggested above. The horse is an evolving symbol or image "more beautiful," "sublime," or "comprehensive" that has been handed down by tradition (para. 10). Horses have joined humans as a living image in individual experience rather than a symbol "removed from individual experience" (para. 10). Horses and humans were nomads joined in a narrative of survival. The spirit of the horse, both gentle and passionate, and willingness to serve and flee humans draws one into their paradoxical mystery even though, "we broke them and they give us their service. We tied them to our plows and carts, we settled the Wild West upon their backs, and they have carried us into and through countless wars and expansive conquests" (Ronnberg, 2010, p. 312).

Hillman (1997) gave expression to the more warrior aspects of horses while still giving credit to the more delicate aesthetics and allure of the horse:

> within the headstrong extraversion and noble courage that gallop across continents and centuries, marking the migrations of civilizations and their conquests and retreats, within that heroic impulse lies the delicacy, something internal and so invisible that only dreams seem able to recall. (p. 48)

Horses lend a mythic quality to the human experience and share their mystery when chosen as companions. The horse has been connected mythologically to Poseidon, the sea God. The waves resemble the mane of the horse, the thrust of the ocean as the stallion's vitality and unstoppable power of the Gods, the magic of fertility is attributed to the hoof of the horse (Hillman, 1997). "When this ferocious strength is perceived in a woman, the horse is demonized into the witches' steed, the nightmare, the panicky madness of a runaway" (p. 47). The horse as man's steed is measured as horsepower, the horse as a woman's steed is translated to something demonic.

Horses allow humans a form of transcendence when grounded in the earthiness of the animal body and transported through the sensual pleasures of the natural world. The mysteries of the human mind and body become one with the instinctual body of animal and nature. Any perceived separation between mind, body, and spirit fully engage in a unified experience when mounted astride a horse galloping across open fields and vast landscapes. Hillman (1997) commented, "We interiorize and contemplate the urge to press forward, to run wild, to panic, to win" (p. 51).

Hillman (1997) explored the alchemical sacrifice of the horse as a metaphor. The belly of the horse is the heat, *venter equi*, that refers to heat that is inward, incubating events, digesting experience. Heat that produces a contained fire. "Instead of free ranging conquest…you climb down and stay inside your animal drive, enveloped and cooked by its heat" (p. 51). Jung suggested a similar process:

> All the mythologized processes of nature,…are in no sense allegories of these objective occurrences; rather they are symbolic expressions of the inner, unconscious drama of the psyche which becomes accessible to man's consciousness by way of projection—that is mirrored in the events of nature. (Jung, 1959/1990, para. 7)

Horses reconnect humans to the vital elements nature provides that guarantee a body of consciousness that arouses a desire for meaning. The horse inhabits the natural world and

becomes the mediator between the world of human and nonhuman nature and the potential to bridge the divide. The further the individual is removed from the human experience in the natural world, the more the experience becomes non-ordinary and capable of manifesting new potentials for the individual.

Myths provide cautionary tales with psychological truths that expose basic patterns of human behavior. Hillman (1997) again: “The young heroes of Greek myths rode their horses into the air: Bellerophon on Pegasus, Phaëthon driving his father’s chariot of the sun, Hippolytos racing off the roadside to his death” (p. 47). Heroes unable to hold on to their libidinal drive either crashed or burned. The Bellerophon myth represents the creative impulse that can carry one away into delusion if left unchecked. According to Jung (as cited in Hannah, 2006), Pegasus, as the white winged horse carrying Bellerophon, a young man sent to slay the monster Chimera, represents the animal part of man as a principle and libido symbol.

Pegasus, born from the head of Medusa, when slain by Perseus, is symbolic of the connection between opposites. Pegasus, as a horse and earthly creature, is bestowed with wings capable of joining his earthly habitat with a heavenly one. Bellerophon, after slaying the monster, rides into the heavens as if he is a god and not mortal. Hannah (2006) saw Pegasus symbolically as the creative libido, “only dangerous if we allow it to divorce us from reality” (p. 114). The Bellerophon myth illuminates the need to remain grounded when experiencing hard won victories so hubris does not lead to self-destruction. Jung (1953/1977) wrote, “If heroism becomes chronic, it ends in a cramp, and the cramp leads to catastrophe or to neurosis or both” (para. 41). A deep plunge into the abyss cannot be avoided if the heroic mood reaches god like proportions. The creative libido can be inspirational to realize original ideas but needs to be regulated so as not to soar to heights that are unrealistic.

Jung (1956/1976) referred to the Corinthian fountain statue of Bellerophon constructed so the water flowed from the hoof of Pegasus. The horse's hoof is symbolic of fruitful moisture and priapic powers: "The horse-shoe, an equivalent for the horse's foot, brings luck and has an apotropaic meaning" (para. 421). Thunder, lightning, fire, and water are often mythical references to the horse which link the horse with nature: "The horse represents the four elements" best represented in the myth of the gods driving a chariot drawn by four horses (para. 423). The four horses represent the division of the gods into many and their self-destruction returns them into a fiery unified substance which becomes the charioteer or the restoration of the divine One (Jung, 1956/1976).

The prophetic horse was esteemed as the medium most favored by the deities and often bestowed with the ability to speak in order to prophesize about future outcomes (Howey, 1958). The horse was consulted in a crisis due to their legendary prophetic powers. The Saxons were known for their superstitious nature and practiced consulting their horses on important matters. The condition of the horses' entrails or the way they neighed were believed to give clues about things to come. Howey (1958) wrote:

> In 521 B.C. the Persians wished to select a king to reign over them. To accomplish their choice it was agreed that the competitors for the sovereignty should meet on horseback…he whose horse first neighed should be the chosen ruler. (p. 157)

Xanthus, the famous horse that carried Achilles into the battle of Troy, was given the power to speak by the goddess Juno (Howey, 1958). Xanthus reported to Achilles, his beloved master, his foreknowledge of Achilles' impending death. Howey adds, the goddess Juno allowed Xanthus to speak to Achilles to give voice to his bitter emotions, and unburden his heavy heart.

The horse, as a clairsentient being and a prey animal, instinctually searches for appearances of the non-ordinary. Perhaps the horse's ability to sense discrepancies in the

environment, as an innate function critical to their survival, has given them a mythical status that has endured through story, fable, and mythologizing for centuries. The horse can be perceived as a predator for some, a highly unpredictable and potentially dangerous creature that needs to be broken or tamed, although horses are non-predatory animals. Others see the horse as an image of beauty, power, and grace, or a gentle and kind companion. The paradoxical nature of the horse creates an allure and curiosity befitting their legendary status.

Today, with so many domesticated horses, the instinctual archetype of survival seems to have shifted to a new adaptation in the domesticated horse. Hannah (2006) remarked, "That the horse has to largely overcome this natural tendency to panic and flee speaks for a certain psychic ability to transform and adapt; one need only think for instance, of the battle field and the amazing courage of the cavalry horses" (p. 92). The horse responds differently to a more predictable domesticated lifestyle. Horses are less likely to flee once they are accustomed to their environment and have learned to trust their human care takers.

The instinct to survive seems to have recalibrated to a need to read human character energetically as a protective factor. The horse's prophetic powers of the past have been reassigned in the present to assist humans in assessing authentic emotions and a more honest approach in building trust in relationships. Horses are gaining popularity within the mental health community as empathic creatures that mediate the incongruences that often remain hidden in the cognitive, emotional, sensory, and somatic narrative of the individual.

Hannah (2006) explored the energy of the horse as temperamental disposition. Temperamental speaks to unpredictability, changing moods, inconsistency, all tones of a living structure that moves freely between emotional states prone to environmental factors. Hannah saw the horse's energy captured in symbolic form as more specific than other animals she has

researched like the cat and dog: “We cannot deny that the horse is to a great extent a symbol for energy and libido, but it would be far too cheap to leave it at that” (p. 93). She acknowledged that there has never been any other animal like the hard-working nature of the horse that has stood by man as helper and fought at his side: “The horse symbolizes an instinct that, to some extent at all events, lies within the power of human consciousness” and is beholden to the Self (p. 101).

Hannah (2006) elaborated on the aspects of the horse that appear to be symbolic. She saw the horse as obedient and hardworking rather than spirited, wild, and unruly. Hannah supported this impression due to the horse’s ability to accept domestication and easily transition to a life in the wild. Hannah viewed the horse as helper and victim of man, a symbol of vitality and destruction and “a symbol of extrasensory perception versus a tendency to panic” (p. 94). Due to the symbolic nature of the horse throughout history and all the wonderful qualities, Hannah had shared, the horse became a valuable possession of man and to that end also became a sacrificial symbol. According to Hannah, the horse, during periods of world history, was sacrificed more than any other animal, a familiar custom in many countries. The horse was often sacrificed in tandem with their owner for use in the world beyond as psychopomp or pathfinder.

Typical to Hungarian and Slovakian fairy tales is a mythical figure referred to as a *tátoš* or táltos, who exhibits extreme sensitivity to animals, nature and the environment (Babejová, 2009). Babejova reported:

> They used the horse as the means of travel between the world of humans and the world of spirits. But as the word táltos refers to both the shaman and the horse, there is a certain merging of the two into one on this magical journey, a centaur-like being traveling through the liminal space of in-between. (2009, p. 136).

A táltos could also take the form of a magical horse with special gifts. They could make predictions, cure the sick and held supernatural powers.

The supernatural qualities of the horse are also present in the Turkestan tale of *The Magic Horse* (as cited in Von Franz, 2002). The tale is centered on a magic horse that saves the princess when her father, the king, is tricked by a beggar. The beggar who solved the king's riddle earned the hand of the king's daughter in marriage. The horse represents the life energy vital to recovery whose magic allows for inner balance to be restored when mediating opposing instinctual energies as the goal directed quest.

The horse becomes a helper to liberate the princess and assist her on her journey to overcome all the obstacles presented by the beggar who plans to devour the princess alive. At the end of her journey, the horse aids the princess in destroying the beggar. The horse requests to be sacrificed by the princess. She follows the instructions of the Magic horse throwing away his entrails, placing his head and four legs at the different directions of the compass creating a mandala. This image then transforms into a beautiful garden with a castle, stream, and village restoring wholeness through a mediating will.

Hannah (2006) believed the horse in the tale of *The Magic Horse* reveals the goal of extrasensory perception through the mandala symbol representing the totality of the Self. Identification with the helpful guidance of the horse frees the princess from the darker aspects of the unconscious represented by the beggar who is eager to destroy her. The image of the mandala as the sacrificial horse, suggests that if one lives by and trusts the natural flow of life completely, which includes sacrifices, one arrives at the goal. The destructive side of the instinctual energy is transformed into its opposing energy that is the life-giving force that cultivates beauty when its influence is managed appropriately.

Unlike the Bellerophon myth, the life-giving force of the Magic horse is not taken for granted and transforms a journey of hardships into something fruitful and beautiful. Bellerophon,

on the other hand, misuses the extraordinary resources found in Pegasus, which is met by a compensatory action in the unconscious to adjust the hubris found in the conscious attitude of Bellerophon.

Hannah (2006) found it interesting that the Magic horse insisted on its own sacrifice, "suggesting psychologically that the libido itself contains its own spiritual counterpart, that it sublimates itself, so to speak" (p. 120) by modifying the instinctual impulse. By taking a different form, the Magic horse transforms into disposable energy that allows the princess to impact a larger whole, her community. Hannah noted the feminine quality of the horse as it carries and contains the life-giving force that is transformative.

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

Choice of Method

The intention of the research study was to investigate the phenomenon present within the relationship between women and horses, what psychodynamic experiences may be present in this relationship dyad, and in what way may these experiences influence the process of individuation for women who choose horses as companions. A qualitative research approach was selected as an appropriate method to facilitate a meaningful inquiry about the experience of this interspecies relationship dyad.

A hermeneutic phenomenological method of discovery was used to survey the literature selected and experience centered interview data in support of the research topic. A narrative research strategy provided techniques for collecting individual participant experiences, which is fundamentally a hermeneutic enterprise (Josselson, as cited in Wertz, 2011). This is an effort to establish meaning and a new understanding of the feminine-equine relationship dyad that may contribute to a sense of well-being for both human and nonhuman participants of equine assisted psychotherapy.

Hermeneutics, as a form of inquiry, gives the researcher interpretive authority in understanding texts about life or lived experience. Hermeneutics provided a method of inquiry that encouraged movement in the interpretive process, creating a new perspective, and does not bind the researcher to a specific meaning (Smythe & Baydala, 2012). Smythe and Baydala (2012) wrote, “By virtue of its lack of conceptual articulation, the archetypal background finds its most natural expression in the non-conceptual, non-literal modalities of ritual, visual symbolism, metaphor, myth and narrative fiction” (p. 66). In this study, hermeneutics helped to liberate the individual experience within the phenomenological study.

Multiple interpretive voices present in the literature and the research participant interviews collected and reviewed helped shape a storyline from individual perspectives and shared experience. Smythe and Baydala (2012) wrote, “In practice, Jung offered a rich and vivid hermeneutics of symbol, both as a means of inquiry and an approach to therapy” (p. 57). Hermeneutics allows meaning to be revealed through the process of deciphering and grasping at fragments of comprehension to work towards an understanding. Jung (1953/1977) described the “essence of hermeneutics” (para. 492-493) as an art that allows for the practice of subjective and objective analogies to be added by the client and therapist respectively to the analogies already provided by the symbol. And further, Jung said, “This procedure widens and enriches the initial symbol, and the final outcome is an infinitely complex and variegated picture” a picture Jung believed could be reduced to a third comparison (para. 493):

> The symbol is not a sign that disguises something generally known. Its meaning resides in the fact that it is an attempt to elucidate, by a more or less apt analogy, something that is still entirely unknown or still in the process of formation…but to attribute hermeneutic significance to it is consistent with its value and meaning. (para. 492)

The archetypes, which inhabit fleeting moments of meaning experienced in the wake of an intuitive understanding, can find expression through hermeneutics as a method to approach the symbol and its significance. The individual stories began as something vaguely known and grew with understanding and clarity as the narratives unfolded.

Phenomenology, as a philosophy of intuition, grants a perspective that is not bound by rational or logical forms of understanding. In psychology, the phenomenological approach provides a method for a descriptive, “qualitative study of human experience” (Wertz, 2011, p. 124). The investigative focus becomes the experience. The human experience creates the presence of a phenomenon as a reality to be studied. Phenomenology observes the outer experience through intuition in an effort to apprehend meaning. Anderson commented:

> Intuitions often feel palpable as distinct perceptions into the nature of things; sometimes we can discern their triggers and how they support or even confound life decisions. But, more often, the occurrence of an intuition seems elusive, unrepeatable by will, and understandable conceptually only after a period of reflection and discernment. (as cited in Wertz et al., 2011, p. 246)

A hermeneutic phenomenological approach to inquiry can create a rhythm in the research method equal to the movement, mystery and freedom of the symbol, image and archetypes that emerge and flow into a process of understanding. Widdershoven (2001) wrote:

> Understanding is not an isolated event. It is part of a process of becoming involved in phenomenon, a process which is there already before one actually turns to it and which goes on after one has turned away from it. (p. 255)

Individual stories of experience called for a research method that could interpret meaning from the deeper background story, the spoken and unspoken experience from live data, and the textual representation of experience through an intuitive sense. Widdershoven (2001) wrote, "Our life is shaped by stories which are told about it. In such stories, our experiences, which are at first vague and ambiguous, become more prominent" (p. 256). Research begins to embody a background understanding that becomes influential in the discovery of meaning. The discovery gives way to what is present within the meaning.

Widdershoven (2001) encouraged hermeneutics as a way to increase awareness of limited perspectives: "A change of story can often help to see the situation in a different light…the new story will have to relate to the former way of seeing the world and will have to explain the limitations of prior interpretations" (p.256). The research method is relevant to the research study as it points back to the literature reviewed, which encouraged novel experiences as a method for creating opportunities that expand consciousness (Haule, 2011). Lived experience challenges preconceived expectations of experience. The choice to experience, rather than expect or assume,

broadens limiting perspectives, extends the boundaries of insight, and increases the willingness to participate in the unknown the next time it presents itself.

The narrative research approach can produce a storied understanding of experience through verbal communication that was transcribed into written text. A hermeneutic understanding can create a bridge between narrative research techniques and the desire for meaning to be understood in the phenomenon investigated. Creswell (2007) stated, "a phenomenological study describes the meaning for several individuals of their lived experiences of a concept or a phenomenon" (p. 57). Josselson said, "Narrative researchers work in symbolic interactionist, feminist, and psychoanalytic traditions, among others" (as cited in Wertz, 2011, p. 225).

The psychodynamic encounter occurring between a horse and a woman is a non-verbal narrative and a story of experience given voice through the narratives of lived experience and observations noted by the researcher. A narrative of experience, or "an experience-centred approach assumes that narratives: are sequential and meaningful[,] are definitively human[,] 're-present' experience, reconstituting it, as well as expressing it[, and] display transformation or change" (Squire, as cited in Andrews, Squire, & Tamboukou (2008, p. 42). Connie Squire, professor of social sciences and co-director of the Center for Narrative Research at University of East London, England, approached narratives as storied experience rather than a storied event. Squire (2008) used *experience-centred* to describe narrative research that includes experience that is significant to whom the narrator is, is a co-construction of story between teller and listener, participant and researcher, and the representation of experience: "The uncertain, changeable nature of written, spoken and visual symbol systems means that stories are distanced

from the happenings they described," (p. 41) and have meanings that are varied and are never told the same way twice.

Reconstituting the narrative may mean defining through the theme, structure, or experience difficult to put into words, a narrative of the embodied or emotional experience through sensory language and retold for an approximation of meaning. Squire (2008) wrote, "The work rests on a phenomenological assumption that experience can, through stories, become part of consciousness" (p. 41). Experiences expressed through turning points, sequential events or emotional markers become narratives that may not necessarily be representable in the traditional logical sense, but convey some form of individual wisdom or truth uncovered in the telling of the experience and an intuitive understanding.

Narratives of experience can illuminate other forms of meaning making to establish an understanding of this interspecies relationship dynamic when one of the narratives in this interspecies dynamic cannot be represented linguistically. Marie-Louise von Franz described intuition as "a kind of sense perception via the unconscious or a subliminal sense perception" (as cited in Wertz et al., 2011, p. 246). Intuitive and visual observation of the human and equine research participants was necessary to comprehend what may be taking place on an energetic level through body language and movement creating a body narrative for analysis. In this case, the researcher had to intuit the unspoken language present when observing the dynamic within the feminine-equine relationship dyad.

The research participant interview data relied on the use of the hermeneutic circle focusing on how the parts illuminate the whole and in turn the whole reflects the sum of the parts. The whole being the relationship between women and horses, and the parts being the themes that became common across research participant stories and the literature reviewed. The

literature reviewed was delimited by the key theoretical components in Jungian psychology that focus on the structure and dynamics of the psyche critical to the process of individuation. Literature reviewed describing the practice of equine assisted psychotherapy was intended to be educational to inform the reader about the governing organizations in the field of equine assisted psychotherapy that establish guidelines and policies as well as a methodology for practice and application and to give the reader an idea of how the industry has evolved.

Literature on women in the context of women's psychological, social, and emotional needs is plentiful and available to reference. The challenge that I encountered was narrowing the available literature on women, horses, and Jungian, post Jungian, and feminist perspectives on Jung's psychodynamic theory. I wanted to design a literature review that brought attention to theories Jung developed over a century ago that have relevance today. Relevance was sought not only in the field of psychology through the application of Jung's four stages of analytical psychology but also in Jung's psychodynamic theory and the recent developments in neuroscience that validate Jung's work in this area.

Participants

The four research participants selected for this research project were women who chose horses as companions for a minimum of 10 years in their personal and or professional lives. I elected to add my own storied experience as researcher and beneficiary of a long-term companionship with a horse both personally and professionally. All participants had experienced horse and farm ownership and worked professionally with horses and/or had long term volunteer careers for organizations that provided equine assisted activities and therapies. Atkinson stated, "A fundamental interpretive guideline is that the storyteller should be considered both the expert and the authority on his or her life, thus having the final say in what gets told" (as cited in

Clandinin, 2007, p. 239). The personal narratives of the research participants contributed data to the study by sharing their experiences and involvement with horses in a way that addressed the research questions. In most cases, all the questions were answered within the response to the first question.

Research Setting

An outdoor location was the typical setting chosen by the research participants since participation with her horse could also be observed. If the outdoor setting for the experiential portion of the interview: research participant with her horse, did not provide adequate privacy for the audio recorded interview, the research participant selected another location. The research setting, and design met the ethical standards of the Saybrook Institutional Review Board, which included consideration given to a research project that would require participant involvement with a horse as part of the setting.

Research Design

I relied on digitally audio recorded interviews of the participant responses to open-ended research questions. In most cases participant responses were also hand recorded by me in the event the digital recording captured on my personal computer or mobile device failed. Most of the interviews were conducted in remote locations chosen by the participants to be near their horse. I have a personal or professional relationship with all the research participants.

The details of the research setting, and design were fully disclosed in my application to the Saybrook Institutional Review Board. The interviews lasted approximately 45 to 60 minutes each. Literature, in support of the research question, personal narratives of lived experiences with horses by me and research participants, and my observations of the research participants

interacting with their own horse comprised the resources necessary to construct the research design.

I personally transcribed each audio recorded interview and included written notes collected during my observations of each participant interacting with her own horse. I contacted the research participants after completing the interview transcriptions if any clarifications were needed. I participated in the interview process by manually transcribing responses to the interview questions. My responses were included in the data collected and analyzed.

Research Instruments

Live interview data was gathered through a flexible interview structure whereby my inquiry, as the researcher, was guided by five open-ended questions pertaining to the story of relationship between each research participant and her horse. I prepared open-ended research questions that would elicit a research participant's response in the event the live interview ceased to progress or an impasse was reached. The open-ended questions were as follows: (1) In what way have your experiences with horses been influential in your life? (2) How would you describe what you notice about yourself or your horse when you spend time together? (3) What would your life be like without horses as companions? (4) What do you notice happening on the inside when you are in the company of horses? (5) How may your relationship with horses be connected, or not, to your relationship with the natural world?

The interview process did include my observation of the research participant's unmounted activity with her horse. Some of the principles found in the Natural Lifemanship model of Trauma Focused Equine Assisted Psychotherapy (TF-EAP™) outlined in the first section of the literature reviewed guided my observations of the unmounted research participant with horse participant activity. The TF-EAP model maintains that the relationship with the horse

is paramount and central to the model, all relationships take priority before the task, and the relationship meets the needs of all parties involved. I was trained in the TF-EAP model at the basic and advanced level by Bettina and Tim Jobe, the founders and developers of the Natural Lifemanship model. A research instrument was developed to guide observations made by me when each research participant interacted with her horse.

Procedures

I relied on narrative research techniques to collect two generated sources of data from four research participants in addition to my own story: (1) An experiential activity conducted with each research participant interacting with her horse and (2) An audio recorded live interview exploring the research participants experience centered narrative with horses through open-ended questions. The following research procedures were implemented to provide a confidential framework for collecting, storing, and analyzing data while honoring the integrity of the research participant's story. Each of the interviews collected involved a total of approximately 60 minutes. All voice recorded data collected was transcribed by me into written text for analysis and interpretation. The following procedures were used in the process of collecting live interview data from the research participants:

1. The Natural Lifemanship model of TF-EAP™ was introduced through demonstration and explanation by me, for application by the research participant in the experiential portion of the live observation of study participant and horse interaction.
2. I recorded written observations of the research participants' application of this equine assisted psychotherapy model with her horse and the responses of the horse.
3. The experiential observation segment lasted approximately 20 to 30 minutes.

Data Analysis

The data was analyzed according to the constructing, deconstructing, and reconstructing techniques outlined by Ruthellen Josselson (as cited in Wertz, 2011, p. 224-240). Josselson is a professor of psychology at the Fielding Graduate University and narrative researcher and writer. Josselson (as cited in Wertz, 2011) appreciated the interview as an expression of the parts of a whole within the individual experience. She used the hermeneutic circle to consider how the whole illuminates the parts and has stated, "The parts in turn offer a fuller and more complex picture of the whole, which then leads to a better understanding of the parts" (Josselson as cited in Wertz, 2011, p. 228).

Josselson (as cited in Wertz, 2011) emphasized the need to conduct multiple readings of textual and interview data to listen for different voices within one participant interview for analysis in the context of a self-dialog; "Narrative analysis focuses, then, on patterned relationships in the flow of events and experience within a multivoiced self that is in mutually constitutive interaction with its social world," which Josselson refers to as the integration of "multiple psychic realities" (as cited in Wertz, 2011, p. 227).

Psychologist and researcher, Rosemary Anderson (2011), developed intuitive inquiry by integrating her interests in the writings of Michael Polanyi, Carl Jung, and Clark Moustakas. Anderson's strategy for analyzing data augmented and complimented Josselson's (2011) techniques. Anderson's appreciation for intuitive understanding also included how opposing preferences in mental functioning correspond to the left and right brain hemispheres. Anderson used a typology of five intuitive modes of expression: (a) unconscious, symbolic, and imaginal processes, (b) psychic or parapsychological experiences, (c) sensory modes of intuition, (d)

empathic identification, and (e) through our wounds (p. 247). I used four of the five modes as complimentary to the psychodynamic theories common to Jungian psychology.

The typical orientation found in the five senses of taste, touch, smell, sight, and hearing complimented the work of Miller-Karas (2015), among the literature reviewed. The work of Gendlin influenced Anderson's use of focusing techniques as a method for developing other means of sensory perception. Empathic identification aligns with the work of Stephen Porges (2014) and Daniel Siegel (2007), both reviewed in the literature, whose work on attunement as a form of presence and resonance, can lead individuals to a transformative experience.

Anderson (2011) suggested other intuitive channels that can be used to orient to the sensory data collected by the researcher as a form of knowledge. *Kinesthesia*, is a way of sensing through movement in space, and *proprioception* provides a sense of orientation relative to space. *Visceral awareness* is obtained through "receptors in the organs and tissues in the body" (p. 246), which communicate subtle shifts as valid body narratives spoken through the senses often escaping the analytical thinking function of the mind. This strategy increased my awareness of the participants, horse and human, and an additional perception of how the participants may orient to relationships. Anderson found the potential of intuitive inquiry in research praxis when integrated and adapted with other analytic approaches: "When research analysis is infused with the imaginal and intuitive, science is imbued with a renewed ethical and compassionate dimension" (p. 246).

Anderson (2011) reframed and clarified Carl Jung's reference to intuition as irrational, not to mean an unreliable source of information, but information that can elude attempts at understanding. The application of intuitive inquiry, combined with phenomenology, helped to establish a research praxis that included an intuitive understanding. The unspoken narrative

could be given reference and meaning in the research interviews through intuitive inquiry, which became a valuable method for the investigation of an interspecies relationship dynamic.

I constructed a coherent unity of data using a circular interpretative process searching for connections in the data among the thematic parts. These parts then evolved into overarching wholes that overlapped. This was helpful and confusing as the themes intermingled across larger domains making it difficult to narrow themes and tease out the interrelatedness of the data in the whole of the meaning. The interview texts were analyzed engaging Anderson's (2011) typology of intuitive modes as iterative cycles to discern an implicit and explicit understanding of the data combined with Josselson's (2011) techniques and attention to the ethics of relationship between researcher and research participant.

Josselson (2007) was also concerned with the ethics of relationship pertaining to the explicit and implicit contract within the relationship between researcher and participant. The explicit contract is prepared in advance by the researcher outlining the study purpose, rules of engagement or the choice to withdraw, and details about who the researcher is. Widdershoven (1993) offered:

> Stories make explicit the meaning that is implicit in life as it is lived. In stories we aim to make clear and intelligible what life is about. Thus stories are interpretations of life in which the meaning of life is spelled out, in very much the same way as the meaning of a text is spelled out in a literary interpretation. In telling stories we try to make sense of life, like we try to make sense of a text when we interpret it. (p. 9)

The explicit contract is mentioned in relationship to the data analysis to convey how the implicit contract is difficult to make explicit just as it is in any relationship where two individuals join and share a deeply felt story. It is implicit that the researcher is witnessing meaningful aspects of a human experience. Josselson (2007) pointed out that implicit to this exchange between researcher and participant are unforeseen assumptions, expectations, and contingencies.

The degree to which the researcher exhibits empathic attunement, emotional availability, and a nonjudgmental approach, will likewise be reflected in the resulting data collected from the participant. If the participant felt seen and heard in a compassionate way, the participant is also likely to feel at ease to self-disclose and reveal at a level relative to the safety of the interview container the researcher provides. Josselson wrote, “The greater the degree of rapport and trust, the greater the degree of self-revealing and, with this, the greater the degree of trust that the researcher will treat the material thus obtained with respect and compassion” (p. 539). An ethics of care is the responsibility of the researcher. Informed consent becomes a relational process, Josselson encouraged as an ethical consideration beyond the explicit informed consent.

A more direct disclosure by me to the participant about what the implicit contract entails seemed to diffuse tension around expectations felt by the participant and encouraged a growing freedom of expression in the interview. Feeling states were noted by shifts in mood or changes in voice, body language, or a response from the horse while interacting with the research participant. Peak experiences, life lessons and direction, and a sense of responsibility and purpose were routinely expressed within the feminine-equine storyline. Josselson wrote, “Analysis is aimed at discovering both the themes that unify the story and the disparate voices that carry, comment on, and disrupt the main themes” (as cited in Wertz, 2011, p. 226). References to relationships or social experiences became apparent when the research participant spoke about the structure of their social environment and how horses have influenced or become a structure within their social realm.

Once the overall sense of meaning becomes apparent within the analysis of the participant interview process, “the work also enters into conversation with the larger theoretical literature so that the researcher can remain sensitive to nuances of meanings expressed and the

different contexts into which the meanings may enter" (Josselson, as cited in Wertz, 2011, p. 228). The structure and psychodynamics within Jungian psychology, post Jungian and feminist thoughts and comments about Jung's work, comprised the bulk of the literature reviewed. These literary texts in turn mobilized a relationship dynamic among their parts that also constructed a psychic impermanence, a discourse toward the unified theme of what constitutes individuation (Peräkylä, as cited in Denzin & Lincoln, 2008, p. 353).

Discourse analysis presupposes that mental realities are constructed outside the individual linguistically. This became apparent during the interview process when participants developed their experience as they spoke. Talking about their experience elicited memories, which helped to develop what they wanted to convey. Cultural and social constructs appear to be part of the fabric that constitutes a subjectively told reality in the moment the interview is recorded. The literary discourse between Jungians, post Jungians, and feminists was also analyzed across the shift from modernism to postmodernism as an interpretation of changing social and cultural realities.

Procedure to Identify Themes

I read each interview in its entirety to grasp a sense of structural themes. Interview transcriptions were reread multiple times to search for themes unique to the participant for further development into units of meaning. Unified themes emerging among individual interviews were noted for the development of more general domains of common meaning contained in the sum of the participants' experience. The data collected required multiple reviews to make note of passages that carry significance, intonations that appeared prominent, recurring themes in common across research participant narratives, such as statements about personal experience that present "I statements," identity, relationship statements, loss, trust,

belief systems, acceptance, rigidity, flexibility or adaptability, hope, validation, the appearance of emotion, references to sensations or somatic experiences, fluctuations in attitude or mood, suggestive language, agency, autonomy, redemption or transformation, determination or resignation, social or cultural resources enabled or constrained, repetitious words, ambivalence, or ambiguity, an impasse, obvious omissions as in hesitations, central motifs as well as emerging counter-narratives.

The quality of expression, tone, volume, and cadence of speech were noted as well as pauses, fluctuations in voice, emotional moments, hesitations or reframes. The research data was analyzed to reveal any contradictions, emotional lability, exposed vulnerabilities, and interruptions by the research participant of their own experience as critical to the overall storyline.

Passages within the broader categories were examined for interrelationship and what was presenting as abnormal or unexpected. Key elements and threads were systematically identified providing causal links, repetitive patterns, or connections. A systematic method of developing meaning and experience from the data was explored for new paradigms or a clearer understanding of an existing paradigm illuminating the relational dynamic between horses and women. My personal experience narrative was included in the research data. The research participants' storied experiences influenced me to attend to an emerging background story of my own.

Limitations and Research Issues

My ability to reflect in a meaningful way and share insight relevant to the research topic may have been challenged by the breadth of the historical data presented in the literature review and possible shifts in beliefs and perspectives because of listening to the shared experiences of

the participants. The live interviews and flow of dialog and experience were critical to the process providing information needed to support the research topic. Furthermore, narrative inquiry as a research method "does not provide useful methodological guidelines" (Squire, as cited in Andrews et al., 2008, p.41). I took creative liberty in how the research data was collected, analyzed, and interpreted, combining different research methodologies that were congruent in design and used similar or complimentary techniques for a meaningful synthesis of the data.

At points, this process was overwhelming, especially in defining a method for data analysis that respected the relational nature of the research study. The identification of existing narrative research techniques mentioned in the Data Analysis section used in data collection and analysis challenged or enhanced the creative process that unfolded as the data was assessed. I relied on intuition to identify a creative way to synthesize the data that would align with the research focus and be meaningful to the researcher and reader.

I came to this research topic with a biased view based on a particular industry philosophy and standard of practice regarding how mental health practitioners partner with equines and clients. I was trained in 1999 as a therapeutic riding instructor, according to the standards of North American Riding for the Handicapped Association (NARHA) currently operating as PATH, Intl. This experience left me searching for more training on how to respond to the emotional and behavioral needs common among the clients participating in this form of therapeutic intervention. More insights were gained through completion of a master's in counseling psychology in 2006, state licensure as a psychotherapist in 2007, and a shift from therapeutic horseback riding to equine-facilitated psychotherapy (EFP).

Although several organizations and private practitioners developed methods for conducting psychotherapy with horses, none of these practices resonated with me until the Natural Lifemanship (NL) models were introduced to the industry. These trauma informed models, previously reviewed in the literature, focus on the relationship within the horse human interaction. The neurobiology of relationship, the benefits of rhythmic, repetitive, patterned movement, and horse and herd psychology were integrated into the NL models. The models appear to me to be more respectful of and attuned to the horse and human interaction and based on important developments in neuroscience. The recent publication of guidelines by the American Counseling Association in 2016 for counseling practitioners that conduct Animal Assisted Therapy (AAT) have also reinforced beliefs about the ethical considerations involved in this work.

I acknowledge an evolution and growth in my own beliefs about how professionals partner with equines in therapeutic activities as the industry has evolved. More significance is given to the relationship between horse and human and consideration for the horse in this work. The sensitivity needed in discussing different beliefs and practices of equine-facilitated and assisted psychotherapy was honored while respecting the varying training methods and philosophies of the individuals chosen and volunteering as research participants.

I am aware of possible limitations that were present when research participants found safety in intellectualizing and searching for the right answer. Horses find safety in relationships where the internal emotional state is congruent with the external emotional state.
The research participants' ability to navigate with care the intellectual and emotional divide when working with the horse and researcher influenced the data that was collected for analysis.

I acknowledge the emphasis on the feminine nature of this research topic. A woman's relationship with horses was the chosen research focus to better understand this specific interspecies relationship phenomenon. This feminine directed research topic intends no disrespect or devaluation of the masculine or any other gender identity or personhood not referenced in this research.

CHAPTER 4: RESULTS

A synthesis of the research participant data analyzed created a shared story of experience through a sequence of vivid memories from girlhood to present day. All research participants chose to use pseudonyms rather than their real names. My curiosity, as researcher, was drawn to the research participants' recall of memory. The participant memories produced vivid imagery not only for me as listener but also for the research participant telling the story. To understand the vitality of the memories expressed by the participants, I became aware of and questioned the quality of the memory associated with horses since my memories were also vivid and alive with detail. The constellation of memories recalled by the research participants seemed multidimensional comprised of sensory, olfactory, tactile, visual, auditory, and body memory possibly retaining a kinesthetic, proprioceptive, and visceral reorientation to the experience (Anderson, 2011). The research participant memories of their life with horses emerged as a living narrative stored in the body and expressed through imagery with sensory and emotional associations animated by the reexperiencing of the story they were narrating. Meaning was discovered through a process of retelling and understanding anew their own experience. A hermeneutic perspective of experience allowed for fluctuations of meaning when attempting to make sense of something weird or foreign to the customary way of understanding.

Common among the participant narratives was the gratitude expressed for being given the opportunity to talk about their relationship story with horses. Each participant referenced a sense of presence, described as a still calmness, when they spend time with their horse. I wondered if this quality of presence also contributed to the vitality of the memory stored with the experience. Some research suggests that the more pleasant the emotion associated with the experience the longer the experience is held in memory. The participants spoke of presence as if it were an altered state of experience. The participant stories carried a level of animation that could be

explained as a reexperiencing of memory as embodied corporeality. Part of the reexperiencing was attached to the physical world and part of the memory seemed to exist inside the body.

Appreciation and gratitude created an overarching background story. These women had shared their major life experiences in the company of horses and expressed an overwhelming indebtedness for what this relationship brought to their lives both personally and professionally. “In every way” was a response from one of the participants when asked how horses had been influential in her life. An unexpected opportunity revealed through the literature reviewed helped me as the researcher develop a deeper awareness and appreciation for the connection horses provide their companions to the natural world and all its mystery and beauty. This became increasingly obvious as the research progressed through the stories of the research participants evoking my own memories. The deep connection between humans, non-humans, and the natural world became an unexpected and welcome repetitive theme in the literature reviewed. It was the intention and hope of the researcher to provide a meaningful and focused synthesis of literary, human, and nonhuman research data, to adequately support the research question.

The discovery of Rosemary Anderson’s (2011) research method was synchronistic while weighing the appropriateness of different research methods and interpretive styles for identifying and synthesizing the research data. Intuitive inquiry naturally supported my interests and strengths, as researcher, and the literary discussion on nonrational modes of apprehension. Intuitive inquiry also challenged me to examine more closely my own relationship with my horse and companion of fourteen years, and my beliefs about the equine assisted activities and therapies industry. As I reviewed the research participant stories and specifically the literature focused on the growing disconnect between humans and the natural world, I was moved to reflect on how critical this connection had been to my own well-being. Horses had been vital to

maintaining and nurturing my continued connection to nature and developing a professional path that has kept me outdoors.

The Hermeneutic Circle of Interpretation

The research data was organized and grouped into common recurring themes centered on accomplishments, personal and professional, relationship, social engagement, presence, references to sensory language or experience, and the awareness of a dual dynamic that the horse brings to present moment awareness. Research participant descriptions of this dual dynamic included: power coupled with gentleness, a kind sensitive disposition combined with the possibility of panic and unpredictability. This dual dimension appeared to bring something mysterious to the relationship. Some of the comments that acknowledged the mystery horses embody were, “it is really not that describable,” “you know they were drawing them on the caves,” “miracle,” “one of the clearest signs of God’s love,” “real magic going on,” “weird,” “hard to put into words,” “fairytalish,” “hard to quantify,” “utmost importance,” and “I just ended up there.” All the participants appeared comfortable and accepting of this ambiguity as natural and an expected way of life when in the company of horses.

The data analysis revealed similar themes that were organized into groupings of six themes: caregiving, relationship, purpose and accomplishments, emotional and sensory awareness, life lessons and learning, and vocation. These themes were organized into three broad domains chosen to represent the thematic data: (a) mastery, (b) grounding, and (c) agency. Mastery refers to the data collected that communicates growth, proficiency in a area, or a base of knowledge gained through experience. Mastery is achieved through action and effort, a level of capability and confidence that has accrued over time evidenced by personal and professional accomplishments. These accomplishments can then become a grounding presence, provide a

sense of place measured by experience, and the reassurance that nothing is insurmountable. Mastery signifies a tolerance of ambiguity combined with the inner wisdom to recognize and act on what life was presenting as the innate agenda to follow. Although mastery may convey completeness, mastery considers the continuing cycle of growth met with acceptance and understanding.

Grounding, chosen as a broad domain emerging from the thematic data, refers to the collection of data that conveyed qualities that were typically associated with giving, receiving, or a mutual sharing of experience through a nurturing relationship. Grounding provides an approximation of security and safety found in a relationship that grounds one to a core sense of self found in relationship to another and in relationship to a knowledge of oneself. In this research, grounding would refer to the research participants sense of self discovered and revealed through the relationship with their equine companion.

Agency, chosen as a broad domain takes into consideration statements of purpose, direction, achievements, both personal and professional, career interests, pursuits, and experience; in addition, a desire to learn and an appreciation of lessons learned as an invitation to build character; a sense of responsibility to self and others and the ability to adapt to life circumstances; the confidence to make sound decisions even in times of adversity. A sense of agency is a process that directs one toward mastery. Grounding is needed to make the journey sustainable.

Mastery

Purpose and Accomplishments

When the interview data reflected comments the research participants made about their commitment to their horses, this commitment was established as a sense of purpose the

participants felt toward the care of another being. Their commitment to the care of their horses also provided the opportunity to learn better how to care for themselves. The type of care the research participant learned from their horse was self-care. This care of self emerged as a need for adventure, being outside and attuned to the experiences felt and sensed in the barn, on the trail, and around the farm. Horses made exposure to the natural elements necessary and worthwhile. There was an unspoken pride in the ability to thrive in the raw and physically demanding environments being close to horses requires. The experiences expressed by the research participants are identified through pseudonyms selected by and approved for use by the research participants.

Peak experiences were referenced in the interviews with Dorothy, Hillary, and Chex whether it was trail riding and camping out in Utah or being present for "eight or nine births" of horses. Much of the accomplishments noted were related to career choices, the care of horses, lessons learned, referenced in other categories, and gave the research participants a sense of purpose and meaning in their life.

Care Giving

The terms care giving, care taking, or caring appeared frequently in the research data collected. Although care of the horse may seem more aligned with the themes identified under grounding as a broad domain, it was a skill that showed mastery through the storied experiences shared. The understanding that the horse was dependent on care given by the research participant implied a sense of purpose when discussing care. Chex commented, "it is important to me to take the best care of them I can…I needed it a lot more than he did." It was easy to relate to Chex's comment since the comfort and care of my horse guided so much of what I did and the decisions I made. The care of the horse also exposed a background story of how caring for horses resulted in the participants caring for themselves. This became evident in parts of the narratives that

referenced a present moment awareness as calming when the participants would spend time with the horse or in tasks related to horse care which allowed the participants to enter into a stillness they found calming. Emotional self-care also seemed to develop for the research participants as necessary to maintain the quality of care and relationship to their horse. A reciprocity of care that benefits both horse and human was noted in the narratives. Care then becomes, for the human, an inwardly directed self-care, a soulful one, as the external needs of the horse are nurtured by their human companion.

Chex referenced a traumatic event in her life and credited her horse for helping her during that time:

> It was so traumatic for me. I rode every day, and when I would go to ride it didn't matter what I did or what state I was in…he just called me to be present in the moment. It was all gone, you be present in the moment right here with me and the other stuff wasn't going on when I was there, it was like a miracle.

Dorothy shared she has her horses in retirement now and is more realistic about the financial, physical, and time commitments involved in their care: "I do love them and take good care of them…I don't believe I can sell him…I don't believe someone would give him a good life with his emotional needs." Dorothy shared her guilt related to boarding her horses at a facility after selling her farm and turning over the daily care of her horses to someone else. The responsibility became too much to manage on her own and other important areas of her life were being neglected and needed to be nurtured and brought into balance.

Hillary began her relationship with horses at a young age and bonded with a pony named Diamond. As Hillary tried to describe the intense bond that formed with Diamond she commented that it was "hard to put into words…to care for him and have it reciprocated by the pony in that way." Hillary commented on the realization that she has to be in a very calm and focused place to provide the kind of care needed by her aging and retired herd.

Grounding

Emotional and Sensory Awareness

Statements referring to an emotional or sensory experience as a feeling function or embodied experience were prevalent among the participant stories. “I notice that horses really respond to consistency, not just in activities but how you move, how you turn your body, how you position yourself” was a reflection made by Chex. Chex shared how her horses were very attuned to her “and know where I am in space and what I am doing.” I reflected on this statement in my own experiences with horses. This proprioceptive attunement may be reciprocal due to both species sensing trust but at the same time being aware of the unpredictable nature of a species that is not their own. For this reason, there is an unknown quality about the relationship that will require an awareness that comes from not being able to read completely the intentions behind the body narrative when spoken language is not a form of communication or understanding. This does require a human to be more aware of their own body and what they may be communicating through nonverbal cues.

This interspecies relationship is helpful to humans by increasing an understanding of nonverbal communication provided by the horse and an awareness of what messages the nonverbal ques the human is communicating. An awareness of nonverbal ques and body language is a social skill that can improve an understanding of relationships. When focusing on the sensory experiences that are very much a part of time spent with horses, Chex summed it up:

> To me it is almost like a tangible thing even if it isn’t, it is so real, it smells, it has feeling, it is a very intense sensory experience and our sense of smell has such triggers and there are such great smells in a barn and it is the culmination of all your life with horses and every time you smell it, it grows.

Niki, when referring to her work environment that involves horses remarked, “you can hear the water. Amazing all the things you can hear. I am fortunate to be in the barn all the time

with no heating or walls." Niki described a heightened sense of awareness when alone in a barn, "by yourself and hanging out in the barn doing your thing, [you] just notice the calmness…noises and nature and what is going on around you."

As I listened to Niki's experiences, I reflected on the peaceful quality that life with horses grants humans. Everything you do becomes more deliberate and intentional when time is suspended in the here and now, "I am more aware of my emotions and my energy. I am checking in with myself and reminding myself to be on horse time not human time which meant being present and letting the clock slow way down so you can just notice everything and in that noticing…experiences have the opportunity to come alive. It was a dream like state."

> My world changed when he entered it and again when he departed it. I miss him so much. I can still smell him and his smell would change with the seasons. I remember what he felt like to ride, how my body felt on him and molded to him. His long neck made me feel safe and my hands against him and the place where I touched his mane when we rode. I remember how that feels even now. The experience of grooming him and giving him massages until he drooled a big puddle and the sticky grime on my hands afterwards, and the softness of his muzzle. I have avoided grieving his death. It is so painful the loss.

Dorothy describes her emotional connection to horses, "it was a very strong emotional reaction to horses, in a field, toy horses, stuffed horses, horses in movies, I have been horse crazy my entire life." Dorothy shares her memories related to sensory experiences as "the smell of the saddle," "smell of the hay," "the hair," "or even Hooflex, or you go into the store that sold all the horse stuff, so there'd be the leather and the hay and those smells excite me." "My horse, the drama king, he makes a big deal out of a lot of things, so I have fallen, and been thrown. I have begun to develop some fears. I am not willing to risk my health. I am fifty-eight and I bounce but I don't want to bounce anymore. I don't want to push my luck." "I call it horse guilt. Had it, have it. Oh yeah, it is a very real thing…Am I being selfish or benevolent?" Dorothy described what

she notices about herself when in the company of horses, “a wide-open awareness because they could be dangerous and unpredictable, completely on and present.”

Hillary describes the quality of her time spent with horses as, “I feel very relaxed, when I am with a horse and giving full attention they are very receptive and enjoy calm communion time.” “I love being out in different weather…we are in it together…shifts of the sun, moon, stars, patterns of seasons, changes in footing for me and how the elements affect this…our energy.” She continues her reflection:

> Horses carry me to woods, creeks, mountains exposing me to various flora and fauna allowing me to observe greater distances and giving me cues to wildlife presence. Horses are quiet, allowing me to hear birds, wind, crackling branches from forest dwellers…traveling where prints may be seen in the mud, away from human spaces, telling me where others have tread. Observing more closely the smells of the forest floor or grassy field…Just plain being outside, finding a nest made up of horse hair, manure filled with mushrooms or earthworms. It is so much better with horses, interaction with them creates a shared natural world experience, allowing you to absorb it all without words.

Hillary shares time with her retired herd giving them massages and working acupressure points to relieve aches and pains, “hands are very healing.”

Relationships

Niki shared these words and phrases that referenced relationship when describing her experiences with horses, “attunement,” “patience,” “relating,” “connecting,” “relationship.” “I always had a natural inclination to have connections or attunement with the horse and not what we wanted the horse to do” and ask, “how does the horse feel about it?” When referring to her relationship to nature, Niki remarked that she is outside all day, “I am very appreciative.” Niki adds:

> I consider horses to be more oriented to nature than we are. I always loved being outside in nature. Horses are much more genuine in nature. Horses are more aware of what is going on around them in nature and in people.

Niki shared comments not only about relationships with her horses, but how horses played a role in improving an understanding of herself and how to be in relationship with humans. “I never had trouble connecting with horses, but socially and personally with people I did. I was very introverted.” Niki explained that it was not related to a dislike of people, “I started realizing I am not training the horse but training the person,” and through training the person in relationship with the horse, the trainer also learns. Niki also described what she noticed about herself when spending undemanding time with horses, “I am much more open to connection and tuned into everything around me and I am much more regulated [nervous system]. It is the regulation and being more open to connection. Not just get them [horses] out and this is what I need.”

Chex made the following comments about her relationship with horses, “caring for,” “loving being to lean on,” “being present for a birth is amazing,” “I try hard to make an attempt to see things through the horses’ eyes.” “Depend on,” “tending to,” “coordinating your effort with,” “just called me to be present in the moment,” “I am attuned,” “closeness or interest,” “one of the clearest ways to feel and express love.” “I wouldn’t want to be in relationship with someone who wanted to separate that” was expressed by Chex. “That” meaning the part of Chex she defines as horses as “a part of who I am.” “Cause that’s not a person who cares or understands me in anyway. It’s a sad person.”

My own references to relationship in my story of horse companionship were, “belonging,” “community,” “women I can relate to,” “he was in his element and I in mine,” “we just came alive in nature.” “We covered a lot of territory together.” “My heart swells, I don’t know how else to describe it. My heart becomes bigger and I become a better person when I am with them [horses]. They bring out the best in me. They see me on the inside and reflect that beauty back to me and that beauty is from being in their company.”

Dorothy describes the best years of her horse life was trail riding with other women and their horses. “I met a woman that needed a riding companion and she had the skills I didn’t which was the ability to not get lost.” “We did a lot of beautiful riding together.” Dorothy’s trail riding covered five states in the southeast of the United States and an extended trail riding trip in Utah. “We were dedicated to our horses. It was a way of life.” “It is definitely something I can share with others. Love of animals, outdoors.” Dorothy added that she now shares her horses with others and feels a sense of gratitude by helping in their enthusiasm for horses.

Hillary describes “real serious family heartbreak” when she visited her first pony, and saw that he was not in good health, after outgrowing him and moving to a bigger horse. “I made a vow at that point that I need to take care for life…responsibility, follow through, care. Do what I can to take care of them with help…It is very fairytalish. Something shifted about how relationships work.” Hillary commented about another horse as a teenager, “Star chose me and I chose him. I was in love. He was right for me. Feeling strongly about connection. Hard to quantify what is happening in that moment of connection, there was just something.” Hillary describes what she notices when she is with her horses, “awareness, quiet calming, purpose, groundedness, interest, curiosity, time change or lack of thoughts in terms of minutes…more of a flow of presentness without concern of time, freedom, alive.”

Agency

Learning and Life Lessons

“Maybe it was learning from mistakes,” was a comment shared by Niki when I reflected Niki’s ability to intuit when a professional change was needed and well timed. Niki also demonstrated the courage to move on professionally when her work environment became incongruent with her need to grow. “Tremendous growth personally and professionally” was

evident in the interview with Niki as she listed off a diary of professional moves that led her further down the path of professional development, which she credits for advancing her personal relationships as well.

As I noted Niki's comments on her professional development centered around horses, I reflected on my own career change at age 39. I left IBM in 2000 to find a vocation that seemed more truly aligned with my values and a need to give back. This decision sprang from volunteering at a therapeutic riding center. I pursued the certification process to become a therapeutic riding instructor. This led to horse ownership. "He [my horse] inspired me to buy a piece of property and develop it into a farm." That was one of my biggest accomplishments and life lessons. The idea popped in my head and I never stopped to question my competency to succeed. It was all trial and error. My horse was with me during this project making it worthwhile. "So many of my decisions centered around him [my horse]." He worked alongside me in two different therapeutic riding programs. "The kids I taught in therapeutic riding loved him. He looked like a Hollywood horse straight out of a western movie. The little boys loved riding the big paint horse. They probably felt like cowboys when they rode him. He was so kind."

Dorothy's learning, life lessons, and agency began at age 12. Dorothy shared a story of her parents agreeing to purchase a horse if Dorothy and her younger sister paid for the upkeep and provided the care. A career of babysitting and fruit packing financed the dream of a horse crazy girl. Dorothy rode her bike a mile or two down a busy rode to feed her horse daily. Learning to clip her horse's feet rather than spending money on a farrier, and doing without a saddle and bridle were the trade-offs that made horse ownership possible for Dorothy, at age 12, and her sister at age 10. "There was nothing we would rather do." "Unbelievably, I did it." "I

think about it now it's like crazy." "With horses, I have had to learn something that I don't know any other way I could have learned to unlearn reaction. If there is danger on the trail, it is my job to calm down. That is not the kind of person I am. I am a highly reactive emotional person."

> My job was to learn, if I wanted to live, was to unlearn panic and reaction and stuff like that. A huge learning process, because they will read (body), and so that's been a really big deal. Learning to relax muscles when you want to run and hide. That's been huge for me and nothing else could have taught that. Because you can fake people out with a smile and you can't fake a horse out with a smile.

Hillary described a process of growing and learning together through her horse experiences. Hillary recalled some advice from an "old man who owned the barn where I bought Star, go slow, walking and time together," "miraculously, it worked. We coasted through…strange cooperative partnership." Hillary owned Star as a yearling until he was 32. During Hillary's career running a trail riding program she bonded with a large working herd. The learning experiences she described were about herd dynamics and routines. She credits this job as teaching her the skill of assessment. Assessing where to place a horse in a line of trail horses. "Horses require a certain set up to do the job well and keep people safe. I learned about horses' ability to cope with certain types of people."

> I learned a lot about horses but through horses learned about people. People would just open up about the deepest private things, breast cancer, broken marriages, child trouble, deep problems they were facing. Somehow opening up because they feel safe. It wasn't just me being there it was the horse. We would come off the trail and people would break down in tears…Best rides were related to the horse and what it brought out in people…real magic going on. Sometimes a job, everyday awakenings that happened.

Vocation

Dorothy returned to horses later in life through a career of volunteerism and philanthropy at a therapeutic horseback riding center close to her home. She coordinated volunteers, special events, horse care, and assisted in the therapeutic riding lessons. She and her husband made a substantial anonymous donation to the center for capital improvements. Dorothy disclosed that

finding this vocation helped her through a near nervous breakdown. “Needless to say, I did some amazing healing.” “That experience being with like-minded people being with horses and being outside was amazing.” During this time, Dorothy also donated her time, energy, and land to rescuing horses. “I was burned out from work, not enough exercise and bureaucracy.” “Being around horses did give me a sense of purpose and I enjoyed all the physicality of it. There were a lot of problems dealing with people, opinions, criticisms, and unwelcome advice.”

My work as a therapeutic riding instructor with youth and adolescents inspired graduate school and a master’s in counseling psychology. My work with horses could continue in the emerging field of equine facilitated psychotherapy. A week after graduating, I accepted a job working as a therapist in wilderness programming for adolescents. Within four years, equine facilitated psychotherapy was added to wilderness therapeutic programming with a base camp model. I was recruited to join the new model combining wilderness and horses for therapeutic benefit. “They [horses] have given me a professional focus that takes me outside and allows me to work experientially in the moment. I do not do well spending a lot of time indoors.” I was then recruited to a residential treatment center for pre-adolescent girls to develop equine therapeutic programming where I have been since 2012. Horses, the outdoors, and working with adolescents is very fulfilling.

Niki emphasized several times in the interview that she never had an intention to work with horses professionally, “I just ended up doing it.” “I realized quickly the type [of training] I was in had very little to do with training a horse but everything to do with training yourself and training people.” Niki also had a career as a Path International certified therapeutic horseback riding instructor serving individuals with special needs. When reflecting on that time in her professional development, Niki commented, “I always had a problem with therapy and

occupational therapy done on horseback and thinking they were doing things that didn't need to be on horseback and weren't considering the horse in that work."

Hillary got a job to pay for Star, her horse companion for close to 30 years. This resulted in a life career with horses working at horse riding camps, caring for a draft horse team at college, working for the National Park Service packing out supplies on horseback related to a wild boar project. This led to a long-term career at an estate property that had an equestrian center and trail riding program where Hillary held long term positions in each. Hillary adopts and cares for retiring horses from these programs on her own farm. She also allows the practice of equine assisted psychotherapy on her property and gardening.

CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION

Women who choose horses as companions seem to integrate their relationship experiences with horses into many other areas of their life, as evidenced by the five narratives presented in the Findings, of which, my experiences were included. How horses have been influential in the lives of the research participants covered a range of topics that referenced important areas critical to personality development. These areas included personal agency, emotional growth, and a connection to nonhuman nature as something essential to their well-being.

Horses gave a sense of purpose to the lives of these women that altered the course of their lives and influenced the decisions they made so companionship with horses was guaranteed. The lives of these women have been forever changed because horses have been there with them and they are the better for it. The love, gratitude, and appreciation was expressly given and not constrained when the research participants tried to describe the degree to which horses have influenced their lives.

The benefit of applying narrative research techniques was the flexibility it gave the researcher to blend with other complimentary research methodologies. This created movement toward meaning through the analysis of experience centered narratives captured in words expressed verbally and a visual narration expressed through the interaction of research participant and her horse observed by me. The narrated story of the relationship was animated by the visual story. Narrative researchers are responsible for the analysis of personal accounts of individual experience, giving consideration to the social, historical, and psychological factors that mediate the story. Josselson remarked, “Narrative analysis is conducted within two hermeneutic traditions detailed by Ricoeur: a hermeneutics of faith, which aims to restore

meaning to a text, and a hermeneutics of suspicion, which attempts to decode meanings that are disguised" (as cited in Wertz, 2011, p. 226). In this study, both hermeneutic traditions were used to restore and uncover meaning in literary text and in experience centered narratives.

I took interpretive authority in the analysis of the individual accounts of experience to re-represent experiences that were important to understanding the phenomenon in the interspecies relationship dynamic under investigation. Fundamental to narrative interpretation, is the researcher's appreciation of the actual experience shared by the individual in a way that honors the felt meaning within the description of that experience (Atkinson, as cited in Clandinin, 2007). A genuine resonance with the narrated experiences of the research participants was possible for me since it was a shared experience. It was important that I entered inside the meaning of the experience for a deeper understanding. It was also important for me to bracket my own experience while recording research data and to be aware of my own projections onto the experiences of the research participants as the data was collected and interpreted.

> Crossing the threshold into the interview also involves opening yourself to emotional experiences that you cannot predict but will have to manage, and to a relationship with the interviewee that will both shape the interaction and continue in both of your minds after you have said goodbye. (Josselson, 2013, p. 13)

Building rapport and establishing trust with the research participant by following their experience rather than leading helped facilitate this process.

The interrelated nature of the experiences captured in the narrative research, was difficult to separate out into themes that fit into neat and clear designations. Most of the themes were interdependent and could not be easily relegated to any specific area without duplication. Three domains: mastery, grounding, and agency were identified to help organize and group the themes in a way that represented the meaning in the stories narrated by the research participants. It became evident through the data analysis, the research participants' relationship with their horse

companion touched their life in broad strokes of meaning across multiple domains. Their brand of companionship had infiltrated every aspect of her life. Important life choices evolved around horses as companions. Her personal, professional, social, and emotional choices centered around her relationship with horses. Life experiences seemed sweeter and more meaningful because horses were present as a purpose.

Any discussion of relationship between the research participants and their horses also referenced caregiving, a relational endeavor, and life lessons learned from these relationship experiences. Deeply felt emotional and sensory experiences were expressed. A sense of purpose, accomplishments, and life lessons contributed to the domains of mastery, grounding, and agency in areas of intellectual and emotional development. The recurring themes, revealed through narrative experience, supported the idea of novel experiences being instrumental to an enlargement of consciousness. Haule (2011) discussed novel experiences in the literature reviewed as relevant to the psychodynamic theory common to Jungian psychology.

Each of the narratives represented an unconventional path of one's own unfolding within the feminine-equine relationship dyad the research participant felt compelled to follow. The research participants appeared comfortable with the awareness that their relationship with horses carried an element of mystery in ways that could not be described, further adding to the novelty of their experiences and Jung's theory of the archetypes. There seemed to be an acceptance of this mysterious quality and an understanding that there is some appeal in that aspect of the relationship. The research participant's relationship to horses has provided an anchor and compass in their personality development as well as motivation to grow in areas that stretched the participants outside their comfort zone.

There was gratitude and appreciation for the experiences horses have brought to the lives of the research participants through career interests, learning, life lessons, an increase in emotional awareness, personal development, and the connection with nature that horses afforded them. A life with horses did not appear intentional for the research participants but grew organically from an interest in horses at a young age. Horses appeal to women by offering a connection to nature and a sense of purpose in areas that may feel more natural for women when care giving and relating are aspects horses respond to that build trust and deepen the relationship experience.

Women experienced a sense of accomplishment when they had to learn and master tasks that may be more typical and comfortable for men like operating farm equipment. The skill and knowledge required to drive large vehicles, hitch horse trailers, load, haul, and unload horses, heavy lifting, and manual labor, can initially be intimidating and outside the conventional norms of what is expected of women. Her desire to trail ride with her horse may provide the motivation to face those fears and acquire the skill and knowledge to meet her need for adventure in relationship with her horse. These decisions and choices validate her unique desires and individuation.

A woman begins to come to terms with the undeveloped aspects of own personality and the need to pursue her unique interests in her relationship with horses. As Jung (1953/1977) wrote:

> Individuation means becoming an "in-dividual," and, in so far as "individuality" embraces our innermost, last, and incomparable uniqueness, it also implies becoming one's own self. We could therefore translate individuation as "coming to selfhood" or "self-realization." (para. 266)

Horses imbue many of the traits that Jung segregated into gender specific designations. Women, who choose horses as companions, develop areas of her personality regardless of whether they have been defined as typical for men or women or appear conventional to social norms.

Horses are a benevolent teacher and gentle companions. They also arouse fear of the unknown since their natures are also unpredictable. Horses as sentient and intuitive creatures can be sensitive to emotional states in humans as reviewed in the literature. This requires caring horse owners to tend to their own emotional growth by increasing tolerance of stressful events as the research participants discussed. This helps the individual learn to focus on emotional congruence when in the company of horses to increase the mutual enjoyment of time spent together. The literature reviewed (Haule, 2011) considered Jung's work on incongruent inner and outer emotional states as a method for "destabilizing normality" (p. 168-169). Practices that tolerate experiences of the non-ordinary, as presented in the narrative data through the research participant experiences, help assist the process of transformation which leads to individuation.

The ability to tolerate stressful events builds emotional resiliency and trust in one's ability to manage the chaos within. Siegel (2007) and Miller-Karas (2015) encouraged experiences that retrain neural functioning to pause and reflect. The presence, and in the moment experiencing that the research participants described, are opportunities within the feminine-equine relationship dyad that reinforce directed attention, sensory awareness, and attunement. A thoughtful pause, that presence manifests, contributes to an increase in emotional control and a decrease in automatic nervous system responses that stimulate the survival brain to react.

Not only does presence with a horse facilitate self-reflection, but presence is conducive to self-discovery that is grounding. The literature in support of the research question coincides with the narrative data suggesting that horses have helped women ground to an inner source of

knowing and emotional self-care that is beneficial in their relationships with horses, people, and personal development. The research participants described time spent with their horses in a natural setting to be full of sensory experiences that were easily recalled. The vivid quality of their memories allowed a reexperiencing of the pleasure in that moment in a way that was grounding and reassuring. Resourcing those experiences as a technique to rebalance the nervous system in times of distress builds resilience.

Jung's psychodynamic theory offers practitioners of equine assisted activities and therapies (EAAT) a new theoretical view for better understanding and explaining the dynamic that is occurring between horse and human that contributes to improved psycho/social/emotional functioning. Psychodynamic theory, as defined by Jung, and his theory of the archetypes gives the EAAT practitioner another lens for assessment and understanding the neurobiology of transformative experiences. Spending time outdoors with horses decommissions the ordinary and stretches one outside their comfort zone by engaging in novel experiences that are transformative for the individual. Transformation increases awareness, expands consciousness, and facilitates a sense of well-being. The research focused on organizations that are dedicated to improving EAAT practices that focused on the well-being of both horse and human. The growth the industry is currently experiencing considers the neurobiology of relationship as central to the experience.

The current challenge to integrating the perspective of novel experiences as instrumental to the benefits realized in EAAT, is that researchers and their research results in EAAT have been invalidated due to the presence of novelty effects. Shadish et al. wrote, "Novelty effects refer to the elation and energy that ensue from a new and exciting experience" (as cited in Anestis, Anestis, & Zawilinski, 2014, p. 1122). Although Haule (2011) and Jung referred to the

importance of novelty effects as instrumental to a transformative experience, Anestis et al. (2014), argued that "equine approaches are especially vulnerable to novelty effects because interacting with a horse is probably an unusual and exciting experience for most individuals" (p.1122).

Anestis (2014) continued to comment on novelty effects in research:

> for a condition to control for the novelty effects inherent in Equine-Related Treatments (ERT), participants in the control condition would need to interact with another large and familiar social animal (e.g., cow), ideally holding all other factors equal (e.g., setting). It should be noted that this would be a particularly stringent test, as it assumes that therapeutic gains are specific to horses rather than generalizing to other large animals. (p. 1122)

This comment made by Anestis is surprising, in particular, his suggestion of a cow as a comparable large, familiar, social animal. Cows do not appear to be known for their relational nature in the same way a horse is, does not share a similar history with humans that has allowed horses to forge a relational bond with humans throughout civilizations. Humans have primarily relied on cows as a source of dairy and meat.

Cows do not have the conformation, athleticism, and possibly the intelligence that horses have prohibiting cows from sharing in experiences and activities with humans that have been transformative for the human. The horse human bond can be reciprocal when the human values the relationship. A familiar domesticated nonpredatory large social animal to serve as a suitable horse equivalent for ERT research purposes may prove to be difficult and potentially limit further research in the EAAT industry if what Anestis et al. (2014) proposed is the standard to move research forward in EAAT.

A life with horses provides novel experiences and learning that are grounding and transformative; trail rides in the forest, life in the barn, life on the land, tolerance of all weather conditions, manual labor, shoveling manure, shoveling snow, breaking ice in water troughs,

attention to pasture rotation, and understanding the growth cycles of spring grasses, their sugar content and related lameness issues for horses, selecting, producing, and baling hay, storm water management, bodies of water in close proximity to horses, the flow of water, access to water, and not contaminating water from equine waste. Responsibility for a horse's living environment, health, and diet provided through horse and farm ownership supplies an unlimited opportunity for decommissioning the ordinary and increasing occasions for growth.

Summary

The ability to discern an appropriate direction when life situations present contradicting choices or solutions is a critical and invaluable skill to develop. Discernment develops from an accumulation of experiences that build the wisdom and confidence in one's own agency to manage choices that serve the innate potential unique to the individual. Mastery is a form of differentiation that encourages the principle of discernment. One does not come into mastery if they exist in a one-sided position. The individual's differentiation achieved through individuation is required. Holding the tension between incompatible and opposing positions requires grace, determination, and the belief in and possession of one's faculties to persevere. Fidelity to the law of one's own being is the journey on which individuation is grounded and requires a deep loyalty, trust, and commitment to personality development. Jung (1954/1991) wrote, "To develop one's own personality is indeed an unpopular undertaking, a deviation that is highly uncongenial to the herd...they [who choose the unconventional path] are the flower and the fruit, the ever fertile seeds of the tree of humanity" (para. 298).

Jung (1954/1991) referred to "what is commonly called *vocation:* an irrational factor that destines a man [woman] to emancipate himself [herself] from the herd and from its well-worn paths" (para. 300). For some women, her emancipation may be from the human herd and the

well-worn conventional paths that have shackled her in the past and connection with the herd of Equus and their co-habitation with the natural world. Horses, as a vocation for women, becomes not only a professional path but also a path that is personal when her developmental experiences bring her an awareness of psycho/social/emotional/sensory and somatic experiences that deepen her relationship to self and others. A woman's humanity can be explored through her relationship with horses and her connection to the natural world.

Jung (1954/1991) believed the original meaning of "to have a vocation" was to be called or "addressed by a voice" (para. 301-304). Further, "if he [she] hearkens to the voice, he [she] is at once set apart and isolated, as he [she] has resolved to obey the law that commands him [her] from within" (para. 301-304). Jung had much to say about following conventional paths in one's choice of vocation: "Creative life always stands outside convention" (para. 305). Jung cautioned that it is through the mechanism of convention that leads one to an unconscious path. Jung encouraged development of the individual nature of the personality: "To the extent that a man [woman] is untrue to the law of his [her] being and does not rise to personality, he [she] has failed to realize his [her] life's meaning" (para. 314).

A woman's companionship with a horse can equip her with the skills and desire to liberate aspects of herself that have been marginalized or compromised by convention. Emancipation becomes a creative enterprise from the exclusionary margins of any form of domination or exclusion that oppress the innate potential for wholeness. Individuation is equally attainable to all who join the search for answers to questions that pertain to purpose, meaning, vocation, and the unclaimed aspects of the personality that need integration.

Caring becomes reciprocal in the feminine-equine relationship dyad when care includes emotional health that reflects a willingness to tolerate incompatible points of view and the

practice of discernment. Resilient individuals are those who learn to tolerate stressful events and adverse conditions. Trust, self-respect, and healthy relationships develop from the choice to meet the needs of all involved. The quality of a relationship can be measured by assessing if the relationship supports her unique path, or if the relationship is seducing her off her path toward individuation (Chapman, personal communication, 2007).

REFERENCES

Anderson, R. (2011). Intuitive inquiry: Exploring the mirroring discourse of disease. In F. Wertz, K. Charmaz, L. M. McMullen, R. Josselson, R. Anderson, E. McSpadden (Eds.), *Five ways of doing qualitative analysis* (pp. 243-276). New York, NY: The Guilford Press.

Andrews, M., Squire, C., & Tamboukou, M. (2008). *Doing narrative research.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Anestis, M., Anestis, J., & Zawilinski, L. (2014). Equine-related activities for mental disorders lck empirical support: a systematic review of empirical investigations. *Journal of Clinical Psychology, 70(12),* 1115-1132. doi:10.1002/jclp.22113

Ashbury University. (2002-2017). Ashbury university equine center [website content]. Retrieved from https://www.asbury.edu/academics/departments/natural-sciences/hper/equine-center

Association of Human-Animal Interactions Organization International. (n.d.). IAHAIO about page [website content]. Retrieved from http://iahaio.org/new/index.php?display=about

Avery-Clark, C. (2014). *Yearning:A Jungian perspective on creativity* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (AAT1318657182)

Babejóvá, E. (2009). And the river swelled with horses. *Spring: A Journal of Archetype and Culture, 82*, 131-151. Retrieved from http://www.springjournalandbooks.com

Barnaby, K., & D'Acierno, P. (Eds.). (1990). *C.G. Jung and the humanities: Toward a hermeneutics of culture.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Berry, P. (2008). *Echo's subtle body: Contributions to an archetypal psychology.* Putnam, CT: Spring. (Original work published 1982)

Berstein, J. (2005). *Living in the borderland: The evolution of consciousness and the challenge of healing trauma.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Birdsall, A. (2005). *Abortion, myth, and metamorphis* (Unpublished master's thesis). Pacifica Graduate Institute, Carpinteria, CA.

Brady, H. A., Hernandez, H. M., & Guay, K. A. (2011). The status of equine-assisted therapy programs within higher education. In *Journal of Equine Veterinary Science, 31*, 230-356. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jevs.2011.03.194

Bradshaw, G.A. (2010). The evolution of ethology: An interview with Marc Bekoff. *Spring: A Journal of Archetype and Culture*, *83*, 320-327. Retrieved from https://www.philanthropysouthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/bekoff%20interviewfinal.pdf

Bray, B. (2016). ACA endorses animal-assisted-therapy competencies. Counseling today: A publication of the American Counseling Association. Retrieved from http://ct.counseling.org/2016

Brehm, A. (1895). The odd-toed animals: The horses. (W. Haacke Trans.) In A. Brehm, E. Pechuloesche, & W. Haacke (Eds.), *Brehm's life of animals:A complete natural history for popular home instruction and for the use of schools* (vol.1, pp. 405-413). Chicago, IL: A. N. Marquis.

Broersma, T. (2009, Phone interview). Retrieved from http://horsesensebusiness.com/efmha/

Casanova, K. (2009). The wild feminine: Reconnecting to a powerful archetypal image. *Spring: A Journal of Archetype and Culture, 82*, 115-130. Retrieved from http://www.praxiskrone.ch/

Certified Board Equine Interactive Professional. (n.d.) About and certification pages [website content]. Retrieved from http://www.cbeip.org

Cirlot, J. (1962). Horse. In *A dictionary of symbols* (p. 152). New York, NY: Philosophical Library.

Clandinin, D. (2007). *Handbook of narrative inquiry: Mapping a methodology*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Colman, A. (2001). Psychoid. In *Dictionary of psychology* (p. 599). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Cowan, L. (2017). Women and land: Reflections on physicality. In L. Gardner & F. Gray (Eds.) *Feminist views from somewhere:Post-Jungian themes in feminist theory* (p. 3-8). New York, NY: Routledge.

Creswell, J. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

de Castillejo, I. (1973). *Knowing woman: A feminine psychology.* Boston, MA: Shambhala.

Denzin, N., & Lincoln, Y. (Eds.). (2008). *Collecting and interpreting qualitative materials.* Los Angeles, CA: Sage.

DePrekel, M. (n.d.). Equine-Facilitated psychotherapy (EFP) for the treatment of trauma [online article]. Retrieved from http://cairnshealing.com/uploads/3/4/1/3/3413162/equine-facilitated_psychotherapy_efp__for_the_treatment_of_trauma.pdf

DePrekel, M. (2003). An interview with Molly DePrekel. *Strides*, *The Official Publication of the North American Riding for the Handicapped Association, 9/*3, 14-16. Retrieved from http://cairnshealing.com/

Dowd, A. (2017). Becoming human. In L. Gardne & F. Gray (Eds.), *Feminist views from somewhere* (pp. 9-24). Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.

Duras, M. (1981). From an interview. In E. Marks & I. de Courtivron (Eds.), *New French feminisms: An anthology* p. 174-176. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press.

Edinger, E. (1972). *Ego and archetype: Individuation and the religious function of the psyche.* Boston, MA: Shambala.

Edinger, E. (1994). *Transformation of libido: A seminar on C.G. Jung's symbols of transformation* (D. Cordic,Ed.; Based on Edinger lecture series). Los Angeles, CA: The C.G. Jung Bookstore.

Eponaquest. (2015). Best practice guidelines [website content]. Retrieved from http://eponaquest.com/ethics-standards-of-practice/

Eponaquest. (2017). About and overview pages [website content]. Retrieved from http://eponaquest.com/about

Equine Facilitated Mental Health Association. (2008). Vision statement. *Equine Facilitated Mental Health Association News: A Special Interest Section of NARHA, 12*/3, 2.

Equine Assisted Growth and Learning Association. (2009-2010a). Home page [website content]. Retrieved from http://eagala.org/

Equine Assisted Growth and Learning Association. (2009-2010b). Military page [website content]. Retrieved from http://eagala.org/military

Equine Assisted Growth and Learning Association. (2009-2010c). College and university pages [website content]. Retrieved from http://home.eagala.org/uni

Equine Guided Education Association (n.d.) About history of EGEA page [website content]. Retrieved from https://egeassociation.wordpress.com/about/history-of-egea/

Faulkner, P., & Vidrine, M. (2001). A brief history of therapeutic horsemanship. *Horse Time, Inc. Clinical Training Manual,* pp. 4-5.

Felitti, V., Anda, R., & Nordenberg, D. (1998). Relationship of childhood abuse and household dysfunction to many of the leading causes of death in adults: The adverse childhood experiences (ACE) study. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine, 14/*4, 245-355. Retrieved from http://www.ajpmonline.org/article/S0749-3797(98)00017-8/pdf

Gergen, K. (1991). *The saturated self: Dilemmas of identity in contemporary life.* New York, NY: Basic Books.

Hannah, B. (2006). *The archetypal symbolism of animals.* Wilmette, IL: Chiron.

Hauke, C. (2000). *Jung and the postmodern: The interpretation of realities.* London, England: Routledge.

Haule, J. R. (2011). *Jung in the 21st century volume one: Evolution and Archetype.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Held, C. (2006). *Horse girl: An archetypal study of women, horses, and trauma healing* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (AAT 9238374)

Horses in Education and Therapy International. (n.d.). Federation of Horses in Education and Therapy International about, history, vision and mission pages [website content]. Retrieved from http://www.hetifederation.org/about.html

Hillman, J. (1996). *The soul's code: In search of character and calling.* New York, NY: Warner Books.

Hillman, J. (1997). *Dream animals.* San Francisco, CA: Chronicle Books.

Hollis, J. (2000). *The archetypal imagination.* College Station, TX: A&M University Press.

Hayne, N. A. (n.d.). Analytical psychology. In *The Corsini encyclopedia of psychology and behaviors science* (googlebooks, 4th ed, pp. 824-825). New York, NY: Wiley. Retrieved from https://books.google.com/books

Horses and Human Research Foundation. (n.d.). About, mission and goals pages [website content]. Retrieved from http://www.horsesandhumans.org

Howey, O. (1958). *The horse in magic and myth.* New York, NY: Castle Books.

Institute for Human Animal Connection. (2017). IHAC education and programs pages [website content]. Retrieved from http://www.du.edu/humananimalconnection/programs-education/eamh.html

International Society for Anthrozoology. (2014). International Society for Anthrozoology and *Anthrozoös:* journal publication home, about and journal pages [website content]. Retrieved from http://www.isaz.net/isaz/anthrozoos

Jobe, T. (2015, October). Relationship logic principles. In T. Jobe (Founder), *Natural lifemanship advanced training.* Training conducted at Horse Sense of the Carolinas, Marshall, NC.

Jobe, T. (2016, July 1). The science of emotions [video file]. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1vQ-ue8WnAQ

Jobe, T., & Jobe, B. (2015). Natural Lifemanship: Trauma Focused Equine Assisted Psychotherapy (TF-EAP™). *Training Manual,* pp. 3-59.

Jobe, T., & Shultz-Jobe, B., & McFarland, L. (2016). *Fundamentals of Natural Lifemanship: Trauma-Focused Equine Assisted Psychotherapy (TF-EAP™).* Liberty Hill, TX: Natural Lifemanship.

Josselson, R. (2007). *Interviewing for qualitative inquiry: A relational approach.* New York, NY: Guilford Press.

Josselson, R. (2011). Narrative research: Constructing, deconstructing, and reconstructing story. In F. Wertz, K. Charmaz, L. M. McMullen, R. Josselson, R.Anderson, & E. McSpadden (Eds.), *Five ways of doing qualitative analysis*(pp. 224-242). New York, NY: The Guilford Press.

Jung, C. G. (1968). Psychology and alchemy (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung* (vol. 12). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1953)

Jung, C. G. (1970). Civilizations in transition (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung* (Vol. 10). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1964)

Jung, C. G. (1976). Symbols of transformation (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung* (Vol. 5). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1956)

Jung, C. G. (1977). Two essays on analytical psychology (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung* (Vol. 7). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1953)

Jung, C. G. (1978). The spirit in man, art, and literature (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung* (Vol. 15). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1966)

Jung, C. G. (1981). The structure and dynamics of the psyche (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung* (Vol. 8). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1960)

Jung, C. G. (1984). *Seminar on dream analysis*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1938)

Jung, C. G. (1985). The practice of psychotherapy (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung.* (Vol. 16, pp. 3-75). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1954)

Jung, C. G. (1989). Freud and psychoanalysis (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung.* (vol. 4). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1961)

Jung, C. G. (1989). Mysterium coniunctionis (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung.* (vol. 14, pp. 89-183). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1963)

Jung, C. G. (1990). The archetypes and the collective unconscious (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung* (Vol. 9). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1959)

Jung, C. G. (1990). Psychological type. (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung.* (Vol. 6). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1971)

Jung, C. G. (1991). The development of personality. (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.) In H. Read et al. (Series Eds), *The collected works of C.G. Jung* (Vol. 17, pp. 167-186). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1954)

Knowles, D. S. (1999). The numinous horse: This so greatly loved body. *Spring: A Journal of Archetype and Culture*, *65*, 123-130. Retrieved from www.springjournalandbooks.com

Koch, L. F. (2008). *What impact does owning or riding a horse have on emotional well-being of women?* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (AAT3291950)

Kohanov, L. (2001). *The tao of equus:A woman's journey of healing and transformation through the way of the horse.* Novato, CA: New World Library.

Lauter, E., & Rupprecht, C. S. (1985). Introduction. In E. Lauter, C. S. & Rupprecht (Eds.), *Feminist archetypal theory: Interdisciplinary re-visions of jungian thought* (p. 3-22). Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press.

McCormick, A., & McCormick, M. (1997). *Horse sense and the human heart: What horses can teach us about trust, bonding, creativity and spirituality.* Dearfield Beach, FL: Health Communications.

Midkiff, M. (2001). *She flies without wings: How horses touch a woman's soul.* New York, NY: Random House.

Miller-Karas, E. (2015). *Building resilience to trauma: The trauma and community resilience models.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Moore, D. (2015). *The developing genome: An introduction to behavioral epigenetics.* New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Muller-Paisner,V., & Bradshaw, G. A. (2010). Freud and the family horse: Exploration into equine psychotherapy. *Spring: A Journal of Archetype and Culture*, 83, 212-235. Retrieved from www.springjournalandbooks.com

Panksepp, J. (1998). *Affective neuroscience: The foundations of human and animal emotions.* New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Panksepp, J. (2014, January 13). The science of emotions [video file]. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=65e2qScV_K8

Perry, B., & Szalavitz, M. (2006). *The boy who was raised as a dog: And other stories from a child psychiatrist's notebook.* New York, NY: Basic Books

Pierson, M. (2000). *Dark horses and black beauties: Animals, women, a passion.* New York, NY: Norton.

Porges, S., & Geller, S. (2014). Therapeutic presence: Neurophysiological mechanisms mediating feeling safe in therapeutic relationships. *Journal of Psychotherapy Integration, 24*/3, 178-152. doi:10.1037/a0037511

Prescott College. (2017). Equine assisted mental health pages [website content]. Retrieved from https://www.prescott.edu/academics/concentrations/equine-assisted mental-health

Professional Association of Therapeutic Horsemanship, International. (2017a). Home page [website content]. Retrieved from https://www.pathintl.org/

Professional Association of Therapeutic Horsemanship, International. (2017b). About pages [website content]. https://www.pathintl.org/about-path-intl

Professional Association of Therapeutic Horsemanship, International. (2017c) Higher education membership page [website content]. Retrieved from https://www.pathintl.org/path-intl-membership/higher-education-membership

Reis, P. (2010). Where the wild things are: Dreaming the bioregion. *Spring: A Journal of Archetype and Culture*, 83, pp. 98-117.

Rogers State University. (2017). Equestrian center equine therapy program. [website content]. Retrieved from http://www.rsu.edu/rsu-launches-equestrian-center-bit-by-bit-fundraising-campaign/

Ronnberg, A., & Martin, K. (2010). Domestic animals: Horse. In. A. Ronnberg & K. Martin (Eds.), *The book of symbols: Reflection on archetypal images* (pp. 312-315). The Archive for Research in Archetypal Symbolism. Cologne, Germany: Taschen

Rowland, S. (2002). *Jung: A feminist revision.* Malden, MA: Blackwell.

Rowland, S. (2012). *The ecocritical psyche: Literature, evolutionary complexity and Jung.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Rowland, S. (2017). Feminism, Jung and transdisciplinarity: A novel approach. In L. Gardner, & F. Gray (Eds.), *Feminist views from somewhere:Post-Jungian themes in feminist theory* (pp. 83-98). New York, NY: Routledge.

Russack, N. (2002). *Animal guides:In life, myth and dreams.*(pp. 136-150). Toronto, ON, Canada: Inner City Books.

Saint Mary of the Woods College. (2017). Equine assisted therapy page [website content]. Retrieved from http://www.smwc.edu/academic/social-and-behavioral-sciences/equine-assisted-therapy

Samuels, A. (1985). *Jung and the post-jungians* (pp. 173-206). Boston, MA: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Samuels, A. (1990). Beyond feminine principle. In K. Barnaby & P. D'Acierno (Eds.), *C.G. Jung and the humanities* (pp. 294-305). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Samuels, A., Shorter, B., & Plaut, F. (1993). *A critical dictionary of Jungian analysis.* New York, NY: Routledge. (Original work published in 1986)

Shambo, L. (2012). *Partners in healing: Highly social mammals.* Healin Book Excerpts. Retrieved from http://www.humanequinealliance.com

Siegel, D. (2007). *The mindful brain. Reflection and attunement in the cultivation of well-being.* New York: W.W. Norton.

Smythe, W., & Baydala, A. (2012). The hermeneutic background of C. G. Jung. *Journal of Analytical Psychology, 57,* 57-75. doi: 10.1111/j.1468-5922.2011. 01951.x

Squire, C. (2008). Experience-centred and culturally-oriented approaches to narrative. In M. Andrews, C. Squire, & M. Tamboukou (Eds), *Doing narrative research* (pp.41-63). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Stein, J. A. (2009). *The matter of sex and gender: A dialogue between trans bodies and feminist theory.* (Masters thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (305141364)

Stevens, A. (2012). *Archetype revisited: An updated natural history of the self.* New York, NY: Routledge. (Original work published 2002)

Stewart, L. (2014, May 16). *Competencies in animal assisted therapy in counseling: a qualitative investigation of the knowledge, skills and attitudes required of competent animal assisted therapy practitioners.* Dissertation, Georgia State University. Retrieved from http://scholarworks.gsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1107&context=cps_diss

Stewart, L. A., Chang, C. Y., Parker, L. K., & Grubbs, N. (2016). *Animal-assisted therapy in counseling competencies.* Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association, Animal-Assisted Therapy in Mental Health Interest Network. Retrieved from https://www.counseling.org/

Tacey, D. (2010). Ecopsychology and the sacred: Dreaming the bioregion. *Spring: A Journal of Archetype and Culture*, 83, 329 -351.

University of Denver. (2017). Equine-Assisted mental health practitioner certificate page [website content]. Retrieved from http://portfolio.du.edu/equineassistedmentalhealth

University of Montana Western. (2017). Equine studies [website content]. Retrieved from https://www.umwestern.edu/academics/equine-studies.html

van den Hout, M., & Englehard, I. (2012). How does emdr work? *Journal of Experimental Psychopathology*, *3*, 724-738. doi:10.5127/jep.028212

Van der Kolk, B. (2014). *The body keeps the score: Brain, mind, and body in the healing of trauma.* New York,NY: Penguin Books.

Vidrine, M. (2001). EFMHA standards committee. *EFMHA: A Special Interest Section of the North American Riding for the Handicapped Association, 5*/3, 1-2.

Von Franz, M. (1993). *The feminine in fairytales.* Boston, MA: Shambhala.

Von Franz, M. (2002). *Animus and anima in fairy tales.* Toronto, ON, Canada: Inner City Books.

Wehr, D. (1987). *Jung and feminism: Liberating archetypes.* Boston, MA:Beacon Press.

Wertz, F., Charmaz, K., McMullen, L. M., Josselson, R., Anderson, R, McSpadden, E. (2011). *Five ways of doing qualitative analysis.* New York, NY: The Guilford Press.

Wertz, F. (2011). A phenomenological psychological approach to trauma and resilience. In F. Wertz, K. Charmaz, L. M. McMullen, R. Josselson, R. Anderson, & E. McSpadden (Eds.), *Five ways of doing qualitative analysis* (pp, 124-164). New York, NY: The Guilford Press.

Wheeler, W. (2006). *The whole creature*: *Complexity, biosemiotics and the evolution of culture.* London, England: Lawrence & Wishart.

Widdershoven, G. (2001). Dialogue in evaluation: A hermeneutic perspective. *Sage Journals, 7*(2), 253-263. doi:10.1177/13563890122209676

Wilson College. (n.d.) Equine facilitated therapeutics. [website content]. Retrieved from https://www3.wilson.edu/equine-facilitated-therapeutics?wssl=1

Woodman, M. (1990). *The ravaged bridegroom:Masculinity in women.*Toronto, Canada: Inner City Books.

Young-Eisendrath, P. (1997). *Gender and desire: Uncursing pandora.* College Station, TX: Texas A&M University press.

Zabriskie, B. (1990). The feminine. In K. Barnaby & P. D'Acierno (Eds.) *C. G. Jung and the humanities* (p. 267-291). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

APPENDIX

Table 1A

Narrative Research – Theming Chart

Themes Identified in Research Participants' Life Story

Within Three Organizing Domains.

Themes		**Chex**	**Dorothy**	**Hillary**	**Niki**	**Researcher**
MASTERY						
Caregiving		X	X	X	X	X
Self *(physical & emotional)*		X	X		X	X
Horse		X	X	X	X	X
Calming		X	X	X	X	X
Life Lessons and Learning		X	X	X	X	X
Self Care		X				
Acceptance & Tolerance		X	X	X	X	X
GROUNDING						
Relationship		X	X	X	X	X
Self		X		X	X	X
Horse		X	X	X	X	X
Community			X	X	X	X
Nature		X	X	X	X	X
Attunement		X			X	X
Patience			X	X	X	X
					X	

Relating/Connecting		X		X		X
Consistency		X	X	X		X
Loss			X	X		X
Emotional and Sensory Awareness		X	X	X	X	X
Presence		X	X	X	X	X
Embodied						X
Mystery		X	X	X	X	X
Tension of opposed instincts						
AGENCY						
Vocation		X		X	X	X
Professional				X	X	X
Volunteerism		X	X		X	X
Philanthropy			X			
Purpose and accomplishments		X	X	X	X	X
Farm Ownership		X	X	X	X	X
Commitment		X	X	X	X	X
Peak Experiences		X	X	X		X